



REPORT TO

## CORPORATE SERVICES, STRATEGIC PLANNING AND PROPERTY COMMITTEE

# CUSTODIAL OVERTIME AND REPLACEMENT COST REDUCTION

*"I can do all this through Him who gives me strength."  
Philippians 4:13 (NIV)*

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
November 29, 2016	December 8, 2016	
A. Rashid, Senior Coordinator, Operations P. de Cock, Comptroller, Business Services D. Koenig, Superintendent of Human Resources M. Puccetti, Superintendent of Facilities Services		
<b>RECOMMENDATION REPORT</b>		

**Vision:**

*At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.*

**Mission:**

*The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community rooted in the love of Christ. We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge and to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.*



R. McGuckin

Associate Director of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio

Associate Director of Planning and Facilities

C. Jackson

Executive Superintendent of Business Services and Chief Financial Officer

Angela Gauthier

Director of Education

## **A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

This report is in response to a Trustee request made at June 2016 Student Achievement Board meeting, regarding reduction strategies for replacement and overtime costs for Custodial and Maintenance staff. An overview of supply deployment and overtime costs for the past five years is provided in the report. Replacement staff are deployed typically to cover absences of permanent staff resulting from vacancies, medical leaves, vacation, family or urgent personal business as defined in the Collective Agreement.

In the summer of 2016, Staff completed a system-wide update of the *TechniClean* Program, which is a work-loading program to assess cleaning requirements based on space and use, for every TCDSB building. At the same time, as part of the Multi-year Recovery Plan, the Board approved a \$1.0M of cleaning efficiencies, which resulted in the closing of un-occupied rooms/spaces in under-utilized schools. Given the detailed information provided through TechniClean, further reductions to the replacement and over-time budgets for Custodial Staffing would impact the cleaning standards at schools. Other strategies to manage the costs associated with replacement and overtime include optimizing the use of space in buildings, closing more buildings in the summer, increasing permit fees and tenant leases, and generating other revenues to off-set costs.

*The cumulative staff time dedicated to developing this report was 55 hours.*

## **B. PURPOSE**

At the Student Achievement Board Meeting of June 2, 2016, there was a Trustee motion regarding strategies to “reduce replacement and overtime cost”, as it pertains to the Facilities Operations and Maintenance staffing budgets.

The majority of replacement and over-time costs are attributable to custodial staffing needs rather than maintenance staff. Maintenance staff have specialized trades designations such as plumber, electrician, carpenter, building automation system (BAS) technicians. These trades can only be replaced by another qualified tradesperson. Typically, this is done by issuing the work to an external contractor - in which case the costs are carried under the Time and Materials Repairs or Preventative Maintenance section of the Maintenance budget rather than under a staffing budget. The Board has 71 permanent trade positions within the Maintenance department.

## C. BACKGROUND

1. For the past five years, with the exception of 2015/2016, the combined Replacement and Overtime Costs have been under \$5.0 M. In 2015/2016 as noted in the table below, the costs increased due to the high number of vacant/unfilled permanent positions. The posting of these positions had been deferred pending resolution of the Board's Multi-year Recovery Plan.

<u>Year</u>	<u>Replacement Costs</u>	<u>Overtime Costs</u>	<u>Total</u>
2015-16	\$5,525,109	\$413,945	\$5,939,054
2014-15	\$4,691,320	\$286,268	\$4,977,588
2013-14	\$4,196,309	\$265,872	\$4,462,181
2012-13	\$4,550,230	\$172,071	\$4,722,301
2011-12	\$4,415,380	\$179,217	\$4,594,597

On the other hand, the costs for permanent staffing, under regular wages and benefits for 2015/2016 was approximately \$1.0M lower than the previous year – corresponding to the increase in Supply/Over-time costs.

<b>Year</b>	<b>Wages+Benefits</b>	<b>Budget expended</b>
2015-16	\$37,277,921	\$1,001,608 less in 2015-16 as compared to 2014-15 due to unfilled vacancies
2014-15	\$38,279,529	
Change	(\$ 1,001,608)	

2. On May 12, 2016 a report regarding the Techni Clean survey results was presented to the Corporate Services, Strategic Planning and Property Committee in Private. The report identified \$1.0M of cleaning efficiencies that could be achieved through the closing of rooms/spaces in twenty-one (21) under-utilized schools.
3. In June 2016, at the Special Budget meeting, the Board approved \$1.0M reductions for cleaning efficiencies and \$300,000 reductions in energy costs, effective for 2016 – 2017 as part of the Multi-Year Recovery Plan.
4. At the end of June and start of July, Staff met with Principals and where possible, with school staff and parents, to review the room closures and room relocations. Staff also met with the CUPE 1280 Executive to facilitate

a smooth transition to adjust shifts and work locations. In total, 47 custodians participated in a one-day “shift pick” exercise to determine new positions and shifts. All the CUPE 1280 staff were accommodated – the reductions were achieved through attrition from retirements.

