



REPORT TO

REGULAR BOARD

APPLICATION OF GYMNASIUM ADDITION MATRIX – PHASE 1 (ALL WARDS)

*"I can do all things through Him who strengthens me."
Philippians 4:13 (NRSVCE)*

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
April 3, 2018	April 19 2018	

M. Iafrate, Senior Coordinator, Renewal
D. Friesen, Senior Coordinator, Capital Development
M. Farrell, Coordinator, Materials Management
P. de Cock, Comptroller, Business Services
F. Cifelli, D. Yack, J. Shanahan, J. Wujek, K. Malcolm, M. Caccamo, P. Aguiar, S. Campbell
Superintendents of Learning, Student Achievement and Well-Being

RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community uniting home, parish and school and rooted in the love of Christ.

We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.



Rory McGuckin
Director of Education

D. Koenig
Associate Director
of Academic Affairs

M. Puccetti
(Acting) Associate Director
of Planning and Facilities

L. Noronha
Executive Superintendent
of Business Services and
Chief Financial Officer

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Board approved gymnasium matrix includes criteria that provides a higher ranking for projects that attract full or partial “external” funding. This report recommends revisions to the priority ranking for elementary school gymnasium additions, to give priority to schools recently approved for a childcare addition. There is an opportunity to leverage savings by retrofitting the existing gymnasium and change rooms for the new childcare facilities, and using the balance of childcare funding, along with Proceeds of Disposition (POD), to fund the construction of a new gymnasium addition. This strategy requires the Ministry of Education approval.

The Ministry of Education has indicated that it would be willing to support an exemption under *O.Reg. 193/10*, to allow the TCDSB to use POD to expand gymnasiums at the following sites where childcare additions have been approved: Father Serra (Ward 1), St Bernard (Ward 3), St Kevin (Ward 7) and St Margaret (Ward 5) Elementary Schools, as per the letter dated March 29, 2018 from the Ministry of Education to the Chair, referenced in **Appendix A**.

This report further recommends that the Board proceed to build gymnasium additions at the four schools noted above, as approved by the Ministry. Furthermore, this report recommends that the Board seek Ministry approval to undertake other gymnasium additions that have been approved for childcare additions as listed in **Appendix B**, to be funded from both POD and the balance resulting from childcare retrofits.

The cumulative staff time required to prepare this report was 25 hours.

B. PURPOSE

1. The Board approved a set of criteria and points to prioritize the top elementary and secondary schools for gymnasium additions, June 2017. This report recommends revisiting the rankings to take into consideration potential cost savings associated with the recently approved funding for childcare additions, and redirecting those savings, with Ministry approval to fund a larger gym addition.

C. BACKGROUND

On June 8, 2017 the Board approved a criteria matrix to prioritize schools as noted below:

	Criteria	Points
	Combined stage & gymnasium s.f. area as compared to EDU Space Benchmark based on OTG.	Yes/No
1	External funding opportunities to fully or partially fund gymnasium addition (minimum 50%)* Note: Original score of 30 adjusted to reflect partial funding leverage form childcare additions	15
2	Combined stage & gymnasium s.f. area/by OTG	10
3	Facility Condition Index of School (FCI)	10
4	LTAP recommends a major addition or replacement school	10
5	Space deficiency of exterior play space based on 175 s.f./pupil	5
6	Current school utilization rate	4
7	School utilization rate by 2026	4
8	Access to other play or physical activity space in building	3
9	Barrier-free access to existing gymnasium, from within the building and from the site/exterior.	3
10	Site Size	2

*Note: The point value for the *External Funding Criteria* proportionally adjusted to reflect partial funding opportunities.

1. On November 9, 2017, the Board approved the application of the matrix, and ranked all TCDSB schools, identifying the top twenty (20) elementary schools as well as top ten (10) secondary school, in addition to ranking the top schools by Trustee Ward. As noted in the November 2017 report to Corporate Services, Strategic Planning and Property Committee, 107 TCDSB elementary schools have combined stage and gymnasium area below 3000 square feet (sq. ft.).

2. On January 24, 2018, the Chair of the Board sent a letter to the Ministry of Education seeking funding for a multi-year phased gymnasium addition program. The Minister of Education sent a response letter to the Chair on March 29, 2018, (**Appendix A**), stating that she would be “prepared to grant an exemption under *O. Reg 193/10* to allow the TCDSB to use POD to expand Gymnasiums at the following sites where childcare additions have been approved, subject to a proper assessment of specific requests.”
3. **Appendix B** provides a list of all schools approved for childcare additions. The schools are listed by priority ranking, indicating schools with the smallest gymnasiums at the top of the list.
4. The estimated cost of building a gymnasium addition ranges from \$1.5 M. to \$2.5 M, depending on specific site and building conditions. Approximately \$500,000 to \$750,000 of “external” funding could be realized from retrofitting existing space for the childcare rather than building an addition. The balance of childcare funding could be used towards partially funding the gymnasium addition.
5. Site Plan Approval (SPA) would be required if the gymnasium addition with change-rooms etc., is larger than 600 sq. m. (6458 sq. ft.). In order to minimize disruption to the school, the gymnasium addition would be built first and then the childcare retrofit could take place. The estimated project timeline is three years, subject to approvals and the SPA process.
6. The Board received approval of funding for three (3) childcare additions in January 2017 (currently in preliminary design) and for thirteen (13) additions in December 2017 (preparation of RFP for consultants underway). A three-room childcare was approved for St Margaret Elementary School in March 2018 as part of the Capital Priorities funding announcement. Refer to **Appendix C** for the list of approved childcare additions schools and funding amounts.

