



REPORT TO

REGULAR BOARD

PUPIL ACCOMMODATION REVIEW HOLY REDEEMER, OUR LADY OF GUADALUPE AND ST. MATTHIAS – INTERIM REPORT (TRUSTEE WARDS 7, 11)

“Eager to maintain the unity of the Spirit in the bond of peace.”, Ephesians 4:3

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
January 16, 2017	January 26, 2017	
John Volek, Sr. Coordinator, Planning, Assessment, Admissions and Accountability Peter Aguiar, Superintendent of Student Achievement and Well-Being, Area 4 Maia Puccetti, Superintendent of Facilities Mario Silva, Comptroller of Planning and Development Services		
RECOMMENDATION REPORT		

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community uniting home, parish and school and rooted in the love of Christ.

We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.

**R. McGuckin**

Associate Director of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio

Associate Director of Planning and Facilities

C. Jackson

Executive Superintendent of Business Services and Chief Financial Officer

Angela Gauthier

Director of Education

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

At its Corporate Affairs, Strategic Planning and Property Committee meeting held on June 6, 2016, the Board of Trustees approved the initiation of a Pupil Accommodation Review (PAR) for Holy Redeemer, Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias, in accordance with Board Policy *Pupil Accommodation Review S.09 (Appendix 'A')*. The Accommodation Review Committee (ARC) and Board staff presented their recommendations in accordance with the Policy. Both the staff recommendations and the ARC recommendations are presented in this report.

This report recommends that the following be considered for approval at the meeting of the Board of Trustees on February 23, 2017:

1. That Holy Redeemer be consolidated at St. Matthias effective September 5, 2017;
2. That the attendance boundaries of Holy Redeemer and St. Matthias be combined to form the new boundary for St. Matthias (*Appendix 'B'*);
3. That the SAL program currently located at Holy Redeemer is relocated to an appropriate site.
4. That Our Lady of Guadalupe be consolidated at St. Matthias effective September 2020, upon completion of a new school on the St. Matthias site;
5. That, upon consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias, the amalgamated attendance boundaries form the attendance boundary for the new consolidated school (*Appendix 'C'*);
6. That transportation to St. Matthias be reassessed and offered in accordance with Transportation Policy and in coordination with both consolidation timelines;
7. That the Director of Education develop a Transition Plan including timelines to facilitate both consolidation timelines;
8. That a business case be developed for submission to the Ministry of Education, at the next available opportunity of funding, for a 525 pupil place replacement school at St. Matthias;

9. That a name be considered for the new school in accordance with the *School Names* (S.07) policy;
10. That opportunities for enhanced programming such as French Immersion, STEM and enhanced Music at the consolidated school be assessed.

The cumulative staff time dedicated to developing this report was 120 hours.

B. PURPOSE

To provide a staff recommendation on an accommodation solution that provides for an improved educational environment for the students, optimizes the use of classroom space, and identifies potential cost savings.

C. BACKGROUND

1. The initiation of a Pupil Accommodation Review (PAR) for Holy Redeemer, Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias elementary schools was approved by the Board on June 6, 2016.
2. The PAR, undertaken in accordance with Policy (S.09), spanned approximately six months, with two public meetings held on October 18, 2016 and December 14, 2016. Members of the ARC also met on several occasions as a group for further discussion as is required under the policy.
3. Minutes from the public meetings are included in *Appendix 'D'*. All information discussed as part of the PAR process, materials provided to the ARC for consideration, and all notes from public meetings have been made available on the Board's website. Members of the ARC along with staff presented the preferred accommodation option at the final public meeting for this review on December 14, 2016.
4. The recommendations presented in this report are consistent with recommendations contained within the draft Long-Term Accommodation and Program Plan (LTAPP). Overall, the draft LTAPP proposes a reduction in OTG capacity (OTG capacity = "On-the-Ground" capacity) across the TCDSB from a current level of 71,950 elementary pupil places to approximately 69,100 elementary pupil places by the 2029-30 school year, or an overall reduction of 2,867 pupil places of available capacity to achieve a target utilization rate of 95%.

5. By 2018, the Ministry of Education will be eliminating Top-up funding to all Boards in the province, and has already begun reducing Top-up. Top-up funding supported the operation of small schools where low enrolment does not generate sufficient staffing, operations and maintenance grants to cover annual costs to maintain, repair, and renew the school facility. The table below shows the year-over-year reduction in Top-up funding, which equates to a 33% annual reduction. The cumulative loss in funding over 3 years is projected to be in excess of \$5M or approximately 6% of the Operations and Maintenance budget.

