



REPORT TO

CORPORATE SERVICES, STRATEGIC PLANNING AND PROPERTY COMMITTEE

SYSTEM-WIDE APPROACH TO UNDER-SIZED GYMNASIUMS IN SCHOOLS

*"I can do all this through Him who gives me strength."
Philippians 4:13 (NIV)*

Created, Draft

January 7, 2016

First Tabling

January 21, 2016

Review

P. De Cock, Comptroller, Business Services
Superintendents of Learning, Student Achievement and Well-Being
M. Puccetti, Superintendent of Facilities Services

RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Vision:

*At Toronto Catholic we transform the world
through witness, faith, innovation and action.*

Mission:

*The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an
inclusive learning community rooted in the love of
Christ. We educate students to grow in grace and
knowledge and to lead lives of faith, hope and
charity.*



G. Poole

Associate Director of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio

Associate Director of Planning and
Facilities

Angela Gauthier

Director of Education

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Toronto Catholic District School Board has approximately 200 elementary and secondary schools, comprising total gross floor area of 1,042,741 square metres (11 million square feet). There are a total of 171 schools currently, representing 86% of the portfolio that have under-sized gymnasiums, as compared to the Ministry of Education (EDU) space standards for new schools. Gymnasium area is based on the “On the Ground” (OTG) capacity of the school; 10 square feet (s.f.) per student for elementary schools and 12 s.f. per student for secondary schools, scaled to meet the typical court playing standards.

In addition to the recently completed six (6) new elementary schools in Phase 2, the Board’s current Capital Program, Phases 3 to 6, will result nine (9) new schools and four (4) major additions, with gymnasiums that met the EDU gymnasium benchmark area. The Board received Ministry approval to use Proceeds of Disposition (POD) for one new elementary school and two of the major additions.

Recent changes to Ontario Regulation 193/10, *Restricted Purpose Revenues*, now restricts the use of POD to address repair or replacement of components within a school, as set out in the School Condition Improvement policy and not for purposes of increasing building footprint or program-related upgrades. Boards may apply to the Ministry for an exemption to O. Reg. 193/10, and request the use of POD to fund projects “that have no renewal component within them”, or to build new schools. Any request must be supported with a business case.

In addition to gymnasiums, there are other spaces in schools that are below EDU space standards or that do not meet current curriculum delivery needs, particularly in the secondary school panel. This report recommends the development of an evaluation matrix to identify and prioritize future space or program related upgrades in schools, including gymnasiums. Subject to available funding, these upgrades should be considered in conjunction with the future capital priority initiatives, as well as the Board’s next Long Term Accommodation Plan.

B. PURPOSE

1. This report is a response to a Trustee request from the September, 2015 Corporate Affairs, Strategic Planning and Property Committee, regarding “*an analysis of small or undersized gymnasiums and options for funding upgrades*”.

C. BACKGROUND

1. The Board has had a history of program/ facility upgrades to accommodate inadequate program spaces.
2. Most recently in June 2005, the Board approved approximately \$11.0M for program/facility upgrades to secondary schools. The program/facility upgrades consisted of two initiatives: upgrades to science rooms in eight (8) existing secondary schools to meet the current curriculum expectations; and the introduction of specialized technical programs/facilities such as construction shops, hospitality and tourism and transportation shops in eleven (11) secondary schools. These initiatives were funded through a multi-year School Renewal program.
3. The current EDU space plan template determines the size of the gymnasium for new school construction based on the number of approved pupil places; for a new elementary school, the combined gymnasium and stage area is 0.929 m²/pupil (10 s.f./pupil) and for a new secondary school, the combined area for new gymnasium and exercise room is 1.12 m²/pupil (12 s.f. /pupil), as noted in Table A below:

Elementary		
Less than 350 students	3,000 s.f. combined space	10 square feet per student (Gym and Stage)
351 to 400 students	4,000 s.f. combined space	
401+ students	Enrolment x10/s.f. combined space	
Secondary		
Less than 500 students	7,000 s.f. (Gym + Exercise Room)	12 square feet per students (Gym and Exercise Room)
500 to 1000	8,000 s.f. (min) and 13,500 s.f. (max)	
1000+ students	12,000 s.f. for a Triple Gym Area	

4. A detailed list of the school gymnasiums, sorted by ward and school panel is posted for information at the Board's on line January 21, 2016 Corporate

Services, Strategic Planning and Property Committee Agenda. Appendix A notes the location of the detailed list of school gymnasiums.