D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS

Cost and Space Benefit Analysis of this approach:

1. There are cost-savings and other benefits from combining various construction projects together under one scope. A similar approach was undertaken recently for four capital projects; St Paschal Baylon, St Clement,

St Augustine of Canterbury and St Eugene Elementary Schools – where a larger gym addition was incorporated with a multiple-classroom addition project. POD funded two of these projects. The savings in mobilization and overhead costs are estimated at about 2% of the construction cost. This would represent a potential estimated saving of \$350,000 to \$400,000 for the four gymnasium addition/childcare retrofit projects noted in the report, subject to final construction costs.

2. The projects at St. Augustine and St. Clement, currently under construction, include retrofits of existing school space for childcare centres that were funded originally as additions. The Ministry approved using the balance of the childcare funding to add new classroom spaces as part of the gymnasium additions. This was done to optimize the use of the site and flow of space within the school.
3. In the case of schools located on small sites, the construction of a one-storey childcare addition would significantly affect future expansion of the building, (future gymnasium addition) and reduce outdoor play space.
4. School renewal upgrades, including site improvement work, should be considered in addition to undertaking the childcare retrofit and gymnasium addition. This could leverage further cost-savings by grouping work under one general contract. In addition, if applicable, an elevator could also be included as part of the gymnasium addition work. The total project cost would be determined by the amount of addition renewal work, the inclusion of an elevator as well as other potential space re-location or re-configuration work. New change rooms as well as a barrier-free washroom are assumed to be part of the new gymnasium addition.

E. METRICS AND ACCOUNTABILITY

1. As per the Ministry's letter of March 29, a business case, with costs estimate, would be submitted to the Ministry for approval for the four approved project, "to indicate how any gymnasium-related investment of POD would demonstrate merit over general school renewal needs".
2. **Appendix B** provides a list ranking the schools prioritized for gymnasium additions that have been approved for childcare additions. It is recommended

that other projects that are prioritized on the list be submitted to the Ministry for funding approval.

3. The total estimated project cost for a childcare retrofit and gymnasium addition, with elevator and ancillary renewal work would be between \$3.0 M and \$5.0. M.
4. A subsequent report detailing the estimated project costs for the four (4) top ranked schools will be provided to the Board, with a request to proceed using a combination of childcare funding surplus and POD. The total *maximum* estimated project budget required to undertake the four projects identified in the Ministry's letter is \$20 M., with \$6.7 M to be provided from the existing approved childcare allocation, subject to further design development and costing information.
5. The City of Toronto Children and Youth Services would also need to review and approve the revised timeline – as this could potentially add another year to the completion of the childcares.
6. The quarterly financial update report will provide updates regarding Proceeds of Disposition revenue and expenditure. The next update will be presented to June 2018 Corporate Services Strategic Planning and Property Committee.

F. IMPLEMENTATION, STRATEGIC COMMUNICATIONS AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN

1. Preliminary design, scopes of work and cost estimates will be developed for the projects identified in Appendix B, and submitted to the Board for approval.
2. Upon receiving Board approval, a letter will be submitted to the Ministry of Education requesting approval to proceed using both POD and childcare funding for other projects.
3. Principals of the approved schools will receive a letter for distribution to their respective school community, indicating the Board's intention to seek funding approval from the Ministry.
4. The City's Children and Youth Services division will receive information and updates, and will be consulted in the design of the childcare retrofit work.
5. Upon receiving Ministry of Education approval to proceed, a *Request for Proposal* (RFP) will be issued to engage architectural firms to undertake the design and tender documents for the childcare retrofit/gymnasium addition and school renewal upgrades.

6. As per Board policy, consultation with each school's Local Design Committee (LDC) will take place during the design development phase of the project.
7. Monthly project status letters will be provided to the school principal for distribution to the school community throughout the project approval and construction phases. This information will also be posted on the Board's web site.
8. An Open House informing neighbours of the project is part of the Site Plan Approval process. The school community may also wish to hold other Open House sessions for the neighbourhood and engage other stakeholders.
9. As per the Board's policy, a Good Neighbour letter will be issued to advise adjacent property owners of the start of construction.

G. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

1. That the Board approve proceeding with the four top-ranked schools for gymnasium additions as detailed in the Ministry of Education letter, to be funded from Proceeds of Disposition and savings from the childcare retrofits.
2. That the Board submit a request to the Ministry of Education for other gymnasium addition projects, funded from Proceeds of Disposition and the balance of childcare funding, for other schools identified Appendix B.