



REPORT TO

REGULAR BOARD

FINAL REPORT – PUPIL ACCOMMODATION REVIEW – HOLY REDEEMER, OUR LADY OF GUADALUPE AND ST. MATTHIAS (TRUSTEE WARDS 7 AND 11)

“For God shows no partiality”, Romans 2:11

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
February 13, 2017	February 23, 2017	Click here to enter a date.
J. Volek, Sr. Coordinator, Planning, Assessment, Admissions and Accountability P. Aguiar, Superintendent of Student Achievement and Well-Being, Area 4 M. Puccetti, Superintendent of Facilities M. Silva, Comptroller of Planning and Development Services		
RECOMMENDATION REPORT		

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

*The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community uniting home, parish and school and rooted in the love of Christ.
We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.*



R. McGuckin

Associate Director of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio

Associate Director of Planning and Facilities

C. Jackson

Executive Superintendent of Business Services and Chief Financial Officer

Angela Gauthier

Director of Education

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

At the January 26, 2017 meeting of the Board, the report *‘Pupil Accommodation Review Holy Redeemer, Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias – Interim Report (Trustee Wards 7, 11)’ (Appendix ‘A1’)* was considered and the following approved:

“That the following recommendations be considered for approval at the meeting of the Board of Trustees on February 23, 2017.

- 1. That Holy Redeemer be consolidated at St. Matthias effective September 5, 2017;*
- 2. That the attendance boundaries of Holy Redeemer and St. Matthias be combined to form the new boundary for St. Matthias;*
- 3. That the SAL program currently located at Holy Redeemer be relocated to an appropriate site.*
- 4. That Our Lady of Guadalupe be consolidated at St. Matthias effective September 2020, upon completion of a new school on the St. Matthias site;*
- 5. That, upon consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias, the amalgamated attendance boundaries form the attendance boundary for the new consolidated school;*
- 6. That transportation to St. Matthias be reassessed and offered in accordance with Transportation Policy and in coordination with both consolidation timelines;*
- 7. That the Director of Education develop a Transition Plan including timelines to facilitate both consolidations and consultation with TECT;*
- 8. That a business case be developed for submission to the Ministry of Education, at the next available opportunity of funding, for a 525 pupil place replacement school at St. Matthias;*
- 9. That a name be considered for the new school in accordance with the School Names (S.07) policy;*
- 10. That opportunities for enhanced programming such as French Immersion, STEM and enhanced Music at the consolidated school be assessed.”*

This report considers the recommendations of the Director’s Interim report, the ARC’s recommendations and public input received at the February 1, 2017 Special Board meeting.

The cumulative staff time dedicated to developing this report was 30 hours.

B. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to consider public input and to present final recommendations for consideration and approval regarding the Pupil Accommodation Review (PAR) for Holy Redeemer, Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias. Delegations and written submissions were received at the February 1, 2017 Special Board meeting.

C. BACKGROUND

1. The staff recommended pupil accommodation solution to address the needs of the three schools in this PAR is the consolidation of Holy Redeemer into St. Matthias for the 2017-18 school year and the consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe into St. Matthias scheduled tentatively for the 2020-21 school year—dependent on Ministry of Education approval and funding of a 525 pupil place replacement facility on the St. Matthias site.
2. Overall, there is currently an excess of 11,000 pupil places of surplus capacity in the elementary panel. The Ministry of Education has advised staff that Pupil Accommodation Reviews (PARs) must take place within the next 5 or 6 years, and be fully considered as part of the Board's next Long Term Accommodation and Program Plan (LTAPP). The draft LTAPP calls for a net increase in overall elementary capacity from 85% to approximately 95% by 2029—largely as a result of a series of proposed consolidations.
3. By 2018, the Ministry of Education will be eliminating Top-up funding to all Boards in the province, and has already begun reducing Top-up. Top-up funding supported the operation of small schools where low enrolment does not generate sufficient staffing, operations and maintenance grants to cover annual costs to maintain, repair, and renew the school facility. The table below shows the year-over-year reduction in Top-up funding, which equates to a 33% annual reduction. The cumulative loss in funding over 3 years is projected to be in excess of \$5M or approximately 6% of the Operations and Maintenance budget.

