



REPORT TO

CORPORATE AFFAIRS, STRATEGIC PLANNING AND PROPERTY COMMITTEE

ST. FIDELIS TEMPORARY ACCOMMODATION STRATEGY

*“For I know the plans I have for you,” declares the LORD, ‘plans to prosper you and not to harm you, plans to give you hope and a future.’”
Jeremiah 29:11 (NIV)*

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
May 6, 2015	May 14, 2015	Click here to enter a date.

J. Volek, Senior Coordinator, Planning Services

RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community rooted in the love of Christ. We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge and to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.



G. Poole
Associate Director of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio
Associate Director of Planning and
Facilities

Angela Gauthier
Director of Education

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report presents the lease of Nelson A. Boylen from the Toronto District School Board (TDSB) as the only practical and effective option for the temporary accommodation of St. Fidelis students during the planning and construction of a St. Fidelis replacement facility. A thorough and comprehensive process of consultation with the St. Fidelis school community (St. Fidelis staff, CSAC and Building Sub-Committee) shows that it supports the staff recommendation to enter into a temporary lease agreement with the TDSB for the use of Nelson A. Boylen for the temporary accommodation of the St. Fidelis student population, effective September of 2016.

B. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to consider all available options and recommend a temporary accommodation solution for St. Fidelis, taking into consideration all feedback received from the school and parent community.

C. BACKGROUND

1. St. Fidelis was identified as the Board's number four Capital Priority Needs project for the 2013-14 school year. On December 10, 2013, the Board submitted a detailed business case to the Ministry of Education seeking funding for a replacement facility for St. Fidelis.
2. On April 30, 2014, the Board received funding approval from the Ministry of Education for a 648 pupil place replacement elementary school for St. Fidelis.
3. The Board is experiencing significant enrolment pressures at St. Fidelis. The student population significantly exceeds the OTG capacity of 381 pupil places, with a utilization rate of 156% and 6 portables on site. The current enrolment of 598 students is projected to grow and exceed 600 students by 2015, and stabilize at approximately 615 students longer term. Early indications are that St. Fidelis will exceed its Board approved 2015 projection by 12 students.

			Projected Enrolment by Year					
OTG Capacity	Port	Current Enrol	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2024
381	6	598	603	609	608	606	602	615
% Utilization:			158%	160%	160%	159%	158%	161%

4. The 3.41 acre St. Fidelis school site cannot easily accommodate additional portables without significantly reducing the amount of outdoor play space for the students—exacerbating an already crowded and dangerous situation. Additional portables at St. Fidelis would require paving-over parts of the playfield at a cost of approximately \$8,000 of asphalt work per portable, and would negatively impact upon site drainage.
5. As there are insufficient teaching spaces at St. Fidelis to meet projected enrolment needs in the short-term, students would require an off-site relocation strategy during the construction period.

D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS

6. Several temporary accommodation options were considered by staff:
 - The use of the recently vacated St. Philip Neri and St. Gerard Majella facilities,
 - The use of the former St. Veronica facility,
 - The use of TDSB’s Nelson A. Boylen, and
 - A real estate search of other suitable commercial or institutional properties in the general area.

After considering all options, it was determined by staff that the only practical and cost-effective option to address the temporary accommodation needs of the school community during the construction of a new school is the lease of TDSB’s Nelson A. Boylen starting in the 2016-17 school year.

7. If all students remain at St. Fidelis for the 2015-16 school year, the school will not be able to clear its growing waitlist. As noted in comment #4 above, the placement of more than 1 additional portable will require the reconfiguration of the existing 6 portables, and this would entail significant land preparation costs. Funding could come from Temporary Accommodation Grants (TAG), pending Ministry of Education approval.

