



REPORT TO

CORPORATE SERVICES, STRATEGIC PLANNING AND PROPERTY COMMITTEE

HOLY ANGELS CATHOLIC SCHOOL CAPITAL PROJECT CONSULTANT APPOINTMENT AND BUDGET APPROVAL (WARD 4)

*“I can do all things through Him who strengthens me.”
Philippians 4:13 (NRSVCE)*

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
December 4, 2018	December 12, 2018	

- M. Zlomislac, (Acting) Senior Coordinator, Capital Development
- M. Farrell, Coordinator, Materials Management
- P. de Cock, Comptroller, Business Services
- P. Keyes, Superintendent of Learning, Student Achievement and Well-Being
- D. Friesen, (Acting) Executive Superintendent of Facilities Services

RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community uniting home, parish and school and rooted in the love of Christ.

We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.

Rory McGuckin
Director of Education

D. Koenig
Associate Director
of Academic Affairs

T. Robins
Acting Associate Director
of Planning and Facilities

L. Noronha
Executive Superintendent
of Business Services and
Chief Financial Officer



A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report recommends that a contract be awarded to CS&P Architects Inc. to provide consulting services for the new elementary school to be constructed on the site of the existing Holy Angels Catholic School, at a total fees and expenses of **\$993,506.00** (including net HST), funded as detailed in Table 1, and subject to Ministry of Education approval of the Space Plan Template.

This report also recommends approval of a project budget of **\$17,358,410.00**, as detailed in Table 1, as per Ministry approved Capital Priorities, FDK and Child Care funding and including eligible funding from Educational Development Charges; and approval of a further **\$461,250.00** budget for unique site costs, subject to Ministry of Education approval of additional funding, for a total project budget of **\$17,819,660.00**.

Following approval of the consultant appointment and within four (4) weeks of the project start-up meeting, a school community meeting will be scheduled to introduce the architect, who will conduct a project 'Visioning Session'. This will be an opportunity for the school community and Trustee to provide preliminary input that may be incorporated into the design of the new school.

The new school will have an On-the-Ground (OTG) capacity of 600 pupil places and a child care centre for 88 children.

The cumulative staff time required to prepare this report was 21 hours.

B. PURPOSE

1. On September 17, 2015, the Board approved in part the following:
That the Director of Education submit a detailed budget for Board approval for each Capital project prior to tendering.
2. The Board's Purchasing Policy requires that contracts for new schools and major additions be approved by the Board of Trustees.

C. BACKGROUND

1. On March 13, 2018, the Ministry of Education (EDU) approved Capital Priorities funding in the amount of \$15,225,086.00 for the construction of a

600-pupil-place replacement elementary school and five-room child care centre at the site of Holy Angels Catholic School (Refer to Appendix A).

2. Education Development Charges revenue for demolition and site preparation is available for this site. The EDU funding letter notes that the Ministry has additional funding available to address other costs that are not included in the Ministry Capital funding benchmark, such as extraordinary municipal requirements. Additional funding will be requested for these unique site costs following development and costing of a preliminary design.
3. The site of Holy Angels Catholic School has been expanded by two land purchases south of the existing site. The first, smaller site, was a residential property, which the Board has taken over and currently is occupied by portables. The second parcel is occupied by the Kerr's Candy factory. The factory is still operating, however, the tenant has been given notice to vacate the premises by **June 30, 2020**, following which the building will be demolished.
4. On November 13, 2018, the Space Plan Template (SPT) was submitted for approved to EDU for the new 600-pupil-place school and 88-space child care. Approval of the SPT is required prior to retaining the architect for the project.
5. A "Stage 1" *Request for Qualifications* was issued on January 26, 2017, to all interested architects in Ontario, through the *Biddingo* bidding service, in order to prequalify architects for upcoming Capital projects in four categories as follows:
 - (i) *Secondary replacement schools and major additions to \$40M;*
 - (ii) *Elementary replacement schools and major additions to \$16M;*
 - (iii) *Child care additions to \$5M;*
 - (iv) *School and child care retrofits to \$2M.*
6. Submissions were received from 24 architectural firms for Category 2: *Elementary replacement schools and major additions to \$16M*. Following evaluation by a committee of Board Capital staff, 11 firms were prequalified for this category of projects, based on the following criteria stipulated in the RFQ:

Evaluation Criteria Schedule	Points Available
A) Firm Profile 25 points	
1. Firm stability: Years in business, number of staff	5
2. Overall experience: Appropriate project types and scale	10
3. Qualifications of Key Staff	10
B) Project Experience 35 points	
1. Number of Similar Projects	5
2. Recent Completed Example(s)	5
3. Suitable Project Sizes	5
4. Demonstrated Cost Control	5
5. Demonstrated Energy/Greenhouse Gas Reduction	5
6. Design Quality – Aesthetics and Functionality	5
7. References	5
C) Project Approach (Question Responses) 40 points	
1. Design Approach	8
2. Energy/Greenhouse Gas Reduction Approach	8
3. Cost Control Approach	8
4. Municipal Approvals Approach	8
5. Contract Administration/Construction Field Review Approach	8
Total	100