5. The Techni Clean updates included adjusting cleaning tasks and custodial staffing needs at every school. Over the fall, Staff met with the custodial staff per school area to review the revised cleaning tasks and assignments, and information was provided to each Principals regarding the updates. Each school has been provided with colour-coded floor plans indicating the various cleaning assignments and areas of responsibility for each position (Head Custodian/Assistant Caretaker - Day and Afternoon shifts).

## **D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS**

1. There are a variety reasons for deployment of replacement custodial staff - primarily when the regular/permanent staff are on vacation, or absent for medical reasons, or for family/personal reasons and a supply custodian is required to cover the absence. In the majority of cases, in particular for smaller elementary schools, the absence must be filled as the school cannot be left unattended without custodial staff.

As noted in the summary table below, 68% of custodians in permanent positions have 20 days plus vacation and 65% of Trades and Warehouse staff have 20 days plus vacation. As the majority of schools are used during the summer – for childcare, summer camps and summer schools – the permanent school custodians are replaced when they are on vacation with supply caretakers. Summer is also when the bulk of the heavy cleaning takes place – in particular stripping and waxing of floors. Typically, two custodians at minimum are required for a portion of the work to relocate furniture or for high bay cleaning. If a school is not occupied during the summer, Operations staff will schedule the cleaning to occur over a shorter timeframe and then close building thereby saving on custodial staffing (notwithstanding, that a custodian will do regular periodic inspections of the closed facility).

Summary of Vacation Entitlement for CUPE 1280 Permanent Custodial Employees as of 2015/2016		
# of days entitled	# of employees	% of employees
10 days or less	81	13%
10.50 to 12.50	25	4%
15	97	15%
20	169	27%
25	65	10%
26-29	71	11%
30	126	20%
Grand Total	634	100%

Summary of Vacation Entitlement for CUPE 1280 Trades & Warehouse Employees as of 2015/2016		
# of days entitled	# of employees	% of employees
10 days or less	12	15%
15	17	21%
20	17	21%
25	18	22%
26-29	7	9%
30	11	12%
Grand Total	82	100%

2. Facilities Services has had an Attendance Management system in place for the past fifteen years. The system tracks absenteeism by category; personal illness, family illness, urgent personal business, bereavement, union business, training etc. as defined under the current Collective Agreement with CUPE 1280. Supply staff are also used to replace custodial staff who are absent for reasons as noted above has been the corner stone of managing our wages and benefits budget until now. As noted below, the percentage of *true* absenteeism (related to family and personal illness) for the past three years has remained relatively stable, at less than 7% primarily due to our Absence Management Program,

2015-16	2014-15	2013-14	2012-13	2011-12
6.72%*	6.15%	6.43%	7.11%	6.67%

3. TechniClean is a work loading software that provides a detailed level of assessment in order to balance and determine custodial FTE. In larger schools with several Custodial FTEs, Techni Clean provides a clear break down and distribution of tasks and facilitates the integration and accommodation of staff that may require a return to work accommodation. Currently there are seventeen permanently modified staff and they are integrated as supplemental labour in addition to workers included under TechniClean.
4. Over time is used when the regular custodian is absent due to personal illness, family illness, etc. and we cannot find a supplement in which case the custodian on duty is asked to do overtime to cover the absence usually up to four hours. These OT costs are not covered by other budgets as we are obliged to provide custodial coverage for the day care and some Board programs.
5. The recent TechniClean updates reflect changes in building uses and size, such as increased number of kindergarten rooms in elementary schools as well as construction of new additions, new buildings, addition and removal of portable classrooms, increase of childcare spaces and identification of under-utilized rooms/spaces. As noted in the May 2016 report to Board, TechniClean takes into account all of these factors – and provides a recommended cleaning schedule per building, which determines the necessary staffing to maintain the Board’s standard of cleaning. In order to reduce the recommended FTE, and thereby potentially reduce Replacement or Overtime costs, there are certain cleaning tasks that would need to be eliminated or undertaken with less frequency such as project work like high dusting, gathering mulch around trees, other grounds keeping and exterior window cleaning. In addition, custodians would be hard pressed to both complete their regular cleaning tasks and still undertake some of the other activities that they carry out such as assisting teachers and students to move furniture or hang art, and undertaking some minor repairs.
6. The Board has approved some recent initiatives that will assist in the management of Supply and Overtime budgets – such as the recent amendments to Policy B.R.05, (2015), to increase Permit Fees, which includes custodial services/costs. Other cost-control measures have included charging individual Renewal or Capital project budgets – if the additional custodial supply time is related to construction. The closing of under-utilized

spaces to effect cleaning efficiencies as per the June 2016 Multi-Year Recovery Plan also impacted the Supply and Overtime budgets.