5. In addition to physical education classes, school gymnasiums are also used for variety of assembly activities (concerts and school masses) as well as sports programs. The OBC and Ontario Fire Code have maximum occupant load requirements for assembly spaces, which are posted in every gymnasium. In many schools, in particular elementary schools with small gymnasiums, assemblies and concerts are divided into two to three sessions in order to accommodate all participants and visitors within the space.
6. Gymnasiums are permitted out after school and during the summer to various community and sports organizations, including children and youth camps. In the secondary schools, with larger double or triple gymnasiums, several groups can be accommodated at the same time thereby expanded the community use of the facility. In new schools, the gymnasium, change rooms, washrooms and the multi-program room (in the case of elementary schools), are grouped together at one end of the ground floor plan, which improves access and security.
7. In June 2015, the EDU issued Memorandum 2015: B13, advising Boards of revisions to Ontario Regulation, regarding the use of Proceeds of Disposition (POD). Eighty percent (80%) of POD is mandated to target key building components, along the lines of the School Condition Improvement (SCI) policy, with the remaining 20% to address other locally identified renewal needs. POD cannot be used to increase the gross floor area (GFA) of a building such as an addition – however, boards may request an exemption to O. Reg. 193/10 but any request would be assessed by the Ministry based on the strength of the business case made by the board for the individual project.
8. The cost to build a new elementary school gymnasium as an addition depends on various factors. These factors include:
 - A. condition and size of the site;
 - B. site services and connection to existing building systems;
 - C. location and size of the new gymnasium;
 - D. renovations (if required for the existing gymnasium) to convert it to a “multi-program” room; and
 - E. whether parts of the existing building need to be altered or demolished to accommodate the addition.

9. The total estimated project cost of new elementary gymnasium, if completed as a standalone project, would be in the range of \$2.0M - \$3.0M depending on the various factors discussed above. The cost for a new secondary school gymnasium would probably in the range of \$3.0M to \$4.5 M – depending on gymnasium size and features such as inclusion of a specialized-surface running track.
10. It is generally more expensive and inefficient to retrofit and expand an existing undersized gymnasium. Typically, the structural components and height of the new, larger gymnasium exceeds the structural capacity of the existing smaller gymnasium structure including the footings, foundations, walls and beams. Furthermore, many gymnasiums are located in a part of the building/site where it would be difficult to expand without disruption to adjacent spaces, or where there is insufficient space on the site (at the front of buildings for example).
11. Based on the four recent expanded addition projects for elementary schools, it was determined to be more cost-effective and less disruptive to the school, to build a new gymnasium addition rather than retrofit the existing gymnasium. The existing small gymnasium is repurposed as a multi-purpose space for music programs, kindergarten, lunch room and special program-delivery space (arts and craft activity, science workshops).

D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS

Analysis of the subject matter

1. Eighty-six percent (86%) of existing schools (not including the new schools/major additions that are currently in development/construction within the Capital Program or the Monsignor Fraser Colleges), have under-sized gymnasiums as noted below:

Elementary	Numbers	Percentage
Does not meet minimum criteria	143	86%
Meets minimum criteria	24	14%
Total	167	100%

Secondary*	Numbers	Percentage
Does not meet minimum criteria	28	85%
Meets minimum criteria	5	15%
Total	33	100%

Total	Numbers	Percentage
Does not meet minimum criteria	171	86%
Meets minimum criteria	29	14%
Total	200	100%

**Note: does not include Monsignor Fraser College*

2. Under-sized spaces or spaces that are obsolete, with regards to speciality programs, have an impact on program delivery and may disadvantage students. In the case of elementary schools with more than 400 students and one small gymnasium, students may have access to the gymnasium only once or twice a week for thirty (30) minutes/time.
3. The Ministry curriculum requirements for Physical Education at the elementary level stipulate 120 minutes/day for Full Day Kindergarten and 60 minutes/day for each Grades 1 to 8. For a large elementary school of 650 or more students, this may mean that only 55 to 65% of the student population may have access to the gymnasium in the week. The small gymnasium also restricts the amount of practice time available for the various school sports practices and games.

4. The Ontario Building Code governs the permitted loading capacity for assembly spaces in schools. All gymnasiums have wall-mounted signs indicating the allowable occupancy loading (OL) based on use – standing, seating with non-fixed chairs and with non-fixed seats and tables (relevant when there are exams written in the gymnasium for example). The number and size of exits also determines the OL capacity of a gymnasium.
5. The per square foot costs of building a gymnasium addition, will typically be higher than if the gymnasium is part of a larger addition. Additions however are generally 40% higher in cost per square foot than with a new school project based on data collected from the previous Capital projects, comparing the sixteen (16) school additions of Phase 1 to the six new schools of Phase 2, constructed between 2008 and 2014.

