



REPORT TO

CORPORATE SERVICES, STRATEGIC PLANNING AND PROPERTY COMMITTEE

FINAL RECOMMENDATION SCHOOL ACCOMMODATION REVIEW HOLY ANGELS, OUR LADY OF SORROWS, ST. MARK, ST. LEO, AND ST. LOUIS (WARD 2)

“For God shows no partiality”, Romans 2:11

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
January 22, 2016	February 9, 2016	Click here to enter a date.
John Volek, Sr. Coordinator, Planning, Assessment, Admissions and Accountability Maia Puccetti, Superintendent of Facilities Mario Silva, Comptroller of Planning and Development Services Doug Yack, Superintendent of Education		
RECOMMENDATION REPORT		

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community rooted in the love of Christ. We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge and to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.



G. Poole

Associate Director of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio

Associate Director of Planning and
Facilities

Angela Gauthier

Director of Education

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

At the December 8, 2015 meeting of the Corporate Affairs, Strategic Planning and Property Committee, the Board considered the report 'School Accommodation Review, Holy Angels, Our Lady of Sorrows, St. Mark, St. Leo, and St. Louis' (Appendix 'A1') and approved the following:

“That the following recommendations be considered for approval at the meeting of Corporate Affairs, Strategic Planning and Property Committee on February 11, 2016.

- i. A business case be developed for submission to the Ministry of Education at the next available opportunity for funding of replacement schools at St. Leo and Holy Angels.*
- ii. After the submission of the business case that, St. Louis be closed and the student population be distributed between Holy Angels and St. Leo effective September 2017; and*
- iii. The attendance boundaries of Our Lady of Sorrows, Holy Angels, St. Mark and St. Leo be approved as in Appendix 'D'; and*
- iv. The Director of Education develop a Transition Plan including timelines to facilitate a consolidation; and*
- v. Opportunities for enhanced programming at the consolidated school is assessed.”*

This report considers the recommendations of the Director's report, the recommendations of the ARC's report and public input received at the January 21, 2016 meeting of the Corporate Services, Strategic Planning and Property Committee.

B. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to consider public input and to present final recommendations for consideration and approval regarding the School Accommodation Review for Holy Angels, Our Lady of Sorrows, St. Mark, St. Leo, and St. Louis. Delegations and written submissions were received at the January 21, 2016 meeting of Corporate Services, Strategic Planning and Property Committee.

C. BACKGROUND

1. The ARC submitted its report to the Director of Education on November 11, 2015 (*Appendix 'B'*) and presented to Trustees at the Board meeting of November 19, 2015.
2. At the December 8, 2015 meeting of the Corporate Affairs, Strategic Planning and Property Committee, the Board considered the report '*School Accommodation Review, Holy Angels, Our Lady of Sorrows, St. Mark, St. Leo, and St. Louis*', and approved the following:
 - i. *A business case be developed for submission to the Ministry of Education at the next available opportunity for funding of replacement schools at St. Leo and Holy Angels.*
 - ii. *After the submission of the business case that, St. Louis be closed and the student population be distributed between Holy Angels and St. Leo effective September 2017; and*
 - iii. *The attendance boundaries of Our Lady of Sorrows, Holy Angels, St. Mark and St. Leo be approved as in Appendix 'D'; and*
 - iv. *The Director of Education develop a Transition Plan including timelines to facilitate a consolidation; and*
 - v. *Opportunities for enhanced programming at the consolidated school is assessed.*
3. Delegations and written submissions (*Appendix 'C'*) were received at the January 21, 2016 meeting of the Corporate Services, Strategic Planning and Property Committee.

D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS

4. The staff recommendation to close St. Louis and redistribute students to St. Leo and Holy Angels along with boundary adjustments for all four remaining schools is not fully supported by the Accommodation Review Committee.
5. The rationale for staff recommendations for each school community is summarized as follows:

- **Our Lady of Sorrows** – A boundary adjustment is required to manage continuing oversubscription at this school facility. The enrolment is comprised of mainly Priority #1 (siblings) and Priority #2 (In-Boundary) students indicating that the only way to effect a decline in enrolment is to shrink the boundary. The staff recommended boundary alignment maintains the majority of the existing walk area. There are eight portable classrooms on site. Although more could be placed on the field the building cannot accommodate additional students as it has reached the limit of code requirements for available washroom facilities.
- **St. Mark** –The enrolment and the size of the facility are both sustainable long-term. St. Mark is located in a residential area. Staff do not recommend any changes at this time.
- **Holy Angels** – The site adjacent to Holy Angels was recently purchased to allow for future expansion of the school facility. Enrolment trends and new development in the area indicate the need for growth of the facility and the added pressure from a boundary change with Our Lady of Sorrows increases the need for a replacement school.
- **St. Louis** – This facility is recommended for closure based on declining enrolment and limited site size. The site cannot be expanded through acquisition of surrounding properties. The attendance boundary is essentially divided by the geographic barrier of the Gardiner Expressway; students are transported from south of the Gardiner Expressway to St. Louis. St. Louis has an acceptable FCI (21.0%) however the combination of the above listed factors contributed to the staff recommendation for closure.
- **St. Leo** – Staff fully agree that a combination of high FCI (70.6% in 2019) and high deferred maintenance (\$6,614,606) at St. Leo are of particular concern, but given the Ministry's current funding focus, *School Board Efficiencies and Modernization initiative ("SBEM")* which promotes a more efficient use of school space, there's still a critical need to consolidate programming into a right-sized facility. Discussions have taken place between Board staff and the Archdiocese concerning a possible land share arrangement, which

