

INTERNATIONAL LANGUAGES ELEMENTARY (ILE) PROGRAM

"All of them were filled with the Holy Spirit and began to speak in other languages, as the Spirit gave them ability." Acts 2:4

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review			
January 7, 2018	January 24, 2019	Click here to enter a date.			
A. Della Mora, Executive Superintendent of Human Resources					
L. Di Marco, Superintendent of Curriculum Leadership & Innovation; Academic ICT					

P. De Cock, Comptroller of Business Services

M. Vanayan, Sr. Coordinator of Educational Research

M. Sequeira, Coordinator of International Languages, Parent Engagement & Community Outreach

RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community uniting home, parish and school and rooted in the love of Christ.

We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.



Rory McGuckin Director of Education

D. Koenig Associate Director of Academic Affairs

L. Noronha Associate Director of Facilities, Business and Community Development, and Chief Financial Officer

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The International Languages Elementary (ILE) Program is currently being offered in forty-four schools, through an integrated delivery model within the school day. These schools previously offered the ILE Program in an extended day model. The integrated model was approved by the Ministry of Education for 2018-2019, to be delivered for 30 minutes, 4 times per week, within the 300-minute instructional day.

This report provides the Board of Trustees and the Ministry of Education with a preliminary assessment of the ILE Program, as offered in forty-four schools, in the current integrated delivery model. This report provides the results of ILE survey that was conducted with parents in the 44 ILE program schools and the results of the ILE survey that was conducted with parents in all other TCDSB Elementary Schools.

The Research Department will also be devising a survey to evaluate the effectiveness of the 2018-2019 ILE Program delivery model with appropriate stakeholders, to be conducted in the spring of 2019. The results of that program effectiveness survey will be shared at the June 2019 Student Achievement meeting.

This report recommends that the Board:

- 1. Seek ongoing permissions to ensure the program can continue to be offered within the 300 minute instructional day.
- 2. Request ongoing support from the Ministry of Education through a commitment to full funding, as it is required in order to ensure the continuation of this valuable program.
- 3. Indicate to the Minister of Education and Ministry staff that they are willing to work collaboratively on issues related to funding and permissions, in order to ensure the continuation of the IL program.

The cumulative staff time required to administer the surveys and prepare this report was 2015 hours.

B. PURPOSE

- 1. This report provides information related to the implementation of the new ILE Program format.
- 2. It provides the results of the ILE survey in all TCDSB Elementary schools, as approved by the Board at the August 23, 2018 Board meeting.
- 3. It meets the Ministry of Education's requirement of an Interim Report.

C. BACKGROUND

- 1. On August 23, 2018, the Board of Trustees approved a survey to be conducted in all TCDSB elementary schools, beginning on November 18th and to be completed by January, 2019, to confirm parents' desire to have International Languages taught during the 300-minute instructional day or in an alternative delivery model.
 - i. The ILE Program taught during the school day would result in IL schools integrating Ministry Curriculum subject areas (Social Studies, Science and Technology, Language, Arts, Math, Religion) due to the 120 minutes per week now dedicated to IL instruction. IL schools would still maintain the prescribed time allotments for curriculum devoted to Mathematics, Daily Physical Activity and French programming.
 - ii. The implementation of any new after school or weekend International Languages program would occur in 2018-2019 depending on available staff and sufficient registrations in a school community.
 - iii. The implementation for any new school for an ILE program to be offered during the day would be contingent on consultation with our teachers' union and upon approval of the Ministry of Education. Upon approval, implementation of these new programs would occur in September 2019.
- 2. On August 31, 2018 the Minister of Education approved TCDSB's request to offer a one-year transitional ILE course of study within the 300instructional day in the 2018-2019 school year, in all forty-four ILE schools. This approval was contingent on the board meeting the following conditions:

- i. Monitor implementation to ensure that curriculum expectations would continue to be met in all subject areas;
- ii. Consider and adhere to the Board's legal obligations under any legislation and/or any collective agreements, when operationalizing the course of study; and
- iii. Recognize that Ministry funding of up to \$3.6 million was provided on a one-year transition basis only, and commit to managing future costs for implementation of the program from within existing Board funding allocations.

