



REPORT TO

REGULAR BOARD

FINAL REPORT - PUPIL ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - ST. MICHAEL, ST. PAUL AND OUR LADY OF LOURDES (TRUSTEE WARD 9)

"From him the whole body, joined and held together by every supporting ligament, grows and builds itself up in love, as each part does its work." Ephesians 4:16

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
February 13, 2017	February 23, 2017	Click here to enter a date.
J. Peake, Senior Manager of Planning and Accommodation J. Volek, Sr. Coordinator, Planning, Assessment, Admissions and Accountability J. Shain, Acting Superintendent of Student Achievement and Well-Being, Area 6 M. Puccetti, Superintendent of Facilities M. Silva, Comptroller of Planning and Development Services		
RECOMMENDATION REPORT		

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community uniting home, parish and school and rooted in the love of Christ. We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.



R. McGuckin

Associate Director of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio

Associate Director of Planning and Facilities

C. Jackson

Executive Superintendent of Business Services and Chief Financial Officer

Angela Gauthier

Director of Education

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

At The January 26, 2017 meeting of the Board, the report ‘*Pupil Accommodation Review St. Michael, St. Paul and Our Lady of Lourdes – Interim Report (Trustee Ward 9)*’ (Appendix ‘A1’) was considered and the following approved with an amendment to recommendation #1:

“That the following recommendations be considered for approval at the meeting of the Board of Trustees on February 23, 2017.

- 1. After approval of a business case to the Ministry of Education, requesting a 500 pupil place replacement school on the Duke of York site, St. Michael be consolidated at St. Paul no earlier than September 2017. St. Paul will act as a temporary consolidated school until such time as the students are able to be accommodated at the new school on the Duke of York site.*
- 2. That the attendance boundaries of St. Michael and St. Paul be combined to form the new boundary for St. Paul, with adjustments to create a more appropriate boundary with Our Lady of Lourdes;*
- 3. That, prior to the completion of a replacement school on the Duke of York site, the attendance boundaries for the new replacement school and Our Lady of Lourdes be reassessed;*
- 4. That transportation be reassessed and offered in accordance with the Transportation Policy for both timelines above;*
- 5. That the Director of Education develop a Transition Plan including timelines to facilitate both consolidations above;*
- 6. That a name be considered for the replacement school on the Duke of York site in accordance with the School Names (S.07) policy;*
- 7. That opportunities for enhanced programming such as French Immersion, STEM and enhanced Music at the replacement school be assessed.”*

This report considers the recommendations of the Director’s Interim report, the ARC’s recommendations and public input received at the February 1, 2017 Special Board meeting.

The cumulative staff time dedicated to developing this report was 30 hours.

B. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to consider public input and to present final recommendations for consideration and approval regarding the Pupil

Accommodation Review (PAR) for St. Michael, St. Paul and Our Lady of Lourdes. Delegations and written submissions were received at the February 1, 2017 Special Board meeting.

C. BACKGROUND

1. The staff recommended pupil accommodation solution to address the needs of the schools in this PAR is the consolidation of St. Michael into St. Paul no earlier than September 2017, and the relocation of the consolidated St. Paul at the new school on the Duke of York site, dependent on Ministry of Education approval and funding of a 500 pupil place replacement facility.
2. Overall, there is currently an excess of 11,000 pupil places of surplus capacity in the elementary panel. The Ministry of Education has advised staff that Pupil Accommodation Reviews (PARs) must take place within the next 5 or 6 years, and be fully considered as part of the Board's next Long Term Accommodation and Program Plan (LTAPP). The draft LTAPP calls for a net increase in overall elementary capacity from 85% to approximately 95% by 2029—largely as a result of a series of proposed consolidations.
3. By 2018, the Ministry of Education will be eliminating Top-up funding to all Boards in the province, and has already begun reducing Top-up. Top-up funding supported the operation of small schools where low enrolment does not generate sufficient staffing, operations and maintenance grants to cover annual costs to maintain, repair, and renew the school facility. The table below shows the year-over-year reduction in Top-up funding, which equates to a 33% annual reduction. The cumulative loss in funding over 3 years is projected to be in excess of \$5M or approximately 6% of the Operations and Maintenance budget.