would ultimately allow the Board to construct a larger, more appropriately sized replacement facility, and at the same time, allow parishioner access to a new school's amenities, such as the gym and library.

6. The staff recommendation creates two large well utilized facilities while alleviating enrolment pressure in the Our Lady of Sorrows area. Further supporting this direction, there is general agreement and consensus among senior academic staff that elementary schools in the range of 400 to 600 pupil spaces provide the required 'critical mass' associated with program-related benefits for students. A number of program-related benefits have been identified with schools of this size. Fully utilized elementary schools of this size lead to increased Ministry per pupil funding which in turn has the potential to generate several benefits some of which are enhanced programming, opportunity for greater parent involvement, opportunity for additional curricular and extra-curricular activities, team teaching and mentoring, increased enrolment generates increased funding for facility resources, and programs such as Art, Music, French Immersion and Literacy.
7. The ARC's report does not recommend closure of St. Louis and includes the following recommendations.
 - Rebuild a right-sized Holy Angels facility on an expanded site.
 - Rebuild a right-sized St. Leo facility, with a community hub, at its current location, in partnership with the Archdiocese.
 - Boundary adjustments to the five school communities in an effort to better balance current and future enrolments. This is premised on all current students and their siblings being grandfathered.
 - Consider innovative programming solutions at St. Louis in an effort to increase enrolment.
 - Modify the secondary school admission policy to prioritize the admission of students that live in close geographic proximity, regardless of elementary home school.
8. A number of delegations and written submissions from each of the five school communities were received at the January 21, 2016 meeting of Corporate Services, Strategic Planning and Property Committee. Concerns raised have been summarized and grouped by school. Where appropriate,

staff have provided explanations or responses to these concerns. The actual submissions are included in *Appendix 'C'*.

9. **Holy Angels -**

Summary of Concerns	Staff Comments
Not supportive of moving an over-enrolment problem from one school to another. The school community acknowledges that changes are coming and would like to work with TCDSB to incorporate a community hub at Holy Angels. Would like TCDSB to explore potential for City and community partners.	<i>In order for a project to be eligible for School Consolidation Capital funding, enrolment pressure and cost savings from consolidation must be demonstrated. A Board Decision on a School Accommodation Review is also required.</i> <i>The Community Planning and Partnership Policy (revised and approved for consultation at Governance and Policy Committee meeting of January 27, 2016) requires the Board to engage community stakeholders to make effective use of underutilized and new spaces.</i>
Will support staff recommended plan if TCDSB presents business case to the Ministry prioritizing a new school for Holy Angels.	<i>The Capital Priorities ranking report appears on this agenda (February 9, 2016 Corporate Services, Strategic Planning and Property Committee) for approval. A replacement school for Holy Angels has been ranked as #4 pending approval of this report. A business case will be submitted upon approval of the Capital Priorities report.</i>
Reconsider the date of proposed boundary change (September 2017).	<i>A date must be entered in the final report to satisfy section (5) clause</i>

There is inadequate space to accommodate additional portables and limited green space has already been compromised.	<i>(h) of the SARC policy. This date can be adjusted through transition planning and may be altered depending on funding approval or construction timelines.</i>
Date for boundary change should be delayed until there is funding approval for a new school and the Kerr Factory lease has been terminated.	<i>The actual date for the boundary adjustment and closure will be subject of the transition planning process. A future report to Board and part of the timelines for construction and lease termination are contingent on Ministry funding and project approvals.</i>
Kerr Factory purchase has doubled the potential school footprint. Environmental assessments on the Kerr Factory land must be completed showing that the land is deemed suitable to build and play on prior to a boundary change.	<i>As part of due diligence in a building project, an environmental assessment will be undertaken by the Board prior to the start of construction.</i>
The new capacity should not exceed 600 students.	<i>The size of the replacement facility will be based on any boundary change adjustment and updated projected enrolment for the area including any new development.</i>
Transition committee must be created that includes parent and community representation.	<i>This recommendation is included in the staff report.</i>
Fear of overcrowding, portables, run down and under maintained facilities affecting learning and mental health of children.	<i>Portables will be necessary to accommodate overflow in the short term. More defined timelines will be determined following Ministry funding approval of the project.</i>
Conflicted about living through construction and eventual completion of new school-community hub with uses for all ages.	
Supports new school that includes community uses, modern facilities,	

technology lab, more than one gym, public indoor pool, public library.	
Hopes that St. Louis remains open to handle overflow students from Holy Angels instead of placing portables on site.	<i>Could be part of transition plan depending on funding approvals.</i>