8. *Appendix 'A'* provides a January 2015 presentation to the St. Fidelis CSAC and Building Sub-Committee by Planning and Facilities staff on the various temporary accommodation options considered to date. This presentation includes the pros and cons of each option, as well as maps and construction timelines.
9. Located at 155 Falstaff Avenue, Nelson A. Boylen, is an operating school which no longer provides regular programming, but does offer programming to approximately 16-20 Developmentally Delayed (DD) students. The TDSB will be phasing-out the DD program at the end of the 2015-16 school year. The facility is located on an 11 acre site adjacent to a park, and has an OTG capacity of 531 pupil places. Nelson A. Boylen is located only 1 km from the existing St. Fidelis site and is central to the St. Fidelis core student population. This presents a very rare opportunity to temporarily relocate students in such close geographic proximity to their home addresses.
10. If St. Fidelis were to accommodate its Grade 5 to 8 students off-site at Nelson A. Boylen during the 2015-16 school year, students would have exclusive use of 15 classrooms, a drama room and library, administration and guidance offices, a ground floor staff room, and second floor washrooms for students and staff. The gymnasium, cafeteria/stage, swimming pool, ground floor staff washrooms, and the east parking lot would be shared with TDSB. With relocating the rest of the student population (Kindergarten to Grade 4) for September 2016, TCDSB would have exclusive use of the entire facility. This would include an additional 7 classrooms, a music room, a family studies room, a computer lab, an industrial arts room, administration offices, and storage rooms.
11. At the current time, the 3-year lease proposal provided by the TDSB does not include the spaces that will be occupied by the 16-20 TDSB DD students in September of 2015. Staff are currently in conversations with the TDSB in order to update the lease terms to reflect TCDSB exclusive use of the entire Nelson A. Boylen facility for September of 2016.
12. The advantages of leasing Nelson A. Boylen as a temporary accommodation solution for St. Fidelis are identified below:
 - The temporary relocation of grade 5 to 8 students to Nelson A. Boylen for September 2015 would relieve immediate enrolment pressures at

St. Fidelis, allow for the removal of some, or all, of the portables, and free-up badly needed outdoor play space for the students.

- If the long-term solution is to rebuild on the existing St. Fidelis site, construction of a replacement facility will require the off-site relocation of students during the construction process. Subject to a lease extension from TDSB, Nelson A. Boylen could accommodate all St. Fidelis students during the construction of a new elementary school.
 - Nelson A. Boylen offers student access to specialty instructional spaces which the Board is unable to offer in traditional elementary schools, including a swimming pool, large gymnasium, drama room, cafetorium, and regulation soccer field.
 - The school resides on an 11 acre site adjacent to a park, and offers significant design flexibility for a capital solution.
13. Nelson A. Boylen is a secondary school with facilities sized and placed for secondary students. Renovation on the ground floor of the existing school would be required for final accommodation of primary classes, particularly the kindergarten classrooms.
 14. Nelson A. Boylen is also being considered as a possible permanent accommodation option for St. Fidelis, pending the outcome of a Consultant feasibility study of the St. Fidelis site. The results of the feasibility study may be available for scrutiny as early as June of 2015.
 15. A comprehensive and thorough consultation process with the school community began in January of 2015. Board staff formally presented on all temporary accommodation options before St. Fidelis staff, the St. Fidelis CSAC, and the St. Fidelis Building Sub-Committee. Consultation with the parent community continued by way of CSAC meetings, committee and community meetings, and through correspondence.
 16. On March 24, 2015, a joint St. Fidelis CSAC and Building Sub-Committee meeting was held to review all the comments and feedback received from the parent community throughout the consultation process and to arrive at a final recommendation. The following motion was approved:

“The St. Fidelis CSAC recommend to Principal Caccamo, to TCDSB staff and to the TCDSB Board of Trustees:

- (i) the transfer of St. Fidelis Grades 5, 6, 7 and 8 students to Nelson A. Boylen for September 2015 in order to alleviate the safety and programming challenges due to oversubscription and enrolment pressures; and*
- (ii) the transfer of the entire St. Fidelis student body to Nelson A. Boylen for September 2016, should a new school be built on the current St. Fidelis site.*

There was also general consensus that further consultation with the parent community should take place if the TCDSB Board of Trustees considers action/direction that differs from any of the options currently presented to the parent community by Board staff.”