Panel	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18
Elementary	3,690,894	2,471,433	1,230,298	No funding
Secondary	1,324,001	849,447	441,334	No funding
	5,014,895	3,320,880	1,671,632	

4. As noted above, facilities with very low enrolment do not generate sufficient per pupil grants to cover operational requirements, and thus operate in a deficit situation. The surplus funding from larger enrolment schools, system-wide, is not sufficient enough to offset funding shortfalls in low enrolment schools, and as a result, the Board continues to operate in a deficit situation. The following table illustrates this situation, utilizing 2015 data (*a more fulsome report on Small Schools is available on the Board's website*):

Elementary Enrolment	Number of Schools	Average of Grant Per Pupil	Average of Program/Facilities Surplus/Deficit)	Average of Surplus/(Deficit) per pupil
<100	3	9,308	(549,820)	(6,018)
100-150	6	8,828	(464,575)	(4,036)
151-200	21	8,416	(280,489)	(1,700)
201-250	25	8,144	(232,144)	(1,014)
251-300	17	7,997	(131,851)	(482)
301-500	64	7,952	(6,029)	(39)
>500	32	7,881	272,402	404
Grand Total	168			

5. The rationale for staff recommendations for each school community is summarized as follows:
- **Holy Redeemer** – This facility is recommended for closure based on declining enrolment, building size and lack of development growth in the area. Holy Redeemer has a current enrolment of only 68 students, which represents a utilization rate of 32% of the 210 pupil place capacity. The gross under-subscription problem at Holy Redeemer is forecasted to continue into the future, with no significant growth from new development expected in the area. A yearly staff cost-savings can be realized through the consolidation of Holy Redeemer at St. Matthias for September 2017.
 - **Our Lady of Guadalupe** - Our Lady of Guadalupe is at full capacity, however the facility is only built to accommodate approximately 176 students. An additional staff cost-savings could be realized in a Phase

2 consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe students at St. Matthias, pending a Ministry approved replacement facility.

- **St. Matthias** – St. Matthias is slightly larger in capacity at 222 pupil places and is currently operating at approximately 90% utilization. Enrolment at St. Matthias is projected to marginally increase over time, creating the necessity for portable classrooms. At 4.0 acres in size, the St. Matthias site is sufficient in size to accommodate a new 525 pupil place facility which would allow for the efficient accommodation of a consolidated student population.
6. The staff recommendation creates one large well utilized facility. All three facilities were constructed in the 1970s. The combined projected 2020 deferred maintenance backlog for Holy Redeemer, Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias is approximately \$10.1M per the last Ministry inspection of these three facilities. By shedding these aging facilities the Board could realize this significant one-time cost-savings.
 7. The Ministry of Education weighs the cost of funding a new building against the long-term cost of operating, maintaining and renewing the facilities to be consolidated. A 'Net Present Value' calculation is provided in the table below. As shown, the Facilities and Academic Cost avoidance were included. As 'Deferred Maintenance' and the 'Potential Proceeds of Disposition' are also a considerable cost savings, they have been added. **This analysis shows a replacement school at St. Matthias as a good investment for the province.**

St. Matthias/Our Lady of Guadalupe/Holy Redeemer

		NPV	
Facilities Cost Avoidance	\$ 254,526	\$ 4,194,974	
Academic Cost Avoidance	\$ 608,946	\$ 10,036,360	
NPV (25 years)		\$ 14,231,334	
Deferred Maintenance	St. Matthias	\$ 3,726,916	Inspected 2016: draft

	Our Lady of Guadalupe	\$3,043,346	Inspected 2016: draft
	Holy Redeemer	\$ 3,413,629	Inspected 2016: draft
Total DM		\$ 10,183,891	
Potential POD			
Holy Redeemer		\$15,500,000	
Our Lady of Guadalupe		\$11,586,250	
Total POD		\$ 27,086,250	
Grand Total		\$ 51,501,475	
(Cost Avoidance NPV/DM/POD)			
Construction Cost (benchmark)	525 pp	\$ 10,994,165	
Difference		\$40,507,310	

8. Further supporting this recommended consolidation, there is general agreement and consensus among senior academic staff that elementary schools in the range of 400 to 600 pupil spaces provide the required ‘critical mass’ associated with program-related benefits for students. Fully utilized elementary schools of this size lead to increased Ministry per pupil funding which in turn has the potential to generate several benefits some of which are enhanced programming, opportunities for greater parent involvement, opportunities for additional curricular and extra-curricular activities, team teaching and mentoring. Increased enrolment also generates increased funding for facility resources and programs such as Art, Music, French Immersion and Literacy.

