



REPORT TO

REGULAR BOARD

ST. SIMON CATHOLIC SCHOOL - REPLACEMENT TRUSTEE WARD 3 CAPITAL PROJECT BUDGET APPROVAL

*"I can do all this through Him who gives me strength."
Philippians 4:13 (NIV)*

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
November 19, 2015	December 10, 2015	
V. Barton, Senior Coordinator, Capital Development M. Farrell, Coordinator, Materials Management P. de Cock, Comptroller, Business Services A. Della Mora, Superintendent of Learning, Student Achievement and Well-Being M. Puccetti, Superintendent of Facilities Services		
RECOMMENDATION REPORT		

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community rooted in the love of Christ. We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge and to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.



G. Poole

Associate Director of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio

Associate Director of Planning and Facilities

Angela Gauthier

Director of Education

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report recommends approval of the capital project budget for St. Simon Catholic School of \$11,956,138. This replacement school replacing the current St. Simon CS on a new site located at 24 Strathburn Boulevard, will have an OTG capacity of 542 pupil places.

As approved on October 15, 2015, air conditioning to the classrooms for St. Simon CS has been costed. Since the overall cost of the project cannot exceed the Ministry of Education Approval to Proceed amount, the provision of air conditioning to the classrooms at an estimated cost of \$522,000 must be offset by building area reductions or deletions in the current design of the school. The type of deletions that must be contemplated to achieve the savings of \$522,000 for the school are detailed in Appendix B attached.

Funding is available and approved by the Ministry of Education (EDU) from the Capital 2012 Priority grant, Full Day Kindergarten grant, Capital Land funding (CLF), Additional Capital Priorities funding for Toronto Green Standards and Unique Site Costs and Educational Development Charges (EDC) Funding of 43.6% of eligible costs.

B. PURPOSE

1. On September 17, 2015, the Board approved in part the following:
“That the Director of Education submit a detailed budget for Board approval for each Capital project prior to tendering, detailing both Capital and Operating cost impact.”
2. On October 15, 2015, the Board approved 2015 Elementary School Design Standards that established the standard for elementary schools HVAC system to be displacement ventilation with an option of air conditioning. As part of the report Cost Benefit of Full Air Conditioning versus Displacement Air/Heating in New Elementary Schools, the Board approved the following:
“That air conditioning will be included when costing new school construction with comparative figures for DV and AC. Provide rationale between the two systems identifying where savings can be found to fund any difference in cost.”

3. This report provides a detailed budget for St. Simon CS – replacement.

C. BACKGROUND

1. On November 24, 2011, the Board approved the appointment of G. Bruce Stratton Architects as the prime consultant for the replacement of St. Simon Catholic School at 24 Strathburn Boulevard, the former TDSB Melody Public School site. The appointment included a \$41,000 feasibility study to study the cost benefit of either an addition to the existing Melody PS or a replacement school at 24 Strathburn Boulevard.
2. Based on the results of the feasibility study, the Board approved on June 21, 2012 the report “Capital Program – Implementation” that St. Simon Catholic School be a replacement school subject to Approval of Ministry of Education funding, Board funding and Ministry Approval to Proceed.
3. On January 24, 2013, the Ministry of Education (EDU) notified the Director of Education of the approved 2012 Capital Priority project for St. Simon Catholic School Replacement at a benchmark allocation including FDK funding of \$10,489,660.
4. On October 3, 2013, the EDU approved the Space Plan Template submitted to the Ministry on September 25, 2013 for 542 pupil place replacement school for St. Simon Catholic School at a maximum area of 5,350 m² (57,597 square feet).
5. On March 3, 2014, the EDU approved the Board’s request to demolish the existing Melody Public School and provided a grant of \$317,420 for the non-EDC eligible portion of the estimated demolition costs.
6. On August 19, 2014, the demolition tender for Melody PS was approved at a total demolition cost of \$475,195.76 including net HST to be funded from Ministry of Education Capital Land grant and EDC reserve funding.
7. The demolition of the existing Melody PS is complete and the costs and funding are included in the project budget contained in this report.

D. VISION

VISION	PRINCIPLES	GOALS
To maximize capital improvement opportunities and address the long term accommodation needs.	Long Term Accommodation Plan Guiding Principles, Stewardship of Resources, deliver capital investment which incorporate 21 st Century Learning principles.	To address the accommodation of students and staff, in a cost effective manner, with the available funding from Ministry grants and other sources.