17. The St. Fidelis CSAC and Building Sub-Committee had based its recommendations on the following rationale:

- Nelson A. Boylen is located in close geographic proximity to the existing St. Fidelis facility and is central to the core population of St. Fidelis students.
- Nelson A. Boylen will have under 20 students in September 2015, and will be vacant by September 2016.
- Nelson A. Boylen is only 1 km away from St. Fidelis.
- Nelson A. Boylen is available for immediate lease.
- There may not be a need for extra bussing to Nelson A. Boylen if the Board were to consider walking and cycling initiatives and/or adjustments to bell times.
- Moving the grade 5 to 8 students allows for the elimination of most, if not all, of the portables from the Fidelis site, thus allowing for a larger and safer play area for the primary and junior students in 2015.
- Allows for the right-sizing of classes at both sites.
- Allows for dedicated music classes at both sites.
- Allows for more dedicated gym time at both sites.
- Allows for more available space for liturgies, other Catholic celebrations, and for special events at both sites.

- Allows the school to accommodate all student registrations for September 2015. Currently, families that live within the St. Fidelis boundary may be turned away due to lack of space.

Risks

18. If the Board chooses not to accommodate a portion of St. Fidelis students off-site in September of 2015, there is a risk of student loss to the TDSB or other coterminous Boards. Currently, St. Fidelis is turning away students who fall within the St. Fidelis fixed attendance boundary due to space constraints.
19. Nelson A. Boylen presents itself as an extremely rare opportunity to lease an 11 acre site with a facility in excellent state of repair. This opportunity is even more unique in that Nelson A. Boylen is located central to the core population of St. Fidelis.

Assessment of Costs

20. The cumulative incremental costs associated with the temporary accommodation options evaluated by staff are identified in the tables below. Refer to *Appendix 'B'* for complete costing details of the various temporary accommodation options.

3-Year Incremental Costs Assuming Temporary Accommodation Begins in 2015-16.

Temporary Accommodation Options	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18
St. Fidelis (JK-4 in 2015-16 only)	\$375,094	\$375,094	\$375,094
St. Philip Neri (5-8)	\$423,276		
St. Gerard Majella (5-8)	\$355,195		
St. Gerard Majella (JK-4) and St. Philip Neri (5-8)		\$888,725	\$1,345,624

St. Veronica	\$586,767	\$1,116,312	\$1,414,357
Nelson A. Boylen	\$900,296	\$2,189,243	\$3,248,914
Nelson A. Boylen with TAG funding	\$616,963	\$1,188,555	\$1,504,747

Note: St. Fidelis grades 5-8 proposed to be relocated off-site in 2015-16

2-Year Incremental Costs Assuming Temporary Accommodation Begins in 2016-17.

Temporary Accommodation Options	2016-17	2017-18
St. Gerard Majella (JK-4) and St. Philip Neri (5-8)	\$477,899	\$934,798
St. Veronica	\$538,545	\$836,590
Nelson A. Boylen	\$1,299,047	\$2,358,718
Nelson A. Boylen with TAG funding	\$581,692	\$897,884

21. Due to current budget constraints, Staff recommend that all students remain on-site at St. Fidelis for the 2015-16 school year.
22. Funding for the estimated \$2.36M 2-year incremental cost to temporarily accommodate St. Fidelis students at Nelson A. Boylen for the 2016-17 school year can be made available through the following funding envelopes:
 - \$592,356 from Operations to cover caretaking, maintenance, utilities, IT/Telephony and moving costs;
 - \$250,000 from Renewal to cover FDK renovation costs;
 - \$1,460,834 from Temporary Accommodation Grant (TAG) to cover TDSB base rent costs (pending Ministry approval);
 - \$55,528 from Transportation to cover additional bussing requirements.

E. RECOMMENDATION

That the Director of Education be authorized to negotiate a lease of Nelson A. Boylen effective for September 2016.