Panel	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18
Elementary	3,690,894	2,471,433	1,230,298	No funding
Secondary	1,324,001	849,447	441,334	No funding
	5,014,895	3,320,880	1,671,632	

6. As noted above, facilities with very low enrolment do not generate sufficient per pupil grants to cover operational requirements, and thus operate in a deficit situation. The surplus funding from larger enrolment schools, system-wide, is not sufficient enough to offset funding shortfalls in low enrolment schools, and as a result, the Board continues to operate in a deficit situation. The following table illustrates this situation, utilizing 2015 data (*a more fulsome report on Small Schools is available on the Board's website*):

Enrolment Range	Number of Schools	Average Program / Facilities Cost per pupil	Average Grant per pupil	Average Program/Facilities Cost Surplus/ (Deficit) per pupil
<100	4	15,826	10,600	(5,226)
101-150	8	12,521	9,800	(2,721)
151-200	18	11,005	9,589	(1,416)
201-250	24	9,982	9,181	(801)
251-300	19	9,478	8,776	(701)
>300	95	8,599	8,712	112
Total	168			

7. The Ministry of Education is continuing their School Board Efficiencies and Modernization (SBEM) program, (*details available on the Ministry of*

Education website) by providing incentives and supports for Boards to make more efficient use of school space. The primary funding sources for Capital projects is through the School Consolidation Capital (SCC) program and the Capital Priorities funding process. Through these processes, the Ministry encourages Boards to complete PARs and reduce surplus capacity.

D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS

8. The staff recommended pupil accommodation solution that best addresses the needs of the three schools in this PAR is the consolidation of Holy Redeemer into St. Matthias for the 2017-18 school year and the consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe into St. Matthias scheduled tentatively for the 2020-21 school year—dependent on Ministry of Education approval and funding of a 525 pupil place replacement facility on the St. Matthias site.

9. Program-Related Benefits of 400 to 600 Pupil Place Elementary Schools

There is general agreement and consensus among senior academic staff that elementary schools in the range of 400 to 600 pupil spaces provide the required ‘critical mass’ associated with program-related benefits for students. A number of program-related benefits have been identified with schools of this size. Fully utilized elementary schools of this size lead to increased Ministry per pupil funding which in turn has the potential to generate the following benefits.

School Organization and Program Implications

An increase in the number of staffing allocations has the potential to enhance:

1. Number of choices for student placement (e.g. accommodating sibling needs)
2. Access to more programs and services (e.g. Special Education Needs, French Immersion, Extended French Immersion, ESL, etc.)
3. Number of opportunities for block timetabling (for Literacy and Numeracy)
4. Number of opportunities for co-curricular and extra-curricular activities
5. More opportunities to staff the various school committees and select subject representatives (e.g. Safe Schools Committee, Health Action

Team, Eco School Rep, Religious Ed. Rep, Literacy Rep, Numeracy Rep, CSAC Staff Rep, etc.)

6. More fulsome celebrations of and participation in pivotal, significant school events, such as graduation, sacraments, overnight grade excursions, etc.

School Staffing and Program Implications

An increase in the number of staff allocations has the potential to enhance:

1. The Professional Learning Community (PLC) strategy (e.g. School Improvement Team, Collaborative Inquiry process, etc.)
2. Number of opportunities for team teaching
3. Matching individual subject areas with specialist qualifications
4. Mentoring

Material Resources and Equipment

1. Increased enrolment generates increased funding for the school and in turn has the potential to generate increased material resources and equipment (e.g. sports equipment, library materials, computer equipment, etc.).
2. Cost-savings from fewer school administration and support positions associated with smaller schools would support greater investment in resources and equipment.

Facilities and Program Implications

1. Increased enrolment generates increased funding for the school and has the potential to generate additional classroom space for specialty programs such as FSL, Music, Art, etc.
2. An increase in the facility area has the potential to generate additional programs and services such as Nutritional Programs, Before and After School Programs, Child care, International Language Programs, etc.

CSPC Involvement

Increased enrolment provides a wider parental base and potential for increased parental involvement, the sharing of their talents and expertise and the development of community partnerships—a critical focus of the Ministry of Education.

Further to the advantages identified above, measureable criteria showing the benefits of larger schools could be developed to support or demonstrate this relationship. Examples of potential criteria are identified below.

Combined Grades

While a lower percentage of combined grades is indicative of a larger school, primary class size caps and Collective Agreement caps will determine the necessity of a combined grade.

Support Staff

Schools with higher enrolment will likely be eligible for a greater number of specialty support staff; for example, clerk typists and custodial support. More support from Education Assistants and Child Youth Workers is directly tied to the weighted exceptionalities of students with IEPs.

Librarians/Other Specialty Teachers

Larger schools will likely lead to fewer Library Technicians. There will be an overall net savings in the aggregate for Library staffing.