E. ACTION PLAN

1. On June 1, 2015, Turner Townsend provided a construction cost estimate (R3) for the replacement school for St. Simon, including site preparation costs that would be EDC eligible and costs due to Toronto Green Standards based on design development drawings provided by G. Bruce Stratton Architects. The project costs were estimated at \$11,960,275.
2. On June 15, 2015, a request was sent to the EDU for additional funding of \$630,451 for site preparation and Toronto Green Standards, separate from the previous \$317,420 funding received for the demolition in March 2014. This request was submitted to the EDU with a detailed cost breakdown, and identifying a portion of work estimated at \$522,744 that could be charged to EDC funding. (VB to confirm).
3. On September 18, 2015, EDU granted Approval to Proceed to tender (ATP) for the replacement of St. Simon Catholic School for a total project cost of \$11,956,138. The Ministry of Education provided additional funding for unique site costs of \$627,214. This additional funding was \$4,138 less than the \$630,451 requested.
4. The Approval to Proceed letter instructed the Board however to structure its tender documents to identify the unique site costs separately, with the funding allocation to be adjusted to match the costs identified by the bidders, up to but not exceeding the approved maximum funding amount of \$627,214. These funds can be used only for the costs specified. The Ministry

will only grant an approval to proceed with unique site work once they are satisfied that these costs are within this funding approval maximum amount.

5. The Ministry of Education reiterated that the board is responsible for ensuring that the total project cost remains within the revised funding approval amount of \$11,956,138. Letter from the Ministry of Education is provided on Appendix A.

F. METRICS AND ACCOUNTABILITY

1. The project budget for St. Simon Catholic School – replacement school is detailed in **Table 1 below**, based on EDU Approval to Proceed.
2. The project budget will be monitored through the Board’s financial systems and audit processes and the financial status will be reported to the Ministry of Education annually through Capital Asset Project Template (CAPT) system.
3. A further report will be submitted to the Board to approve the award of the construction contract following the tendering and the project budget will be updated to reflect the actual tender price.
4. As part of the municipal permits and fees required for the project, the architect has paid on behalf of the Board, \$14,363.87 for City of Toronto application fees, demolition permit, committee of adjustment fees and City of Toronto tree protection fees and planting fees. All fees to the City of Toronto are HST exempt and can be tracked individually under the project budget. It is recommended that these costs be reimbursed to the architect.

Table 1						
St. Simon Catholic School - Replacement						
OTG	542	Project Budget (All costs include net HST)				30-Nov-15
Benchmark Area per pupil (sq.m.)	9.77	In Benchmark	Not in Benchmark			Total
Sample School area at benchmark (sq.m.)	5,350	Capital Priorities + FDK	EDC eligible 43.6%	Ministry Capital Lands	Ministry Unique Site Costs & TGS	
GFA of School (approved SPT) (sq.m.)	5,293					
A. Construction Costs	\$/sq.m.					
Subtotal (i)Site Preparation	\$184.72		\$422,521	\$283,563	\$271,662	\$977,746
Subtotal (ii) Building	\$1,598.60	\$8,436,361	\$0	\$0	\$25,029	\$8,461,390
Subtotal (iii) Site Development	\$147.64	\$667,831	\$0	\$0	\$113,648	\$781,479
Contingency Allowance	\$60.20	\$318,648				\$318,648
A. Total Construction Budget (incl Demolition)	\$1,991.17	\$9,422,840	\$422,521	\$283,563	\$410,339	\$10,539,263
B. Consulting Fees and Expenses	\$155.32	\$680,172	\$81,370	\$30,149	\$30,434	\$822,125
C. Other Soft Costs						
Subtotal Municipal Permits and Fees	\$70.05	\$163,387	\$18,852	\$3,708	\$184,820	\$370,767
(ii) TCDSB Allowances						
School Furniture & Equipment		\$49,681				\$49,681
Caretaking Equipment		\$5,962				\$5,962
Data Integration		\$46,070				\$46,070
Moving & Set Up/Fire Safety Plan		\$2,710				\$2,710
Project Management		\$117,939			\$1,622	\$119,561
Subtotal TCDSB Allowances	\$42.32	\$222,362	\$0	\$0	\$1,622	\$223,984
C. Total Other Soft Costs	\$112.37	\$385,749	\$18,852	\$3,708	\$186,442	\$594,751
TOTAL PROJECT COST	\$2,258.86	\$10,488,760	\$522,744	\$317,420	\$627,214	\$11,956,138
Total Temporary Accommodation						\$0
FUNDING - MINISTRY APPROVAL TO PROCEED	\$2,258.86	\$10,488,760	\$522,744	\$317,420	\$627,214	\$11,956,138