D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS

ILE SURVEY RESULTS SUMMARY

- 1. Survey process:
 - Surveys were coded, prepared, packaged, and sent out to all elementary schools by November 2, 2018.
 - One survey was sent to each family with the November progress report cards. All surveys were to be returned to principals by November 27, 2018.
 - Principals were instructed to seal all boxes of returned surveys at the end of the school day.
 - Surveys were picked-up by TCDSB couriers on November 28th and November 29th.
 - All returned surveys were delivered to the Catholic Education Centre on November 30, 2018.
 - All survey envelopes were opened and processed. The executive from CUPE 3155 was invited to be present during this process and they did attend.
- 2. The table below provides overall survey statistics for the Board:

Number Of Surveys Sent Out To Parents	46,193
Number of Surveys Completed by Parents and Returned	24,469
Board-Wide Return Rate	53%
Surveys were received from 164 Elementary schools	All 164 schools
Return Rate per School Range	26% - 90%
Number of Schools Meeting the 67% Threshold	21

- 3. Summary of overall survey statistics:
 - Surveys were sent to all 164 Elementary schools.
 - Completed surveys were received from all elementary schools.
 - In the TCDSB there are 44 Elementary schools with the ILE Program (ILE Schools) and 120 without the ILE Program (Non-ILE Schools).
- 4. Survey viability (required return rate):
 - The Board approved in the August 2018 Board report that, "surveys from 67% of all families in schools must be returned in order for the results to be considered viable."
 - Those schools that did not meet the threshold of 67% would not experience any changes to the new ILE format for the 2018-2019 school year.
 - Appendix A shows the survey return rate for each elementary school, including the number of surveys sent-out, the number of surveys returned, and the return rate.
- 5. Summary of survey return rate data:
 - In total, 21 elementary schools met the threshold of 67% return rate.
 - Of the 21 elementary schools that met the threshold of 67% return rate:
 - 16 were ILE Schools
 - 5 were Non-ILE Schools.
 - All schools that met the 67% threshold were scanned and are reported below.
 - ILE Schools that did not meet the 67% threshold were also scanned and results are reported below.

Survey results for ILE Schools that Met the 67% Threshold

6. The results for the 16 ILE Schools are shown in the following table. For schools that currently have an ILE Program, Trustees approved that "in order to determine if the program is to be continued, using the Board approved model or to move the ILE Program to an alternative model, the majority of 51% should be attained for the preferred selection."

	Number of	%	Continue To	Change the	Preferred Program (Number of Parents)	
School	Surveys Returned	Returned	Deliver the Program	Program Delivery Model	After School	Weekends
D'Arcy McGee	164	70%	87.8%	12.2%	25	9
Josyf Cardinal Slipyj	393	90%	98.7%	1.3%	9	2
St Anthony	172	70%	72.3%	27.7%	51	18
St Clare	215	68%	75.4%	24.6%	51	20
St. Demetrius	177	83%	99.4%	0.6%	2	1
St. Fidelis	312	72%	63.7%	36.3%	108	39
St Helen	206	67%	83.2%	16.8%	42	3
St Ignatius of Loyola	68	74%	86.2%	13.8%	14	1
St. Josaphat	97	79%	100.0%	0%	1	0
St Mary of the Angels	130	67%	85.8%	14.2%	26	6
St Matthew	284	70%	89.6%	10.4%	42	9
St. Paschal Baylon	430	71%	94.4%	5.6%	45	22
St Robert	342	74%	79.4%	20.6%	69	25
St Sebastian	124	71%	85.2%	14.8%	23	9
Sts. Cosmas and Damian	232	82%	87.0%	13.0%	44	15
Venerable John Merlini	152	75%	81.9%	18.1%	25	15

7. As shown in the table above, the results indicate that parents in all 16 ILE elementary schools, where the 67% return rate was met, were in favour of continuing to deliver the ILE Program.