10. Demographics

Holy Redeemer has a current enrolment of only 68 students, which represents a utilization rate of 32%. In addition, one classroom is dedicated for use by the SAL program. The gross under-subscription problem at Holy Redeemer is forecasted to continue into the future, with no significant growth from new development expected in the area. Our Lady of Guadalupe is at full capacity, however the facility is only built to accommodate approximately 176 students. St. Matthias is slightly larger in capacity at 222 pupil places and is currently operating at approximately 90% utilization. Enrolment at St. Matthias is projected to marginally increase over time, creating the necessity for portable classrooms. The following table articulates historical, current and projected enrolment for the three schools:

Historical	Holy Redeemer			Our Lady of Guadalupe		St. Matthias	
	Year	Pupil Count	Utilization (%)	Pupil Count	Utilization (%)	Pupil Count	Utilization (%)
	2005	110	52%	134	76%	218	100%
	2010	88	42%	126	75%	191	86%
	OTG	210		176		222	
Projected	2017	63	30%	179	102%	196	90%
	2020	69	33%	196	111%	221	101%
	2025	72	34%	206	117%	255	116%

11. To assist the ARC with its discussion on school accommodation solutions, Planning staff submitted the staff-preferred option for consideration as part of the review process and in accordance with *Pupil Accommodation Review Policy (S.09)*. The table below demonstrates the impact on enrolment following the consolidation of first Holy Redeemer (2017) and then Our Lady of Guadalupe (2020) into St. Matthias.

Holy Redeemer	OTG	2016	2020	2025
Pupil Count	210	68		
Utilization (%)		32%		

Our Lady of Guadalupe	OTG	2016	2020	2025
Pupil Count	167	170	196	
Utilization (%)		102%	111%	

St. Matthias	OTG	2016	2020	2025
Pupil Count	222	194		
Utilization (%)		87%		
After HR Consolidation: Pupil Count			290	
After HR Consolidation: Utilization (%)			110%	
After HR/OLG Consolidation: Pupil Count	525			536
After HR/OLG Consolidation: Utilization (%)				102%

12. Site Size and Facilities Cost-Savings

At 4.0 acres in size, the St. Matthias site is sufficient in size to accommodate a 525 pupil place facility. A new right-sized facility would allow for the efficient accommodation of a consolidated student population.

13. All three facilities were constructed in the 1970s. The combined projected 2020 deferred maintenance backlog for Holy Redeemer, Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias is approximately \$7.9M. By shedding these aging facilities the Board could realize this significant one-time cost-savings.

14. A forecasted annual savings of approximately \$310,000 in utilities, maintenance, and other operational savings can be realized through consolidation. Furthermore, Caretaking savings of over \$100K are anticipated following consolidation of these three (3) small schools into one right-sized modern building.

15. Transportation

The consolidation of Holy Redeemer at St. Matthias will not result in additional transportation costs. Consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe into St. Matthias in 2020 may result in the need for one additional bus route in the area. Optimization of routes through adjusted bell times may be necessary to achieve the most efficient and cost-effective transportation solution in the area in accordance with the Transportation Policy.

16. Program and Facilities Funding Shortfall

Comments #5 and #6 above discuss the significant financial pressures placed upon on our Board resulting from the elimination of Top-up funding and continued operation of schools with very low enrolments. Funding shortfalls in Operations, Maintenance (Facilities) and Programming, as reported to the PAR Committee for the three subject schools are identified in the table below.

School	Current Enrol-ment	Program /Facilities Cost per pupil	Grant per pupil	Average Program/Facilities Cost Surplus/ (Deficit) per pupil
Holy Redeemer	68	16,845	9,507	(7,338)
Our Lady of Guadalupe	170	9,215	8,824	(391)
St. Matthias	194	8,329	8,493	165

17. The following analysis highlights a significant potential yearly staff cost-savings generated through the consolidation of Holy Redeemer at St. Matthias for September 2017. This savings is estimated to be approximately \$496,801. An additional savings of approximately \$112,144 could be realized in a Phase 2 consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe students at St. Matthias, pending a Ministry approved replacement facility. It should be noted that the changes in staffing FTE could be realized through overall system attrition and does not necessarily correspond to the specific staff at a school affected by consolidation.