7. Other strategies for reducing the Replacement and Overtime Costs include the following:
  - Optimizing use of space and utilization in schools, through implementation of the Long Term Accommodation Plan;
  - Optimizing use of buildings during the summer – by congregating summer camp and summer school programs into common buildings and closing un-occupied buildings;
  - Continuation of the Permit Fee changes approved in the revised Policy B.R.05;
  - Implementation of a more proactive Return to Work program;
  - Adoption of cost-recovery leases to childcare tenants and other community use tenants.

## **E. METRICS AND ACCOUNTABILITY**

1. Annual updating of Techni Clean to reflect changes in the building that may impact cleaning assignments and staffing requirements will be undertaken by Operations staff. In addition, regular cleaning inspections are undertaken by Operations staff throughout the school year, as well as responding to concerns raised by an individual Principal. Any subsequent requests to increase staffing at a school are vetted by senior staff and the Superintendent of Facilities.
2. Reconciliation of custodial overtime and supply costs arising from Permits and/or construction activity at the school is administered and updated on a regular basis by the Board's Finance department. Any discrepancies are followed up by both the Permits and Operational department.
3. Annual training session, usually held during March break, are provided for all custodial and maintenance staff, including workshops related to health and safety topics such as how to reduce back injuries, safe use of chemicals and/or equipment and recently, how to work safely during periods of extreme heat. These sessions are conducted by either external providers or by the Board's Occupational Health and Safety department. Safety training is also provided to newly hired supply caretakers and maintenance trades.

4. Operations staff review monthly the absenteeism data for each school and school area, to determine whether costs and trends are in keeping with the budget. The custodial and maintenance staffing budgets, which are funded through Grants for Student Needs (GSN), are further monitored by both Operations/Maintenance and the Finance departments. The two areas of greatest concern in terms of impacting the budget are related to declining enrolment which would reduce the GSN, and increases in absenteeism, which would increase replacement and overtime costs.
5. The other cost pressure impacting the Replacement and Overtime Budget is delays in posting and filling vacancies. Staff from both Facilities and Human Resource departments have been working on measures to streamline and speed up the job posting and awards process. The job posting process is currently on-line, which significantly reduces the amount of paperwork and delays associated with availability of information – more postings available at one time for example.

## **F. ACTION PLAN**

1. Staff will continue to meet with individual principals and attend Principals meetings to facilitate the implementation of the Techni Clean updates and respond to concerns.
2. As part of the monthly review of absenteeism rates, Staff will work in consultation with the Benefits department to identify trends and cost-pressures. It is important to note that the current Attendance Management system is a critical tool to assist in the collection and analysis of all absenteeism data for Operations and Maintenance CUPE staff.
3. In consultation with Focus on Youth, Renewal, Permits and Strategic Support departments, Operations staff will develop a list of schools that could be used for a variety of programs thereby allowing other schools to be closed for the duration of or part of the summer.

## **G. IMPLEMENTATION, STRATEGIC COMMUNICATIONS AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN**



1. Work with the CUPE 1280 Union Executive and Human Resources to address concerns regarding absenteeism and other costs pressures at regular Union-Management meetings;
2. In consultation with Strategic Support, solicit feedback from various stakeholders – childcare, summer camps, FOY, and the City Parks, Recreation and Forestry regarding changes to use of buildings for the summer – if stakeholders can share a building, in order to allow closing of more buildings in the summer to reduce cleaning and caretaking needs. The results will be provided in a further report to Board in the spring.

## **H. STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

This report recommends that the Board continue to explore other strategies to manage the CUPE 1280 Replacement and Overtime costs as detailed in the report – through closing of under-utilized rooms/spaces as well as closing schools in the summer, and through implementation of permit fee changes, as noted in the revised Policy B.R.05.

Further reductions to the custodial staffing budget would impact the level of cleaning in schools, unless there was a corresponding decrease of building area.