Panel	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18
Elementary	3,690,894	2,471,433	1,230,298	No funding
Secondary	1,324,001	849,447	441,334	No funding
	5,014,895	3,320,880	1,671,632	

4. As noted above, facilities with very low enrolment do not generate sufficient per pupil grants to cover operational requirements, and thus operate in a deficit situation. The surplus funding from larger enrolment schools, system-wide, is not sufficient enough to offset funding shortfalls in low enrolment schools, and as a result, the Board continues to operate in a deficit situation. The

following table illustrates this situation, utilizing 2015 data (*a more fulsome report on Small Schools is available on the Board's website*):

Elementary Enrolment	Number of Schools	Average of Grant Per Pupil	Average of Program/ Facilities Surplus/ Deficit)	Average of Surplus/ (Deficit) per pupil
<100	3	9,308	(549,820)	(6,018)
100-150	6	8,828	(464,575)	(4,036)
151-200	21	8,416	(280,489)	(1,700)
201-250	25	8,144	(232,144)	(1,014)
251-300	17	7,997	(131,851)	(482)
301-500	64	7,952	(6,029)	(39)
>500	32	7,881	272,402	404
Grand Total	168			

5. The rationale for staff recommendations for each school community is summarized as follows:

- **St. Michael** – St. Michael is significantly oversubscribed with an enrolment of 174 students and a utilization rate of 193%. St. Michael's enrolment is projected to steadily increase into the future as a result of residential intensification in the area. St. Michael's resides on a small site of 1.8 acres and a portion of the student population is accommodated in substandard leased space at an adjacent community centre in rooms originally designed as squash courts. The projected 2020 FCI of St. Michael is particularly high at 80.1% and considered prohibitive to repair ('PTR') by Ministry definitions. A yearly staff cost-savings can be realized through the consolidation of St. Michael at St. Paul for September 2017.
- **St. Paul** - St. Paul is significantly undersubscribed with an enrolment of 175 students and a utilization rate of only 39%. St. Paul is projected to remain at this rate of utilization well into the foreseeable future. St. Paul has additional site restrictions as it is located on an historical grave site and significant retrofits of the facility are not possible. The projected 2020 FCI of St. Paul is quite high at 71.6% and considered prohibitive to repair ('PTR') by Ministry definitions. Additional staff cost-savings could be realized by the consolidation of St. Michael and

St. Paul at the Duke of York site, pending a Ministry approved replacement facility.

- **Our Lady of Lourdes** – The consolidation of St. Michael at St. Paul creates an opportunity to create a more appropriate boundary with Our Lady of Lourdes which includes a historical area of students that were not previously included in the fixed attendance boundary for OLOL.

6. The staff recommendation creates one large well-utilized facility at the Duke of York site. St. Michael was constructed in 1980 and is a shared site with the TDSB and the TCHC. The current St. Paul building was constructed in 1959. The combined projected 2020 deferred maintenance backlog for St. Michael and St. Paul is approximately \$8.8M. By shedding these aging facilities the Board could realize this significant one-time cost-savings.
7. The Ministry of Education weighs the cost of funding a new building against the long-term cost of operating, maintaining and renewing the facilities to be consolidated. A 'Net Present Value' calculation is provided in the table below. As shown, the Facilities and Academic Cost avoidance were included. As 'Deferred Maintenance' and the 'Potential Proceeds of Disposition' are also a considerable cost savings, they have been added. **This analysis shows a replacement school at the former Duke of York PS site is a good investment for the province.**

St. Paul/St. Michael		NPV	
Facilities Cost Avoidance	\$ 244,590	\$ 4,031,214	
(op costs/rent/parking fees)			
Academic Cost Avoidance	\$ 270,720	\$ 4,461,883	
NPV (25 years)		\$ 8,493,097	
Deferred Maintenance	St. Paul	\$ 4,179,519	Inspected 2016: draft
	St. Michael	\$ 2,017,928	
Total DM		\$ 6,197,447	
Grand Total		\$ 14,690,544	

(Cost Avoidance/DM)			
Construction Cost		\$ 10,852,060	
Difference		\$ 3,838,484	

8. Further supporting this direction, there is general agreement and consensus among senior academic staff that elementary schools in the range of 400 to 600 pupil spaces provide the required ‘critical mass’ associated with program-related benefits for students. Fully utilized elementary schools of this size lead to increased Ministry per pupil funding which in turn has the potential to generate several benefits some of which are enhanced programming, opportunities for greater parent involvement, opportunities for additional curricular and extra-curricular activities, team teaching and mentoring. Increased enrolment also generates increased funding for facility resources and programs such as Art, Music, French Immersion and Literacy.