School Organization and Program Implications

An increase in the number of staffing allocations has the potential to enhance:

1. Number of choices for student placement (e.g. accommodating sibling needs)

2. Access to more programs and services (e.g. Special Education Needs, French Immersion, Extended French Immersion, ESL, etc.)
3. Number of opportunities for block timetabling (for Literacy and Numeracy)
4. Number of opportunities for co-curricular and extra-curricular activities
5. More opportunities to staff the various school committees and select subject representatives (e.g. Safe Schools Committee, Health Action Team, Eco School Rep, Religious Ed. Rep, Literacy Rep, Numeracy Rep, CSPC Staff Rep, etc.)
6. More fulsome celebrations of and participation in pivotal, significant school events, such as graduation, sacraments, overnight grade excursions, etc.

School Staffing and Program Implications

An increase in the number of staff allocations has the potential to enhance:

1. The Professional Learning Community (PLC) strategy (e.g. School Improvement Team, Collaborative Inquiry process, etc.)
2. Number of opportunities for team teaching
3. Matching individual subject areas with specialist qualifications
4. Mentoring

Material Resources and Equipment

1. Increased enrolment generates increased funding for the school and in turn has the potential to generate increased material resources and equipment (e.g. sports equipment, library materials, computer equipment, etc.).
2. Cost-savings from fewer school administration and support positions associated with smaller schools would support greater investment in resources and equipment.

Facilities and Program Implications

1. Increased enrolment generates increased funding for the school and has the potential to generate additional classroom space for specialty programs such as FSL, Music, Art, etc.
2. An increase in the facility area has the potential to generate additional programs and services such as Nutritional Programs, Before and After School Programs, Child care, International Language Programs, etc.

CSPC Involvement

Increased enrolment provides a wider parental base and potential for increased parental involvement, the sharing of their talents and expertise and the development of community partnerships—a critical focus of the Ministry of Education.

Combined Grades

While a lower percentage of combined grades is indicative of a larger school, primary class size caps and Collective Agreement caps will determine the necessity of a combined grade.

Support Staff

Schools with higher enrolment will likely be eligible for a greater number of specialty support staff; for example, clerk typists and custodial support. More support from Education Assistants and Child Youth Workers is directly tied to the weighted exceptionalities of students with IEPs.

9. The ARC, at the final committee meeting held Nov. 22, 2016 and the final public meeting held December 14, 2016, agreed unanimously with the following recommendations:
 - a. Holy Redeemer be closed effective June 30, 2017.
 - b. Holy Redeemer students be directed to St. Matthias effective September 5, 2017.
 - c. Parents from Holy Redeemer be allowed to apply for student admission to Our Lady of Guadalupe – as per the Board’s elementary Admissions policy
 - d. That a recommendation be made that existing busing be maintained for Holy Redeemer students, including busing to an external child care.
 - e. That a transition team be assembled once a Board decision is made to consolidate Holy Redeemer at St. Mathias.
 - f. Pending Ministry approval of Capital funding for a replacement school at St. Matthias, that Our Lady of Guadalupe students be consolidated at the new future facility.
 - g. That a new name be considered for a new future school on the St. Matthias site
10. The community was given an opportunity to provide their feedback to Trustees at a Special Meeting of the Board on February 1, 2017. Delegations and written submissions from each of the school communities were received at that meeting and concerns raised have been summarized and grouped by

school. Where appropriate, staff have provided explanations or responses to these concerns. The actual submissions are included in *Appendix 'B'*.