D. ACTION PLAN

1. “Stage 2” RFP P-019-19 was issued on October 26, 2018 to the 11 firms prequalified for elementary schools, for full consulting services for the demolition, design and construction of Holy Angels Catholic Replacement School.
2. On November 13, 2018, six (6) proposals were received from architectural firms in response to RFP P-019-19. A list of the respondents and their sub-consultant teams is included as Appendix B. The proposals were evaluated by a committee from the Board’s Capital staff according to the following criteria stipulated in the RFP:

	Evaluation Criteria	Total Points
A	Score from Stage 1 Prequalification prorated to 25%	25
B	Qualifications of proposed sub-consultant team	15
C	Understanding of Scope of Work – Completeness of Work Plan Deliverables	15
D	Suitability of Proponent Team's proposed consultant / sub-consultant services and timelines as outlined in the Work Plan	15
E	Proposed Fixed Fee	30
	Sub-total to Determine Shortlist for Interviews	100
F	Interview and Separate Price (Shortlisted Proponents)	25
	Grand Total	125

3. The first part of the evaluation utilized criteria A-E to determine a short list of the highest scoring firms to be further evaluated in an interview, which took place on November 27, 2018. The top three firms interviewed were:
 - CS&P Architects Inc.
 - LGA Architectural Partners
 - Snyder Architects Inc.

4. Staff recommend that a full services consulting contract be awarded to CS&P Architects Inc., based on the highest scoring combination of interview and pre-interview scoring.

E. METRICS AND ACCOUNTABILITY

1. The site of Holy Angels Catholic School is eligible for Educational Development Charges (EDC) to cover the cost of site preparation. The preliminary project budget is outlined in Table 1 below :

Table 1: Holy Angels Replacement School - Project Budget					
	OTG	600	<i>(All costs include net HST)</i>		Dec. 12, 2018
	Funding Breakdown				Total Estimated Costs
	In Benchmark		Not in Benchmark		
	Capital Priorities + FDK	Child Care (B11)	Site Prep/ Demolition (EDC)	TGS/ Unique Site Costs	
A. Total Pre-Design			\$16,264		\$16,264
B. Total Consultant Fee/Expences	\$726,170	\$99,597	\$167,739	\$0	\$993,506
C. Total Municipal Fees	\$176,170	\$24,885	\$83,843	\$0	\$284,898
D. Total TCDSB Allowances	\$296,754	\$125,713	\$6,977	\$4,500	\$433,944
E. Total Construction Budget	\$10,909,891	\$2,205,022	\$1,770,000	\$435,000	\$15,319,913
F. Contingency Allowance (5% construction)	\$544,831	\$116,054	\$88,500	\$21,750	\$771,135
TOTAL PROJECT COST	\$12,653,816	\$2,571,270	\$2,133,324	\$461,250	\$17,819,660
APPROVED FUNDING	\$12,653,816	\$2,571,270	\$2,133,324	TBD	\$17,358,410
Estimated Funding Deficit (Request for Unique Site Costs and EDC funding)			\$0	(\$461,250)	(\$461,250)

2. EDU has in the past provided additional funding to address unique site costs upon submission of a detailed estimate of these costs. This request for additional funding will be submitted to the EDU upon completion of a detailed schematic design costing by a certified Quantity Surveyor.
3. EDU “Approval to Proceed,” based on submission of a pre-tender cost estimate, is required in order to tender the project.
4. Following tendering, the project budget will be revised to reflect the actual tender price and EDU approval and a report submitted for Board approval of the tender award and, if required, a revised project budget.
5. The project budget will be monitored through the Board’s financial systems and audit processes and financial status will be reported to the EDU annually through the Capital Asset Project Template (CAPT) system.

F. IMPLEMENTATION, STRATEGIC COMMUNICATIONS AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN

1. Following approval of the consultant appointment and within four (4) weeks of the project start-up meeting, a school community meeting will be scheduled to introduce the architect, who will conduct a project ‘Visioning Session’. This will be an opportunity for the school community and Trustee to provide preliminary input that may be incorporated into the design of the

new school.

2. The architects will consult during the entire design process with Facilities and Early Learning staff, and the school's Local Design Committee (LDC) comprising the principal, superintendent, trustee, parish priest, teachers and parents, as well as the City of Toronto's child care projects representative (in an advisory role).
3. The **earliest** date for the occupancy of the new school is anticipated to be September 2022. However, time required for Municipal and Ministry approvals and/or delays in construction due to unforeseen conditions could extend the project completion and occupancy beyond this date.
4. Facilities staff will communicate directly with the principal, caretakers, and the area Service Quality Supervisor (SQS) to coordinate construction activities, including project schedule, hours of work, site access, and health and safety issues, and to provide support to the school's principal and superintendent for communication with school communities.
5. Staff will provide status updates to the school community at milestones or when there is new information, which will be posted on the Board website.

G. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

1. That a contract be awarded to CS&P Architects Inc. to provide professional consulting services for the replacement elementary school to be constructed on the site of the existing Holy Angels Catholic School, for a total cost of **\$993,506.00** (including net HST) funded as detailed in Table 1, subject to Ministry of Education approval of the Space Plan Template.
2. That a project budget of **\$17,358,410.00**, as detailed in Table 1, as per Ministry approved Capital Priorities, FDK and Child Care funding and including eligible funding from Educational Development Charges; and approval of a further **\$461,250.00** budget for unique site costs, subject to Ministry of Education approval of additional funding, for a total project budget of **\$17,819,660.00**.