



## REPORT TO

## REGULAR BOARD

## LORETTO ABBEY CATHOLIC SECONDARY SCHOOL RENEWAL WORK AND ACCOMMODATION PLAN (WARD 5)

*"I can do all things through HIM who strengthens me."  
Philippians 4:13 (NRSVCE)*

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
February 11, 2020	February 20, 2020	
M. Iafrate, Senior Coordinator, Asset Renewal K. Elgharbawy, Senior Coordinator, Innovation and Service Delivery B. Leporati, Senior Coordinator, Planning Services S. Vlahos, Chief of Communications and Government Relations M. Loberto, Superintendent, Planning and Development D. Friesen, (Acting) Superintendent, Capital Development and Asset Renewal		
<b>RECOMMENDATION REPORT</b>		

**Vision:**

*At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.*

**Mission:**

*The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community uniting home, parish and school and rooted in the love of Christ.*

*We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.*



Rory McGuckin  
Director of Education

D. Koenig  
Associate Director  
of Academic Affairs

L. Noronha  
Associate Director of Facilities,  
Business and Community  
Development, and  
Chief Financial Officer

## **A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

This report recommends approval of Option 2, a two-phase implementation of the heating system replacement at Loretto Abbey as detailed in this report, with students remaining on site during the academic year for the duration of the project.

The heating system replacement became urgent in November 2019, when Maintenance staff reported leaks in areas previously repaired. In order to carry out immediate replacement of the heating system, staff proposed vacating the building for the next academic year as the leading option heading in to consultation.

Based on school community feedback, two options were explored to expedite completion of the critical heating system replacement:

- Option 1 is to relocate students for 12 – 18 months to either the former Nelson Boylen Secondary School, or to the Tyndale building that the Board currently leases for St. Joseph Morrow Park (which will be moving into a new school in September 2020).
- Option 2 is to carry out the heating system replacement in two phases, working from May 15 – October 15 in 2020 and 2021, with no relocation of students. Work would include installation of ventilation, a Building Automation System, new water heating system and potentially air conditioning, as well as painting.

A school community consultation was held on January 30 and a school staff consultation on February 7, during which both options were presented and feedback was gathered. The majority of parents favoured Option 2. The majority of Abbey staff preferred relocation. Costing for both options has been estimated, with Option 2 carrying the least cost. Should the staff recommendation be approved then other renewal work required at the Abbey, listed in Appendix B, would be scheduled as part of the ongoing Renewal Plan following completion of the urgent heating system replacement.

***The cumulative staff time required to prepare this report was 10 hours.***

## **B. PURPOSE**

This report addresses the approved Board motion in response to the 2020-2021 School Relocations Plan report presented at the January 16, 2020, Corporate Services Committee meeting that “*all options be explored for Loretto Abbey . . . and*

*that a report on relocation come back at the February 13, 2020 Corporate Services Committee meeting or February 20, 2020 Board meeting.”*

## **C. BACKGROUND**

1. ***The heating system at Loretto Abbey is in poor condition and requires replacement.*** An evaluation of the mechanical and electrical services in the building carried out by an engineering consultant in 2014 noted that the school’s steam heating system was in poor shape, although the boilers had seven or more years left in typical life expectancy. The study also recommended conversion of the steam system to a hot water system to improve energy efficiency, provide for zone control and reduce maintenance. The replacement was deferred in anticipation of a potential addition that would have an impact on any new heating system installed and because the Convent side of the building was still occupied by the Sisters.
2. ***A project budget of \$4.3M was approved in the School Renewal Plan for the heating system replacement and addition of a ventilation system.*** \$800,000 was approved in the 2016-2018 Renewal Plan and a further \$3.5M was approved in the 2019-2020 School Renewal Plan, following early departure of the Sisters in late 2018. A request for funding for a proposed addition and renovations was ranked #4 on the Board’s Capital Priorities submission in the fall of 2019. Funding for the 2019 Capital Priorities submission has not yet been announced by the Ministry of Education.
3. ***The heating system replacement became urgent in November 2019, when Maintenance staff reported leaks in areas previously repaired.*** The system has deteriorated more quickly than normal due to minerals in the water, despite installation of a water softener. It was concluded that the heating system replacement should not be further delayed beyond the current heating season due to the risk of total failure and damage from further leaks. Given this newly heightened risk, phasing the project over three summers with boiler replacement in the 3<sup>rd</sup> summer, as outlined in the 2014 study, is not recommended.
4. ***In order to carry out immediate replacement of the heating system at Loretto Abbey, staff proposed vacating the building for the next academic year as the leading option heading in to consultation.*** The project could then be completed efficiently, without phasing, and ensure that the building was vacant for the anticipated “Type 3” asbestos abatement. The former Nelson