D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS

Summary of Delegations and Written Submissions

11. Holy Redeemer -

Summary of Concerns	Staff Comments
The committee members felt that the process was rushed and that alternatives would not be considered.	<i>The timelines within the Pupil Accommodation Review Policy (S.A.09) were followed. Additionally, questions were gathered from committee members and answered by various Board staff at both the committee and public meetings. All information was also posted on the Board webpage.</i>
Opportunity for Holy Redeemer to improve their enrolment by introducing innovative programming and community alliance of programming for better school exposure.	<i>There is limited funding available for additional or specialty programming when enrolment is declining. The Board is in constant contact with community partners regarding opportunities for collaboration.</i>
Holy Redeemer has value to its students and to the Board. The area north of Finch between Leslie and Don Mills will be lost long term. Possible reasons for low enrolment: 1) Lack of EQAO scores publicly available. Need to push to have smaller schools posted. 2) AY Jackson local public school has science and math focus. 3) Cliffwood PS across the road offers French	<i>1) There is no direct correlation between EQAO scores and large and small schools. Overall there are a number of factors more impactful on student achievement on EQAO testing than school size. EQAO results vary from year to year and no assurances can be given that the results for one or all of the schools will not fluctuate. All of the current initiatives in place to support student literacy and numeracy will remain in place. 2) As stated in the ARC comments, the local secondary school is a public school with a science and math focus.</i>

Immersion. YCDSB has built new arts school St. Michael.	<p><i>The demographic of the area is predominantly non catholic.</i></p> <p><i>3) French Immersion programming has been restricted to a few TCDSB sites until recent approval of 6 new sites. Issues with offering French Immersion include finding enough qualified teachers to satisfy program requirements.</i></p> <p><i>TCDSB has an arts focused school at Cardinal Carter.</i></p>
Recommend two schools of 400 pupils each as opposed to one 500 pupil place school.	<i>Combined enrolment of these three schools is not projected to exceed 536 students. Two 400 pupil place schools are not sustainable given current demographic trends.</i>

12. **St. Matthias –**

Summary of Concerns	Staff Comments
Consolidation will cause overcrowding at St. Matthias in the short-term while they await a new school. Portable classrooms may be necessary to accommodate students. Parents have concerns about portables. Will portables have Wi-Fi and A/C? Will they be in good repair and placed by September 2017.	<i>Portables are required to have unit ventilators to bring fresh air throughout the year but they are not all air-conditioned. All portables will have wifi capability.</i>
Feel that Board was not transparent on issue of teaching staff reduction. Both schools want to retain their current staff. Assumed all Holy Redeemer staff would come with students. Issue of teaching staff is absent from report. Cannot support a plan	<p><i>Teacher allocation is governed by the collective agreement rules for their union. Upon consolidation, the staff from both schools will be combined and positions will be assigned based on experience and qualifications as per the agreement.</i></p> <p><i>From comment #17 of the Interim Report:</i></p>

that results in loss of St. Matthias teaching staff.	<p><i>It should be noted that the changes in staffing FTE could be realized through overall system attrition and does not necessarily correspond to the specific staff at a school affected by consolidation.</i></p> <p><i>Staffing impact following consolidation of Holy Redeemer into St. Matthias is as follows:</i></p> <p><i>Teacher -3.8 FTE</i></p> <p><i>Principal -1.0 FTE</i></p> <p><i>ECE 1.0 FTE</i></p> <p><i>Secretarial -1.0 FTE</i></p> <p><i>Total -4.8 reduction in FTE</i></p>
Lack of certainty around funding for new school. Without a new school there will be no new programming. Fear that combined Holy Redeemer and St. Matthias will be left hanging in a less than desirable state.	<p><i>A consolidation of Holy Redeemer students into St. Matthias will generate the need for 2 to 3 portables.</i></p> <p><i>TCDSB staff have submitted a business case to the Ministry of Education requesting capital dollars to construct a new St. Matthias to accommodate a further consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe students. This 2nd phase of consolidation cannot occur unless funding of a new school is approved.</i></p> <p><i>These funds, if approved, will be earmarked specifically for the construction of a new St. Matthias.</i></p>
Concern that the current St. Matthias is not equipped for a 35% increase in students. Are there enough washrooms and can they be updated to accommodate increased use?	<p><i>As per O.B.C. 3.7.4.3. (14) -</i></p> <p><i>The number of water closets required for elementary and secondary schools shall be at least one fixture for each 30 males and one fixture for each 26 females. By this calculation there are 13 fixtures for males and 10 fixtures for females (students only) for an allowable occupancy of 650 students.</i></p>
What special programming can be added now? Without it there will be little draw to maintain the	<p><i>St. Matthias is full to capacity as indicated above. Adding special programing at this time would put additional strain on a</i></p>