10. **St. Louis –**

Summary of Concerns	Staff Comments
St. Louis community does not want the school to close.	<i>In order for a project to be eligible for School Consolidation Capital funding, enrolment pressure and cost savings from consolidation must be demonstrated. A Board Decision on a School Accommodation Review is also required.</i>
Suggest alternative business plan to request rebuild of St. Leo without closure of St. Louis.	<i>If St. Louis is not closed, the projects at St. Leo and Holy Angels must be placed on the Capital Priorities list for regular projects and will be ranked accordingly for the next round of available funding. Business cases for the next round of funding will not be submitted for consideration until the Ministry announces the next funding window in the Fall of 2016. A closure at St. Louis improves the business case for replacement schools at St. Leo and Holy Angels.</i>
Opportunity for St. Louis to improve their enrolment by introducing innovative programming and community alliance of programming for better school exposure.	<i>There is limited funding available for additional or specialty programming when enrolment is declining. The Board is in constant contact with community partners regarding opportunities for collaboration.</i>

<p>St. Louis has value to its students. There is a sense of family and belonging that may be lost in a larger school.</p>	<p><i>Research shows that smaller schools; (1) improve student achievement, (2) increase attendance and graduation rates, (3) elevate teacher satisfaction, (4) improve school safety, and (5) increase parent and community involvement. EQAO scores have been selected as a representative measure, as they remain the only standardized provincial benchmark currently used to assess progress in student achievement. That said, EQAO scores are a limited snapshot and many factors contribute to overall student success on an EQAO measure or any other measure we might use to assess program efficacy. Additional information concerning EQAO impacts and measures is attached in Appendix 'D'.</i></p>
<p>If St. Louis is closed, students will lose their opportunity to attend Bishop Allen Academy.</p>	<p><i>If the boundaries for Holy Angels, St Mark and St. Leo change in order to accommodate the students St. Louis, students would then be included with the grade 8 cohort from those schools and will be considered for placement accordingly. As per staff recommendation, students residing north of the Gardiner Expressway will be part of the Holy Angels boundary and eligible to apply to Bishop Allen, students south of the Gardiner Expressway will be part of the St. Leo boundary which currently feeds Father John Redmond. Current grade 8 to grade 9 placement procedures allow</i></p>

	<i>families to enter their homeschool (according to their place of residence) information in order to better their proximity to a secondary school that they wish to attend.</i>
--	--

11. **Our Lady of Sorrows –**

Summary of Concerns	Staff Comments
Disappointed that the work of the committee was not reflected in the final recommendations.	<i>Staff recommendations were crafted to incorporate Ministry directions and to address as many of the concerns of the area as possible. The ARC has provided its' recommendations in its report to Board. The Board of Trustees will consider all available sources in making the final decision on the recommendations that will be approved and implemented.</i>
Why was the Committee recommendation (Scenario #9) regarding the OLOS boundary changed back to staff recommendation (Scenario #3)? It leaves OLOS oversubscribed and there is no explanation in the report.	<i>The staff recommendation concerning the OLOS boundary attempts to alleviate the enrolment pressure while still keeping the majority of the students residing within walking distance of the school within the OLOS boundary.</i>
OLOS community south of Bloor bounded by Mimico Creek and Islington support staff recommended boundary alignment in Scenario #3. This scenario recognizes the students east of Islington that live within 1 km of the school. The ARC recommended Scenario #9 excludes	