A. Boylen Secondary School, recently acquired from the TDSB, was identified in the 2020-2021 School Relocations Plan report presented to the Corporate Services Committee on January 16, 2020, as the most suitable relocation site.

5. ***Loretto Abbey has a deferred Maintenance backlog of approximately \$12M.*** Based on the last Ministry inspection in 2016, this is the estimated cost of replacement of building systems expected to be at or near life expectancy in the next 5 year period. If the school was vacated for a period of 14-18 months, other renewal work could be completed at the same time as the heating system replacement. Under the option to relocate, the Board had intended to retain a Project Manager to determine the scope of additional renewal works that would have been achievable during this period and develop a work plan and schedule.

#### **D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS**

1. ***Appendix A outlines approved and pending renewal work at Loretto Abbey.*** Section 1 of the table lists work for which budgets have been approved by the Board in the Renewal Plan (\$4.3M for replacement of boiler system). Section 2 lists other system upgrades and replacements that have been identified in the Ministry of Education's building condition database, as recommended to be completed over the five year period following the inspection. This work totals approximately \$2.8M. Section 3 outlines additional work not included in the Ministry inspections that has been identified by staff. The total cost of these works is not yet estimated and will require further planning and assessment.
2. ***Savings would be expected if several renewal projects were combined and carried out in a vacated building.*** Staff estimate savings of approximately 10 to 15% in mobilization costs, competition for premium summer hours, efficiencies of scale and escalation for deferred projects.
3. ***Based on school community feedback, two options were explored to expedite completion of the critical heating system replacement.*** Option 1 is to relocate students off-site for the duration of the work. Option 2 was developed in further consultation with the engineer who completed the 2014 study and the Board's unit rate environmental consultant Maple Environmental Inc. The work can be phased over two heating seasons with some work carried out in

the Boiler Room only while the school is occupied, so that students can remain at the Loretto Abbey campus.

#### OPTION 1: RELOCATION (NOT RECOMMENDED)

4. ***Relocation options were explored upon notification of the urgent need to repair the boiler system.*** Two potential relocation options were presented to the Loretto Abbey community at the January 30, 2020 consultation meeting. Estimated costs of relocation for both sites are provided in *Appendix 'B'*.

##### (i) Nelson A. Boylen Relocation

The former Nelson A. Boylen is the closest (8.1 km) available TCDSB-owned facility that can accommodate all Loretto Abbey students with the addition of some portable classrooms.

Acquired from the TDSB for the purposes of constructing a new St. Fidelis, the building accommodates third party permit requests until another use becomes necessary or construction of the new school begins. Modifications would be required to prepare the facility for occupancy.

Transportation would be provided for the students through a combination of centralized school bus stops and provision of TTC tickets based on student preferences. Additional transportation could be provided for extra-curricular items such as after school sporting events.

##### (ii) Tyndale Relocation

The Board's current lease at Tyndale (8.9 km) was set to expire at end of the school year. From recent discussions with Tyndale, it is staff's understanding that while a new tenant was set to lease the space, this will not be moving forward.

The TCDSB option to extend the Board's lease only became available in the last two weeks. There is no need for renewal work to the facility, as it is currently an operating high school. This option requires a two (2) campus model with the new St. Joseph Morrow Park facility.

Staff would work with the two (2) administrations to make the most effective use of available space. Transportation could be provided between the two sites where necessary, a distance of less than 1 km. Portable classrooms may be required on the new St. JMP site to accommodate this option.

Transportation would be provided for the students through a combination of centralized school bus stops and provision of TTC tickets based on student preferences. Additional transportation could be provided for extra-curricular items such as after school sporting events.