Consolidation of Holy Redeemer at St. Matthias for September of 2017	Staff Category	Change in FTE	Cost Savings \$
	Teacher	-3.8	-380,126.01
	Principal	-1	-131,551.40
	ECE	1	65,000.00
	Secretarial	-1	-50,124.20
	Total	-4.8	-\$496,801.61

Consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe at St. Matthias for September of 2020	Staff Category	Change in FTE	Cost Savings \$
	Teacher	0.8	80,026.53
	Principal	-1	-131,551.40
	ECE	0	0
	Secretarial	-1	-60,620.00
	Total	-3.2	-\$112,144.87

18. Through the SCC funding process, staff will submit a comprehensive business case to the Ministry of Education requesting funding for a replacement school to be built on the St. Matthias site. Projects that reduce excess OTG capacity, reduce operating costs, and address renewal needs are eligible for SCC funding under the Capital Priorities umbrella. The deadline for business case submission to the Ministry of Education is **January 27, 2017**. Projects submitted through this funding stream must have a final Trustee decision on a PAR by **March 24, 2017**.

19. **ARC Comments and Feedback**

The three (3) school committees agreed unanimously to the following:

- Holy Redeemer be closed effective June 30, 2017.
- Holy Redeemer students be directed to St. Matthias effective September 5, 2017.
- Parents from Holy Redeemer be allowed to apply for student admission to Our Lady of Guadalupe – as per the Board's elementary Admissions policy
- That a recommendation be made that existing busing be maintained for Holy Redeemer students, including busing to an external child care.
- That a transition team be assembled once a Board decision is made to consolidate Holy Redeemer at St. Mathias.
- Pending Ministry approval of Capital funding for a replacement school at St. Matthias, that Our Lady of Guadalupe students be consolidated at the new future facility.
- That a new name be considered for a new future school on the St. Matthias site.

20. The ARC wishes that, in addition to child care, programming requirements be taken into consideration during the initial design of a replacement facility, such as French Immersion, STEM and/or Music.
21. Further study of the long-term need and potential uses for Holy Redeemer and Our Lady of Guadalupe will be undertaken, including consideration of Community Hub(s), strategic partnership(s) or disposition. This will be the subject of a future report to Board.
22. The Director of Education will develop a Transition Plan to facilitate a consolidation that is student-friendly and honours the history and traditions of the school communities. Among matters to be considered in the Transition Plan are: timelines and the organization of student transfer, and the relocation of program materials, equipment and school memorabilia to the receiving school. The Transition Plan will be formulated in consultation with affected school communities, including parents/guardians and school staff.
23. In summary, the recommendation to consolidate Holy Redeemer, Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias students at a rebuilt St. Matthias facility will have the following impacts on the overall operation of the Board:
 - A new right-sized facility will lead to increased Ministry per pupil funding, which in turn has the potential to generate more program-related and material/resource-related benefits.
 - Shed three aging, inefficient facilities with a combined projected 2020 deferred maintenance backlog of \$7.9M.
 - Realize yearly staff cost savings of over \$600,000.
 - Realize yearly Caretaking, utilities and maintenance cost savings of over \$400,000.
 - Class sizes will better reflect Ministry of Education targeted averages.

E. ACTION PLAN

24. In accordance with the *Pupil Accommodation Review Policy (S.09)*, the following sequence of Board meetings will be required prior to final approval of recommendations.

January 26, 2017 – INTERIM REPORT
Regular Board

- Interim Report including ARC recommendations is considered.
- Defer any final decisions on pupil accommodation recommendations.

February 1, 2017 – DELEGATIONS

Special Board

- Opportunity for public input through delegations and written submissions in response to the Interim Report.
- Defer any final decisions on school accommodation recommendations.

February 23, 2017 – FINAL REPORT

Regular Board

- Final report from Director of Education is considered, which takes into account the results of public input provided at the previous meeting.
- Board to make final decision on pupil accommodation recommendations.

F. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

That the following recommendations be considered for approval at the meeting of the Board of Trustees on February 23, 2017.

1. That Holy Redeemer be consolidated at St. Matthias effective September 5, 2017;
2. That the attendance boundaries of Holy Redeemer and St. Matthias be combined to form the new boundary for St. Matthias. (*Appendix 'B'*);
3. That the SAL program currently located at Holy Redeemer is relocated to an appropriate site.
4. That Our Lady of Guadalupe be consolidated at St. Matthias effective September 2020, upon completion of a new school on the St. Matthias site;
5. That, upon consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias, the amalgamated attendance boundaries form the attendance boundary for the new consolidated school (*Appendix 'C'*);
6. That transportation to St. Matthias be reassessed and offered in accordance with Transportation Policy and in coordination with both consolidation timelines;

7. That the Director of Education develop a Transition Plan including timelines to facilitate both consolidation timelines;
8. That a business case be developed for submission to the Ministry of Education, at the next available opportunity of funding, for a 525 pupil place replacement school at St. Matthias;
9. That a name be considered for the new school in accordance with the *School Names* (S.07) policy;
10. That opportunities for enhanced programming such as French Immersion, STEM and enhanced Music at the consolidated school be assessed.