this area.	
Staff proposed boundary will do little to address enrolment pressures at OLOS. Staff projection indicates 130% in 2020 in Scenario #3 while the ARC projection is 119% in 2020 in Scenario #9. Why has the Board chosen not to right-size the school as much as possible?	<i>While the projection in the staff recommendation shows a slower rate of reduction, it does alleviate the immediate pressure, and attempts to keep children within walking distance of the school within the boundary.</i>
Request that OLOS be included in any future Accommodation or Boundary Review involving schools to the north and west (specifically St. Gregory) as this review was limited to the south boundary of OLOS.	<i>The Elementary Boundary Review Ranking, approved at the January 21, 2016 meeting of the CSSPPC, lists the boundary review group (including St. Gregory) at # 3 within the first cycle of reviews.</i>
Need to apply equity when looking at boundaries. Need to include north/west/east boundaries. Decision to alter only south boundary unfairly targets the Sunnylea neighbourhood.	<i>The Elementary Attendance Boundary Policy does not prohibit Our Lady of Sorrows from being included in this review to address potential impacts to boundaries to the north and west. It should be noted that the Elementary School Attendance Boundary Review Policy does not apply to any decisions made arising from an accommodation review.</i>
There was no mention of the request for a change to the admissions policy in the staff report. We request that the Board reconsider amendments to the Elementary Admissions Policy with respect to oversubscribed schools such as redirecting families that move out of the area to their new home school.	<i>The Board's philosophy is to allow a child to continue and complete their education in the school in which they are originally enrolled regardless of whether they move out of the area or not. This type of amendment would not be in the best interest of the child's wellbeing especially in the case of an intermediate student that has been in the community since JK.</i>
Other members wish to have on record that they do not agree with the ARC recommendation in Scenario #9. They do not wish any boundary	<i>Previous boundary realignments have allowed the grandfathering of</i>

changes made at all. The issue should be resolved with amendments to the Admissions Policy. (They would support Staff recommended Scenario #3 over #9 if a change must be made).	<i>existing students and their siblings while new registrants would be admitted in accordance with the boundary change.</i>
A report regarding air pollution around the Holy Angels site was prepared and submitted for consideration of the Board. The report details the potential harmful effects of the industrial area and the major roadway on the health of children attending Holy Angels school either in the current building or a replacement building on the same site.	<p><i>The TCDSB can only control the air quality within our schools by increasing ventilation rates, maintaining HVAC systems, ensuring windows are operable, removing asthmatic triggers such as carpets, using environmentally safe custodian cleaning chemicals and implementing good housekeeping practices.</i></p> <p><i>The TCDSB does not have control of the outdoor air quality. It can to some extent control the quality of the air entering our schools by increasing the frequency of filter changes.</i></p> <p><i>Outdoor air pollution is regulated by the Ministry of Environment that sets and enforces the standards for emissions, and to some extent by the City of Toronto through idling by-laws.</i></p> <p><i>Toronto Public Health continues to work in partnership with school boards to help maintain healthy school environments.</i></p>

12. **St. Leo –**

Summary of Concerns	Staff Comments
Thank you to the Board for recognizing the need for a new school at St. Leo. St. Leo wishes to do what	<i>Pending Board approval of the recommendations in this report, a business case will be submitted to</i>

is necessary to access available Ministry funding for a new school.	<i>the Ministry to request funding for a replacement facility at St. Leo.</i>
Proposal for land share with TDSB, City and Parish is underway.	<i>Negotiations with the stakeholders are ongoing.</i>

13. **St. Mark –**

Summary of Concerns	Staff Comments
St. Mark is supportive of the ARC recommendation to adjust all 5 school boundaries and for St. Louis to remain open.	<i>The boundary adjustments presented in the ARC recommendations would achieve a balanced enrolment however staff believes that the closure of St. Louis and replacement of St. Leo and Holy Angels combined with boundary adjustments for all schools is more beneficial for future enrolment in the South Etobicoke area.</i>

14. Subject to Board approval of the recommendations of this report, staff will submit a business case to the Ministry of Education for the funding of replacement schools at St. Leo and Holy Angels under the School Consolidation Capital program.
15. Projects that reduce capacity and operating costs, and address renewal needs are eligible for School Consolidation Capital funding. The submission deadline for this funding is February 29, 2016. Projects submitted through this funding stream must have a final Trustee decision on a School Accommodation Review by March 28, 2016 in order to be considered for funding by the Ministry.
16. Further study of the long term need and potential uses for the St. Louis facility, should a decision be made to close the school, will be undertaken including consideration of a community hub, facility partnerships or disposition. Options will be prepared for Board consideration in a future report.

17. Subject to Board approval, a transition plan will be developed to facilitate a consolidation that is student friendly and that honours the history and traditions of the school communities. Among matters to be considered in the transition plan are: (1) timelines and the organization of student transfer, and (2) the relocation of program materials, equipment and school memorabilia from the closing school to the receiving school. Parents/guardians and school staff from the affected schools will be involved in the transition planning process.

E. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

That the following recommendations be approved;

- i. A business case be developed for submission to the Ministry of Education at the next available opportunity for funding of replacement schools at St. Leo and Holy Angels.
- ii. After the submission of the business case, St. Louis be closed and the student population be distributed between Holy Angels and St. Leo effective September 2017; and
- iii. The attendance boundaries between Our Lady of Sorrows and Holy Angels, as they appear in Appendix 'D', be approved effective immediately; and
- iv. The Director of Education develop a transition plan including timelines to facilitate a consolidation; and
- v. Opportunities for enhanced programming at the consolidated school be assessed."