## OPTION 2: PHASED HEATING SYSTEM REPLACEMENT (RECOMMENDED)

5. ***With an aggressive schedule commencing May 15, 2020, the heating system replacement can be completed between two heating seasons*** (May – October in each year, 2020 and 2021), with the boiler replacement occurring in the first year. This phasing is possible, as advised by the environmental consultant, due to the use of the “Tootsie Roll” method of asbestos abatement, which is categorized as “Type 2” and therefore may be carried out while the building is occupied. Work areas must be completely isolated from occupied areas of the building and would occur only in the Boiler Room when the school is occupied, for removal of the existing boilers.
6. ***The schedule for the two-phase option with students remaining on site is as follows:***
  - May 15 – June 30, 2020 (work confined to Boiler Room):
    - Removal of existing steam boilers
    - Begin installation of new high-efficiency hot water boilers
  - July 1 – Aug. 31, 2020 (School Section, building is unoccupied):
    - Removal of existing piping and radiators in school section, including asbestos abatement
    - Installation of new piping, radiators, piping for A/C and ventilation ductwork in school section, installation of make-up air units, Building Automation System, new domestic hot water system, painting.
  - Sept. 1 – Oct. 1, 2020 (School, Boiler Room)
    - Completion of piping and boiler installation
    - Commissioning of system in school section
    - Temporarily connect convent section to new boilers using existing steam piping
  - July 1 – Aug. 31, 2021 (Convent Section)
    - Removal of existing piping and radiators in convent section, including asbestos abatement



- Installation of new piping, radiators, piping for A/C and ventilation ductwork in convent section, connection to Building Automation System, painting
  - Installation of A/C in classrooms, if approved in 2020-2021 Renewal Plan
  - Installation of equipment in the attic and on the roof
  - Final Commissioning of entire system
7. ***The award of a consulting services contract for the urgent work has been approved.*** On February 13, 2020, the Corporate Services Committee approved the award to SAB Engineering for a fee of 3.5% of the construction cost, for complete design and construction administration services for the two-phase heating system replacement project, including domestic hot water, ventilation and rough-in for classroom air conditioning.
8. ***The design work is proceeding regardless of the accommodation option approved for the work.*** The percentage-based fee facilitates some expansion of the scope of work, for example, to add full air conditioning and the necessary power upgrades, if approved by Board in the 2020-2021 Renewal Plan.

## HEALTH AND SAFETY

9. ***A Designated Substance Survey will be carried out once the preliminary heating system design is completed.*** The removal of asbestos-containing materials is strictly regulated by O. Reg. 278/05, *Designated Substance - Asbestos on Construction Projects and in Buildings and Repair Operations*. A remediation plan and specifications will be prepared by the environmental consultant as required by the Regulation.
10. ***Asbestos removal will be carried out in strict conformance with O. Reg. 278/05 of the Occupational Health and Safety Act.*** The work will be monitored and inspected by the consultant and air testing will be carried out following completion of each stage of the remediation. Refer to Appendix C for further details.

## **E. METRICS AND ACCOUNTABILITY**

1. *A brief comparative analysis (inclusive of estimated costs) of the Accommodation Options for the renewal work at Loretto Abbey, as detailed in Appendices A and B, is as follows:*

	Option 1		Option 2
	Relocate to Boylen \$M	Relocate to Tyndale \$M	Remain On Site* \$M
Estimated Cost of Heating/Boiler System	\$3.76	\$3.76	\$4.30
Site Preparation Costs	\$0.75	\$0.34	-
Student Transportation	\$0.75	\$0.85	-
Leasing Costs	-	\$1.53	-
Estimated Cost of Additional Renewal Works	\$2.83	\$2.83	\$3.18
<b>Estimated Total Cost</b>	<b>\$8.09</b>	<b>\$9.31</b>	<b>\$7.48</b>
Minimum Time Frame to Complete Heating/Boiler System	1 Yr	1 Yr	1.5 Yrs
Minimum Time Frame to Complete Additional Renewal	1 Yr	1 Yr	4-5 Yrs
Health and Safety of Students and Staff addressed	Yes	Yes	Yes

*\*Includes increased cost for completing works in a non-vacant building environment (estimated at 12.5%).*

2. *Should Option 2 be approved, a report to approve the award of a construction contract would be expected at the April 2020 Corporate Services Committee meeting.* The project budget would be finalized at that time based on the actual bid price. If a budget increase is required, approval to include the increased budget amount in the 2020-2021 Renewal Plan would be requested. Budget approval for air conditioning in classrooms would also be requested at the appropriate time.
3. *Should Option 2 be approved, equipment will be pre-ordered directly by the Board to ensure on-time delivery.* This expenditure will also require a report



to the Corporate Services Committee for approval. The first task of the consultant will be to prepare specifications for the equipment for tendering as soon as possible.