5. As a result of the October 17, 2015 Board direction, options to provide air conditioning to the classrooms were investigated. Since the overall cost of the project cannot exceed the Ministry Approval to Proceed amount, the provision of air conditioning to the classrooms at an estimated cost of \$522,000.00 must be offset by deletions in the current design of the school.
6. Two options for cost savings of \$522,000.00 in the current design were explored. The options are:
 - Option 1: *Redesign the building to reduce building area*
 - The major area of reduction would be the area of the gymnasium since the school area is below the EDU's Space Plan benchmark. Reducing the building area would delay the project by 3-6 months to accommodate revisions to the drawing and resubmissions for municipal approvals to the City of Toronto and Ministry approvals if some program areas are impacted, such as classrooms. The current gymnasium is 441 m² (4,747 sq. ft.) A gymnasium that would meet benchmark would be 390 m² (4,200 sq. ft.), a savings of 51 m² (550 sq. ft.) Reducing the building area may not be adequate to achieve the cost savings of \$522,000.00.
 - Option 2: *Identify elements/equipment/finishes that can be substituted/or deleted without re-design of the building.*
 - Many of these elements such as sinks in classrooms, adjustable basketball backstop, gym curtain divider, and millwork in classrooms will impact program delivery. Other items such as vinyl composite tile or VCT in hallways instead of porcelain tile, and changing exterior building materials will impact the operation and maintenance of the building. Under current EDU definitions for use of School Renewal funding, School Renewal funding could not be used to add new equipment or upgrade finishes within the first five years of the building.
 - Detailed in Appendix B is a list of deletions that could be contemplated to achieve the savings of \$522,000.00 without major alteration to the current design of St. Simon CS. A final list of deletions would be subject to detailed evaluation by the architects and cost consultants at time of tender.

7. If air conditioning for the classrooms is pursued, a revised project budget approval may be required prior to tendering to assess the impact of the air conditioning costs and the expected deletions on the project. As in the case of all new capital projects, if the final bid is over the approved construction budget, further reductions or deletions may be required. EDU approval of the tender is required.

G. IMPLEMENTATION, STRATEGIC COMMUNICATIONS AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN

1. The City of Toronto Notice of Approval Conditions (NOAC) for the Site Plan Agreement is pending. Once the NOAC has been received, work will be required to satisfy the approval conditions such as letters of guarantee for landscaping work, conveyances and other permissions. Registration of the Site Plan Agreement usually takes 2 months after all the approval conditions are met. Registration of the Site Plan Agreement is required before a full building permit will be provided.
2. Pending the approval of this project budget, revisions to the tender documents for air conditioning and deletions to the current design and the approval of the municipal funds, the building permit for St. Simon CS will be submitted.
3. If air conditioning is provided to the classrooms, revisions to the tender documents for the air conditioning requirements and the deletions to the existing building will require 2-3 months delay in the tendering of the project. Tendering of the project is currently scheduled for January 2016.
4. A community meeting with parents, residents and the City Councillor was held at the school on November 12, 2013 to present the school design and impact on the neighbourhood.
5. As required by the “Good Neighbour Policy”, a letter will be sent to adjacent residents to inform them of the construction start and expected duration once tender has been approved and the contractor is known.

H. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the capital project budget for the replacement of St. Simon Catholic School of \$11,956,138.00 be approved as detailed in Table 1 and funded as follows:

	Ministry of Education Funds	EDC 43.6%	Total
Full Day Kindergarten	\$ 479,025		\$ 479,025
Capital Priorities	\$ 10,009,735		\$ 10,009,735
Capital Priorities Additional	\$ 627,214		\$ 627,214
Capital Land Priorities	\$ 317,420		\$ 317,420
EDC Eligible costs (43.6%)		\$ 522,744	\$ 522,744
Total	\$ 11,433,394	\$ 522,744	\$ 11,956,138