E. VISION

VISION	PRINCIPLES	GOALS
To maximize capital improvement opportunities by addressing long-term accommodation needs in conjunction with the Board's Capital Priorities and Long Term Accommodation Plan.	Long Term Accommodation Plan Guiding Principles, Stewardship of Resources, to deliver capital investment at existing schools to foster student achievement.	To address the accommodation needs of staff and students, in a cost effective manner for the greatest number of students, with the available funding from Ministry grants and Board-generated sources.

F. ACTION PLAN

1. The development of evaluation criteria to prioritize future gymnasium replacement projects would assist the Board to understand the needs and funding requirements, as well as inform future Capital priority plans.
2. Recommended criteria for the evaluation matrix include the following:

Criteria	Highest Score	Lowest Score
Size of school based on enrolment (2016)	Largest enrolment	Lowest enrolment
Enrolment projection in 10 year (2026)	Largest enrolment	Lowest enrolment
Size of existing gymnasium	Small gymnasium	Large/New Gym.
Gymnasium area per OTG/Ministry Standard	Lowest ratio	Highest ratio
Facility Condition Index of School (FCI)	FCI less than 50	FCI greater than 51
Size of Site	Larger site	Smaller site
Access to sports field (natural grass or artificial turf)	No field	Large field
Part of a major addition	Addition	No addition
Low-Income Cut-Off (Statistics Canada)	Average Low Income Family Income	Average Higher Income/Family
Barrier-free access to existing gymnasium, from within the building and from exterior	No or limited access	Barrier-free Access
Other program-related upgrades (by Elementary and Secondary panel), including age of building and barrier-free accessibility	Meets more than 50% of Space Plan Template (SPT) for new school	More than 50% of the building is below SPT, for new school
Long Term Accommodation Plan	Facility Renewal	Disposal/Consolidation
Other gymnasiums nearby (community centre or other school board facility)	No adjacent facility	Presence of facility nearby (under 1.5 km)
Interest from other community groups	Low # permits	High # permits
Partnerships with community groups or sports organizations	Available Funding	Available Funding

3. Local sports organizations may also have an interest in contributing towards a gymnasium addition. A Request for Proposal (RFP) could be issued to those sports clubs, starting with the groups that currently permit TCDSB gymnasiums.

G. METRICS AND ACCOUNTABILITY

1. The annual *Capital Priority* report provides an opportunity to identify new capital projects, including gymnasiums additions and other program-related projects, in addition to/or in support of other capital priorities such as replacement schools. The Ministry of Education provides Capital Priorities funding for new schools and major additions, however this funding may not extend to new gymnasiums or other program-related upgrades as these do not result in new classroom spaces.
2. Analysis of recently completed capital projects, and projects currently in development, will provide current cost data related to additions verses new school construction.
3. The EDU's School Facilities Inventory Systems (SFIS) which is updated annually by Board staff, includes enrolment, room use and room loading (based on use). TCPS® (Total Capital Planning Solution) is the current EDU building condition assessment database, which identifies renewal needs (based on life cycle and condition) and provides the Facility Condition Index for each building. These databases enable board staff to assess the building and space-related condition of each building. A gymnasium addition or major interior retrofit may trigger the need for other renewal work or building upgrades in order to obtain a building permit for construction.
4. The Board's Capital Plan provides information regarding the status of the Board's Proceeds of Disposition – currently estimated at \$20 M (not including current Capital Plan commitments). Upon approval of the evaluation matrix, a further report will be provided to the Board, prioritizing the gymnasium replacement projects by panel. The report will include a summary of estimated costs based on square footage for each gymnasium replacement project.

H. IMPLEMENTATION, STRATEGIC COMMUNICATIONS AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN

1. A future report to Board would be provided that would identifying priority gymnasium and other program-related upgrades based on evaluation matrix with estimated costs.

2. Provide Trustees and school communities with summary communique that highlights key issues, to raise awareness and garner support with the City and other potential external parties, such as sports organizations.
3. Provide the Ministry of Education with business cases in support of the use of Proceeds of Disposition (POD) to fund gymnasium addition and/or other program upgrades.

I. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the Board approve an evaluation matrix detailed in the report to prioritize the greatest need for possible replacement of under-sized gymnasium or other program-related spaces, subject to available funding.
2. That the Board consider gymnasium additions and/or other program-related upgrades under future Capital Priorities.
2. That staff seek other funding opportunities through community partnerships for the construction of new, larger gymnasiums.