School Organization and Program Implications

An increase in the number of staffing allocations has the potential to enhance:

1. Number of choices for student placement (e.g. accommodating sibling needs)
2. Access to more programs and services (e.g. Special Education Needs, French Immersion, Extended French Immersion, ESL, etc.)
3. Number of opportunities for block timetabling (for Literacy and Numeracy)
4. Number of opportunities for co-curricular and extra-curricular activities
5. More opportunities to staff the various school committees and select subject representatives (e.g. Safe Schools Committee, Health Action Team, Eco School Rep, Religious Ed. Rep, Literacy Rep, Numeracy Rep, CSPC Staff Rep, etc.)
6. More fulsome celebrations of and participation in pivotal, significant school events, such as graduation, sacraments, overnight grade excursions, etc.

School Staffing and Program Implications

An increase in the number of staff allocations has the potential to enhance:

1. The Professional Learning Community (PLC) strategy (e.g. School Improvement Team, Collaborative Inquiry process, etc.)
2. Number of opportunities for team teaching
3. Matching individual subject areas with specialist qualifications

4. Mentoring

Material Resources and Equipment

1. Increased enrolment generates increased funding for the school and in turn has the potential to generate increased material resources and equipment (e.g. sports equipment, library materials, computer equipment, etc.).
2. Cost-savings from fewer school administration and support positions associated with smaller schools would support greater investment in resources and equipment.

Facilities and Program Implications

1. Increased enrolment generates increased funding for the school and has the potential to generate additional classroom space for specialty programs such as FSL, Music, Art, etc.
2. An increase in the facility area has the potential to generate additional programs and services such as Nutritional Programs, Before and After School Programs, Child care, International Language Programs, etc.

CSPC Involvement

Increased enrolment provides a wider parental base and potential for increased parental involvement, the sharing of their talents and expertise and the development of community partnerships—a critical focus of the Ministry of Education.

Combined Grades

While a lower percentage of combined grades is indicative of a larger school, primary class size caps and Collective Agreement caps will determine the necessity of a combined grade.

Support Staff

Schools with higher enrolment will likely be eligible for a greater number of specialty support staff; for example, clerk typists and custodial support. More support from Education Assistants and Child Youth Workers is directly tied to the weighted exceptionalities of students with IEPs.

9. At the January 26, 2017 meeting of the Board, the Trustee moved an amendment to make a change in recommendation #1 of the Interim report. The amended recommendation is reflected in this report and reads as follows:

- “After **approval** of a business case to the Ministry of Education, requesting a 500 pupil place replacement school on the Duke of York site, St. Michael be consolidated at St. Paul no earlier than September 2017. St. Paul will act as a temporary consolidated school until such time as the students are able to be accommodated at the new school on the Duke of York site.”
10. The community was given an opportunity to provide their feedback to Trustees at a Special Meeting of the Board on February 1, 2017. Delegations and written submissions from the school communities were received at that meeting and concerns raised have been summarized. The actual submissions are included in *Appendix ‘B’*.
 11. The ARC recommends the following for the consolidation of St. Michael at St. Paul, and then the relocation of the consolidated St. Paul students at the new Duke of York site:

St. Michael consolidated at St. Paul (September 2017)

- A Transition Plan be created to facilitate consolidation.
- Financial support for the transition—for the physical move, school community building events and sports uniforms.
- Transportation to St. Paul be provided in accordance with Policy.
- That busing be guaranteed to and from current child care locations if possible.
- A new name be considered for the school consolidation in accordance with the *School Names (S.07)* Policy.
- St. Michael staff be placed in teaching positions at St. Paul as per the Collective Agreement.
- Evaluation and implementation of playground improvements at St. Paul if permitted.
- To integrate current Math programs.
- Professional Development be available for St. Michael staff members to effectively deliver the Math program offered at St. Paul.