Results for ILE Schools that Did Not Meet the 67% Threshold

8. In 28 of the 44 ILE Schools, the return rate was under 67%. These schools will continue with the current ILE format for the rest of the 2018-2019 school year. The results for these 28 ILE Schools are shown in the table below.

	Number of	%	Continue To	Change the	Preferred Program (Number of Parents)	
School	Surveys Returned	Returned	Deliver the Program	Program Delivery Model	After School	Weekends
Blessed Margherita	126	49%	89.5%	10.5%	17	8
Immaculate Conception	221	59%	90.9%	9.1%	28	7
Msgr. John Corrigan	84	53%	95.8%	4.2%	7	1
Pope Francis	126	62%	80.9%	19.1%	26	5
Regina Mundi	157	55%	80.7%	19.3%	34	11
St. Alphonsus	113	60%	87.0%	13.0%	17	10
St. Andre	221	49%	95.9%	4.1%	14	12
St. Angela	162	46%	80.3%	19.7%	23	18
St. Bernard	303	60%	79.5%	20.5%	45	31
St. Brigid	327	65%	63.3%	36.7%	120	21
St. Charles	118	62%	82.7%	17.3%	20	12
St. Conrad	264	59%	84.2%	15.8%	37	25
St. Francis de Sales	179	54%	97.6%	2.4%	6	9
St. Francis of Assisi	44	37%	65.8%	34.2%	12	5
St. Francis Xavier	201	47%	80.3%	19.7%	37	11
St. Jane Frances	260	49%	90.7%	9.3%	22	17
St. Jerome	258	64%	87.4%	12.6%	34	18
St. John Bosco	156	63%	88.1%	11.9%	22	8
St. John Vianney	154	59%	86.4%	13.6%	21	10
St. Jude	265	48%	94.2%	5.8%	21	6
St. Martha	73	41%	82.6%	17.4%	7	4
St. Maurice	110	50%	100.0%	0%	12	7
St. Norbert	142	56%	84.5%	15.5%	21	6
St. Raphael	234	64%	83.2%	16.8%	40	23
St. Roch	130	50%	91.3%	8.7%	11	8
St. Simon	238	59%	83.3%	16.7%	38	16
St. Wilfrid	258	47%	91.8%	8.2%	28	9
Stella Maris	174	64%	88.3%	11.7%	31	4

Results for Non-ILE Schools that Met the 67% Threshold

9. The results for the five Non-ILE Schools that met the 67% threshold are shown in the following tables. For schools currently without an ILE Program, Trustees

approved that "in order to initiate a program model for the school, a majority of 51% should be attained for the preferred selection."

School	Number of Surveys Returned	% Returned	Initiate an ILE Program	Initiate an After School or Weekend Program	Do Not offer an ILE Program
Holy Rosary	157	68%	52.3%	33.1%	14.6%
St. Antoine Daniel	213	67%	68.5%	23.4%	8.1%
St. Matthias	141	69%	57.9%	30.1%	12.0%
The Divine Infant	56	70%	75.0%	15.4%	9.6%

Non-ILE School, return rate 67% or more AND at least 51% in favour of initiating an ILE Program:

Non-ILE School, return rate 67% or more AND less than 51% in favour of initiating an ILE Program:

School	Number of Surveys Returned	% Returned	Initiate an ILE Program	Initiate an After School or Weekend Program	Do Not offer an ILE Program
Father Serra	254	71%	43.0%	42.6%	14.3%

- 10. As shown in the tables above, parents in 4 of the 5 elementary schools, where there was a 67% or better return rate for surveys, are in favour of initiating an ILE Program during the school day.
- 11. In the four Non-ILE Schools where there was a return rate of more 67% of the surveys AND more than 51% of respondents indicated a preference to initiate an ILE Program, the two top languages that were identified for IL are:

Sahaal	Preferred Languages			
School	1 st	2^{nd}		
Holy Rosary	Spanish (40%)	Filipino/Tagalog (26%)		
St. Antoine Daniel	Filipino/Tagalog (50%)	Spanish (25%)		
St. Matthias	Spanish (34%)	Filipino/Tagalog (18%)		
The Divine Infant	Filipino/Tagalog (37%)	Mandarin (34%)		

12. In the one Non-ILE School where there was a return rate of more than 67% of the surveys BUT less than 51% of respondents indicated a preference to initiate an ILE Program, the two top languages that were identified for IL are: Father

School	Preferred Languages		
School	1 st	2^{nd}	
Father Serra	Italian (64%)	Spanish (14%)	

ILE PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION 2018-2019

- 13. To ensure that all curriculum expectations could be met in all subject areas the following actions were initiated:
 - i. The Curriculum Leadership & Innovation department developed an *Integrated Curriculum Framework*, for Grades1-8, that:
 - supports and meets Ministry curriculum by combining a variety of instructional areas into integrated curriculum units, with a focus on global (21st century) competencies;
 - integrates the Ontario Catholic Schools Graduate Expectations through a social justice lens;
 - respects teachers' professional judgment, as it provides teachers the opportunity to change and/or incorporate additional information into key expectations, to best address the specific needs of each learner;
 - allows opportunities for multiple entry points to maximize student success;
 - supports all students through a culturally responsive approach by integrating student voice in the learning process;
 - addresses key Ministry expectations for each reporting period;
 - focusses on engaging students in problem solving and critical and creative-thinking through inquiry.
 - ii. The following initiatives/professional development opportunities have taken place and/or made available to teachers:
 - in-service on the Integrated Curriculum Framework in August 2018 for superintendents, principals and vice principals;
 - Integrated Curriculum Units were promoted through various boardwide initiatives and professional development opportunities for teachers:

- First Nations, Metis and Inuit workshop;
- Religion/Science Department Collaboration workshop;
- Literacy Representative Symposium;
- Workshop for teachers new to teaching intermediate;
- presentations to individual schools (based on request);
- one-on-one support to individual teachers (based on request).
- iii. The Supervisory Officers responsible for the monitoring of the ILE Program:
 - met with all elementary principals to share the *Integrated Curriculum Framework*;
 - discussed the process required for monitoring the program at principal meetings early in the school year;
 - communicated with principals, their responsibility for ensuring that all teachers assess and evaluate all of Ministry curriculum areas and that the achievement of each student is reported on their individual report card; and
 - will ensure that this process is implemented by each principal in the 44 ILE Schools.
- iv. The following resources/professional development opportunities are available to ILE instructors to support Ministry Curriculum:
 - strategies on integrating art, drama, literacy (dual language books), numeracy, social studies and religion into the target language are embedded in the TCDSB ILE Curriculum documents (Italian, Portuguese, Spanish, Filipino, Mandarin, Polish;
 - workshops focusing on the integration of Ministry Curriculum in the target language with a focus on the grade 3 and 6 Math, Science and Social Studies curriculum;
 - TCDSB *ILE Assessment Guide*, that is aligned with assessment practices in *Growing Success;*
 - *Financial Literacy in International Languages*;
 - through one-on-one support to individual instructors (based on request).

SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS OF FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

14. Financial Analysis

i. Financial risks have arisen due to language appearing in the collective agreement with TECT, and direction received in a recent arbitration ruling regarding the ILE program.

In summary, the ILE program can no longer be delivered in an extended day format, requiring IL teachers to work until 30 minutes longer than their colleagues. This ruling necessitated the delivery of ILE program during the regular instructional day. Consequently, the TCDSB faced the potential loss of ILE Grant funding provided for the after-school model, and would incur the additional cost of instructional teachers and school bussing costs due to modified school schedules.