## **F. IMPLEMENTATION, STRATEGIC COMMUNICATIONS AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN**

1. ***January 30, 2020 – Loretto Abbey Community Meeting and Consultation.*** Approximately 265 community members including students, parents and Abbey staff participated in moderated discussions with a focus on three themes. Below are high-level summaries. For detailed commentary, please refer to ***Appendix D*** which includes the moderated questions and attendee responses.
  - a. Renewal project details – In addition to the heating system replacement, attendees identified their other top priorities for renewal work. While safety was cited as the priority, the most common priorities included air conditioning, ventilation, fire alarm and washrooms.
  - b. Relocation and transportation options – Attendees were split between TTC tickets and centralized pick-ups, dependent upon school location. If Boylen, centralized pick up was favoured. If Tyndale, TTC tickets was favoured. Overall, attendees opposed relocation, but if necessary, Tyndale was preferred.
  - c. Option to stay on site and phase the renewal work – Majority of members, preferred this option regardless of the impact on construction timelines. Concerns about air quality and impact on student health and safety were cited.

At the end of the moderated discussions, attendees were invited to the chapel for closing remarks and next steps. An overwhelming majority of attendees raised their hands in support of the option to stay on site and phase the renewal work. Staff have also received dozens of emails from the Abbey community indicating their preference to stay on site while renewal work is phased.

2. ***February 7, 2020 – Loretto Abbey Staff Meeting and Consultation.*** Loretto Abbey staff members (CUPE 1328, CUPE 1280 and TSU) provided input on concerns and preferences regarding the upcoming renewal work. Overall, 50 feedback forms were received with 86% in favour of relocation, 12 % in favour of remaining on site and 2% undecided. Of those in favour of

relocation, 64% preferred the Boylen site as a first choice while 18% preferred the Tyndale site. Feedback included: concerns regarding potential mold and/or asbestos exposure during construction; the need for a back-up plan if the work is prolonged beyond the expected time frame; and, the understanding that more work could be completed if they were located off site.

3. ***Removal of the existing boilers will commence on May 15, 2020.*** This is the date that the heating season ends and boilers are shut down. Removal of piping and radiators will start in the classrooms immediately after classes end in June. This is critical to ensure completion of installation of the new piping and radiators by the start of school in September. Work on the new boiler, Building Automation System, and air handling unit installation can continue into the fall if necessary, with completion required by the start of the heating season, October 15, 2020.
4. ***A back-up plan will be in place should radiator installation in all classrooms not be completed by September.*** Spaces in the convent large enough to serve as classrooms will be reviewed for use, on a rotating basis if necessary, as work is completed in sectioned-off areas of the school. Any work that would disrupt school operations would be carried out in the evening and/or on weekends.
5. ***The system will be fully commissioned after the second phase of the work in the fall of 2021.*** Heating will be operational in the winter of 2020-2021, but some spaces will be hotter than average while other spaces may be colder than average, particularly on the convent side of the building. The convent side would be using old piping and old radiators temporarily connected to the new boilers for the first winter.
6. ***Regardless of the option chosen, regular meetings will be held with the Loretto Abbey Building Committee through-out the project.*** Regular updates will be provided to the school community through the Building Committee and the Principal. Priorities and potential scheduling of the remainder of the renewal work needed in the building will also be reviewed with the Building Committee. The Building Committee will consist of the Principal, a parent rep (grades 9-11), incoming parent rep (grade 8), CSPC members, Local Trustee, Area Superintendent and Capital/Planning staff. It is anticipated that the membership will be finalized at the upcoming CSPC meeting on February 24. The Committee will convene every two months.
7. The Communications Department will continue to post updates on the project as they become available on the Loretto Abbey school webpage, update FAQs

and draft timely communications for the Principal to distribute to the school community.

## **G. STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

That the Board approve Option 2, a two-phase implementation of the heating system replacement at Loretto Abbey as detailed in this report, with students remaining on site during the academic year for the duration of the project.