level of enrolment that currently exists. Want good programming to keep the Catholic community vibrant. Want Board assurance that special programming can be made available immediately. French Immersion, Math and Technology.	<i>school that is already being predicted to be oversubscribed. However, as per the committees' recommendations, French Immersion and/or STEM/STEAM will be considered for a possible new school.</i>
St. Matthias has made efforts towards an attractive and relevant school environment. Applications for Music Counts grant for instrumental in Gr. 6, Speak Up grant for basketball, parents have raised funds for an additional basketball court. Courts need paving, can that be provided?	<i>No interior work is scheduled as part of the renewal plan for St. Matthias. However Facilities staff will visit the site to investigate the feasibility of providing paving to the play yard for the basketball courts.</i>

13. **Our Lady of Guadalupe –**

- There were no parent delegations from this school community.

14. The Holy Redeemer and St. Matthias communities have requested that the following clarifying statement be included in this report:

- “The Holy Redeemer and St. Matthias ARC members do not support the proposal to close Holy Redeemer and combine the three schools, Holy Redeemer, Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias. However, we acknowledge the financial pressures and challenges faced by the Board have resulted in this recommendation.”

15. St. Matthias parents also request that the following be considered if the Board votes in favour of the staff recommendations:

- Restate the ARC committee findings as noted above in comment #6.
- Any changes in teaching staff at St. Matthias to be proportionate to the increased enrolment from Holy Redeemer.
- Portables with Wifi, air conditioning and in good repair to be delivered to St. Matthias before September 2017.
- Bring St. Matthias facilities into good repair (i.e. washrooms)
- Paving St. Matthias basketball court.

- Implementing special programming at St. Matthias in September 2017 such as replacing current Phys. Ed itinerant teachers with a math and science specialist.
- 16. Staff have submitted a business case to the Ministry of Education for the funding of a replacement school at St. Matthias under the School Consolidation Capital program. Projects that reduce capacity and operating costs, and address renewal needs are eligible for School Consolidation Capital funding. The deadline for submission was January 27, 2017. Should the Board not approve the consolidation of school in this community, the funding request submission will be withdrawn. Projects submitted through this funding stream must have a final Trustee decision on consolidation through the Pupil Accommodation Review process by March 24, 2017 in order to be considered for funding by the Ministry.
- 17. Further study of the long term need and potential uses for the Holy Redeemer and Our Lady of Guadalupe facilities, should a decision be made to close one or both of these schools, will be undertaken including consideration of a community hub, facility partnerships or disposition. Options will be prepared for Board consideration in a future report.
- 18. Subject to Board approval, a transition plan will be developed to facilitate a consolidation that is student friendly and that honours the history and traditions of the school communities. Among matters to be considered in the transition plan are: (1) timelines and the organization of student transfer, and (2) the relocation of program materials, equipment and school memorabilia from the closing school to the receiving school. Parents/guardians and school staff from the affected schools will be involved in the transition planning process.

E. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

That the following recommendations be approved:

1. That Holy Redeemer be consolidated at St. Matthias effective September 5, 2017;
2. That the attendance boundaries of Holy Redeemer and St. Matthias be combined to form the new boundary for St. Matthias;
3. That the SAL program currently located at Holy Redeemer be relocated to an appropriate site.

4. That Our Lady of Guadalupe be consolidated at St. Matthias effective September 2020, upon completion of a new school on the St. Matthias site;
5. That, upon consolidation of Our Lady of Guadalupe and St. Matthias, the amalgamated attendance boundaries form the attendance boundary for the new consolidated school;
6. That transportation to St. Matthias be reassessed and offered in accordance with Transportation Policy and in coordination with both consolidation timelines;
7. That the Director of Education develop a Transition Plan including timelines to facilitate both consolidations and consultation with TECT;
8. That a business case be developed for submission to the Ministry of Education, at the next available opportunity of funding, for a 525 pupil place replacement school at St. Matthias;
9. That a name be considered for the new school in accordance with the School Names (S.07) policy;
10. That opportunities for enhanced programming such as French Immersion, STEM and enhanced Music at the consolidated school be assessed.