St. Paul relocation at the replacement facility on the Duke of York site

- A Transition Plan be created to facilitate relocation.
- Transportation to new school be provided in accordance with Policy.
- That a new name for the new school be developed in accordance with the *School Names (S.07)* Policy, if it has not occurred.

- That the Board consider implementing French Immersion and/or a Science Technology Engineering Math (STEM) and/or enhanced Music programming.
- Physical Elements of the New School be considered:
 - Indoor Elements - Full stage, Dedicated science lab, Fine arts studio, Dedicated music room, Full double gym (not elementary modified), Gym convertible to archery range, Gymnastics gym, Boxing ring, Wood and metal shop, Ramps instead of stairs, "Third teacher" design ethos, Separate child care entrance, Stroller parking area for child care, Whiteboards, Lots of drinking fountains, Rest / lounge / meditation / prayer spaces.
 - Outdoor Elements - Rooftop or underground parking, Outward-facing design layout, Turf field, Outdoor science space, Running track, Ample outdoor sports space, Outdoor basketball nets, Low rim basketball nets, Outdoor spaces useable in all weather conditions, Garden beds.
 - Technology - Digital media / computer lab, Recording studio, Built-in projectors, Full high speed Wifi inside and outside, Power outlets everywhere.
- Other Programs be considered:
 - Full Service Child Care, Breakfast program.

D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS

12. Summary of Delegations and Written Submissions

Summary of Concerns	Staff Comments
Overcrowding issues, poor building condition, lack of outdoor space and safety issues (with general public in the area) at St. Michael's.	<i>These issues are well documented and provide the rationale for a pupil accommodation review for these schools.</i>
Poor building condition and site restrictions for outdoor play space at St. Paul's.	<i>There is a historical cemetery underneath the property that restricts development of playspace or improvements to the site and building.</i>
That St. Paul act as a temporary consolidated school and does not become the permanent solution, and that the plan for building the new	<i>A business case has been submitted to the Ministry for approval to fund a 500 pupil place replacement school on the Duke of York site.</i>

school on the Duke of York site gets shelved.	
---	--

13. Staff have submitted a business case to the Ministry of Education for the funding of a replacement school at the Duke of York site under the School Consolidation Capital program. Projects that reduce capacity and operating costs, and address renewal needs are eligible for School Consolidation Capital funding. The deadline for submission was January 27, 2017. Should the Board not approve the recommendations in this report, the funding request submission will be withdrawn. Projects submitted through this funding stream must have a final Trustee decision on a Pupil Accommodation Review by March 24, 2017 in order to be considered for funding by the Ministry.
14. Further study of the long-term need and potential uses for the St. Michael and St. Paul facilities, should a decision be made to close one or both of these schools, will be undertaken including consideration of a community hub, facility partnerships or disposition. Options will be prepared for Board consideration in a future report.
15. Subject to Board approval, a transition plan will be developed to facilitate a consolidation that is student friendly and that honours the history and traditions of the school communities. Among matters to be considered in the transition plan are: (1) timelines and the organization of student transfer, and (2) the relocation of program materials, equipment and school memorabilia from the closing school to the receiving school. Parents/guardians and school staff from the affected schools will be involved in the transition planning process.

E. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

That the following recommendations be approved:

1. After approval of a business case to the Ministry of Education, requesting a 500 pupil place replacement school on the Duke of York site, St. Michael be consolidated at St. Paul no earlier than September 2017. St. Paul will act as a temporary consolidated school until such time as the students are able to be accommodated at the new school on the Duke of York site.

2. That the attendance boundaries of St. Michael and St. Paul be combined to form the new boundary for St. Paul, with adjustments to create a more appropriate boundary with Our Lady of Lourdes;
3. That, prior to the completion of a replacement school on the Duke of York site, the attendance boundaries for the new replacement school and Our Lady of Lourdes be reassessed;
4. That transportation be reassessed and offered in accordance with the Transportation Policy for both timelines above;
5. That the Director of Education develop a Transition Plan including timelines to facilitate both consolidations above;
6. That a name be considered for the replacement school on the Duke of York site in accordance with the *School Names (S.07)* policy;
7. That opportunities for enhanced programming such as French Immersion, STEM and enhanced Music at the replacement school be assessed.