- ii. As a result of a motion approved by the Board and requested of the Ministry, the Minister of Education in a communication to the Director of Education dated August 31st 2018 confirmed by a conditional approval the IL course of study can be delivered during the 5-hour (300-minute) instructional day. The conditional approval is for the 2018-19 school year only. The estimated financial impact in 2018-19 is a shortage of funding in the amount of \$5.2M (after accounting for the one-time funding of \$3.6M provided by the Ministry).
- iii. The breakdown of funding and cost implications for 2018-19 appear in the following table:

Funding/Cost Implication for 2018-19					
Additional teachers required due to shortened	(\$2.3M)				
instructional day					
Additional school bussing costs due to modified school	(\$1.5M)				
day schedules					
Loss of GSN funding for Extended Day Program	(\$5.0M)				
One-time Ministry funding to pilot IL programme during	\$3.6M				
regular instructional day					
Overall Funding/Cost Implication	(\$5.2M)				

iv. The Revised Budget Estimates submitted to the Ministry in December 2018 have addressed this shortfall. Staff recommended and the Trustees approved the use of surpluses from the 2017-18 fiscal year on a one-time

basis to balance the 2018-19 budget. Should the Board of Trustees and the Ministry agree to continue the program and the proposed funding arrangement in the 2019-20 fiscal year, a permanent reduction elsewhere in the base budget would need to be identified in order to balance the budget.

SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS OF LABOUR/COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT CONSIDERATIONS

- 15. Labour implications are contingent on the Ministry of Education's decision to allow the IL model/program to continue status quo beyond the conclusion of the 2018/2019 school year.
 - i. If the Ministry continues to approve the delivery of the IL program during the 5-hour (300-minute) instructional day, then the Board will need to focus on the financial viability and funding of the program.
 - ii. If, however, the Ministry takes the position that it can no longer support the current model, the Board will need to consider alternative program delivery models that will have significant labour implications or designate the appropriate funds to maintain its current status.
 - iii. If the Ministry does not allow the program to continue through funding or by making the required changes in legislation, one possible model would see the program moved to an after school/weekend format. In this case, classroom teachers would revert to a regular (non-IL school) teacher schedule which follows the TECT-TCDSB Collective Agreement parameters. The Board will need to liaise with IL instructors (CUPE 3155) to discuss potential opportunities and next steps associated with changes in their terms of employment (from daytime to after school/weekend hours).
- 16. The International Language model that the TCDSB selects will impact staffing requirements as programs need to be addressed.
 - i. These requirements are time sensitive and impacted by Collective Agreement parameters.
 - ii. Any delays associated with the selection of the model will negatively impact the process and push staffing decisions that would typically occur in June 2019 to September 2019 and beyond, as occurred in September 2018.
 - iii. The unfortunate reality of delayed staffing occurred in this academic year and we are still dealing with significant opportunity costs in terms of:

- pressure on the efficacy of the Occasional Teacher Roster to fill daily teacher absences; and
- the inconsistency of assessment and instructional practices linked to changes and delays in teacher classroom assignments.

As such, respectful of March staffing projections and Collective Agreement requirements, it is imperative that a timely decision be made.

E. METRICS AND ACCOUNTABILITY

- 1. The Research Department will devise and implement a survey to evaluate the 2018-2019 ILE Program delivery model with the appropriate stakeholders. The results will be shared at the Student Achievement Committee meeting, scheduled for May 28, 2019.
- 2. Depending upon the discussions with the Ministry of Education regarding the existing delivery model of the ILE Program for the 2018-2019 school year, Board staff may have to look at alternative methods of delivery of the ILE Program for the 2019-2020 school year.

F. STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

That the Board:

- 1. Seek ongoing permissions to ensure the program can continue to be offered within the 300 minute instructional day.
- 2. Request ongoing support from the Ministry of Education through a commitment to full funding as it is required in order to ensure the continuation of this valuable program.
- 3. Indicate to the Minister of Education and Ministry staff that they are willing to work collaboratively on issues related to funding and permissions, in order to ensure the continuation of the IL program.