



REPORT TO

REGULAR BOARD

ST. BRUNO AND ST. RAYMOND CATHOLIC SCHOOLS CONSOLIDATION CONSULTANT APPOINTMENT AND PROJECT BUDGET APPROVAL (WARD 9)

*"I can do all this through Him who gives me strength."
Philippians 4:13 (NIV)*

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
April 6, 2017	April 19, 2017	

D. Friesen, Senior Coordinator, Capital Development
M. Farrell, Coordinator, Materials Management
P. de Cock, Comptroller, Business Services
J. Wujek, Superintendent of Learning, Student Achievement and Well-Being
M. Puccetti, Superintendent of Facilities Services

RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community uniting home, parish and school and rooted in the love of Christ.

We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.



R. McGuckin

Associate Director of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio

Associate Director of Planning and Facilities

C. Jackson

Executive Superintendent of Business Services and Chief Financial Officer

Angela Gauthier

Director of Education

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report recommends the approval of the Capital project budget for the replacement of St. Raymond Catholic School of \$10,844,447.00, subject to Ministry of Education approval of additional funding for unique site costs and Toronto Green Standards. The replacement school will have an OTG capacity of 350 pupil places and a childcare centre for 49 children.

This report also recommends approval of the appointment of Kohn Shnier Architects to provide consulting services for the new elementary school at the site of St. Raymond Catholic School for a cost of \$747,918.47 including net HST. The consulting services include tendering and contract administration for renovations at St. Bruno Catholic School to accommodate the relocation of St. Raymond students in September 2017, and demolition of the existing St. Raymond Catholic School targeted for the fall of 2017.

Funding is available from the Ministry of Education from the 2016 School Consolidation Capital grant, the Full Day Kindergarten grant, the Child Care Capital grant and the School Renewal Grant (for renovations to St. Bruno to accommodate St. Raymond students in September 2017). In addition, following completion of a preliminary design and cost consultant's estimate, a request will be submitted to the Ministry of Education for Capital Land funding for demolition of the existing St. Raymond school, unique site costs and Toronto Green Standard requirements.

The cumulative staff time dedicated to developing this report was 15 hours.

B. PURPOSE

1. On September 17, 2015, the Board approved in part the following:
That the Director of Education submit a detailed budget for the Board approval for each Capital project prior to tendering.
2. The Board's Purchasing Policy requires that contracts for new schools and major additions be approved by the Board of Trustees.
3. Board approval is required for the consultant appointment and preliminary project budget for the consolidation of St. Raymond and St. Bruno Catholic Schools so that design of the new school and demolition of the existing St. Raymond school can commence.

C. BACKGROUND

1. On May 18, 2016, the Board received approval from the Ministry of Education (EDU) for School Consolidation Capital (SCC) and Full Day Kindergarten (FDK) funding of \$7,937,261 for the construction of a 350 pupil place new elementary school to consolidate the student populations of St. Raymond and St. Bruno Catholic Schools, plus \$1,556,995 for a child care centre to accommodate 49 children, at the current St. Raymond location at 270 Barton Avenue.
2. On March 2, 2017, EDU approved the Space Plan Template for the new 350 pupil place school and 49 space child care at the St. Raymond site.

D. VISION

VISION	PRINCIPLES	GOALS
To maximize capital improvement opportunities and address the long term accommodation needs.	Long Term Accommodation Plan Guiding Principles, Stewardship of Resources, deliver the capital investment which incorporate 21 st Century Learning principles	To address the accommodation of students and staff in a cost effective manner, with the available funding from Ministry grants and other sources.

E. ACTION PLAN

1. A “Stage 1” *Request for Qualifications* was issued on January 26, 2017, to all interested architects in Ontario, through the “Bidding” bidding service, in order to prequalify architects for upcoming Capital projects in four categories as follows:
 - (i) Secondary replacement schools and major additions to \$40M;
 - (ii) Elementary replacement schools and major additions to 16M;
 - (iii) Child care additions to \$5M;
 - (iv) School and child care retrofits to \$2M.
2. Submissions were received from 24 architectural firms for Category 2: *Elementary replacement schools and major additions to 16M*. Following

evaluation by a committee of Board Capital staff, 11 firms were prequalified for this category of projects, based on the following criteria stipulated in the RFQ:

Evaluation Criteria Schedule	Points Available
A) Firm Profile (See 5.1.1) 25 points	
1. Firm stability: Years in business, number of staff	5
2. Overall experience: Appropriate project types and scale	10
3. Qualifications of Key Staff	10
B) Project Experience (See 5.1.7) 35 points	
1. Number of Similar Projects	5
2. Recent Completed Example(s)	5
3. Suitable Project Sizes	5
4. Demonstrated Cost Control	5
5. Demonstrated Energy/Greenhouse Gas Reduction	5
6. Design Quality – Aesthetics and Functionality	5
7. References	5
C) Project Approach (Question Responses - See 5.1.8) 40 points	
1. Design Approach	8
2. Energy/Greenhouse Gas Reduction Approach	8
3. Cost Control Approach	8
4. Municipal Approvals Approach	8
5. Contract Administration/Construction Field Review Approach	8
Total	100

3. “Stage 2” RFP P-028-17 was issued to the 11 firms prequalified for elementary replacement schools for full consulting services for the design and construction of a 350 pupil place new elementary school to consolidate the student populations of St. Raymond and St. Bruno Catholic Schools. The scope of work also includes separate tendering and contract administration for the immediate demolition of the existing St. Raymond Catholic School and minor renovations at St. Bruno Catholic School to be carried out in the summer of 2017 to accommodate the relocation of St. Raymond students.
4. On March 23, 2017, nine (9) proposals were received from prequalified architectural firms in response to RFP P-028-17. A list of the respondents and their sub-consultant teams is included as Appendix A. The proposals

were evaluated by a committee of Board Capital staff according to the following criteria stipulated in the RFP:

<u>Evaluation Criteria</u>	<u>Points Available</u>
A. Score from Stage 1 Prequalification prorated to 25%	25
B. Qualifications of proposed sub-consultant team	15
C. Understanding of Scope of Work - Completeness of Work Plan Deliverables (Appendix C)	20
D. Suitability of Proponent Team's proposed consultant/sub-consultant services and timelines as outlined in the Work Plan (Appendix C)	20
E. Proposed Fixed Fee (Excluding Stipulated Allowances and Separate Price) (Appendix B)	20
Sub-total to Determine Shortlist for Interviews	100
F. Interview & Separate Price (Shortlisted Proponents)	25
Grand Total	125

5. The first part of the evaluation comprised criteria A-E to determine a short list of the highest scoring firms to be further evaluated in an interview. The following five (5) firms were selected to be interviewed:

CS& P Architects
Hossack & Associates Architects
Kohn Shnier Architects
MG Architects
Susan Friedrich Architect

6. Interviews were conducted on April 3 and April 4, 2017 by a panel of four (4) Board staff, including the Superintendent of Facilities Services. The highest scoring firm at the conclusion of the interviews is recommended to be appointed to provide full consulting services for the project including, the demolition of the existing St. Raymond school and renovations to St. Bruno Catholic School to accommodate the temporary relocation of St. Raymond students.

F. METRICS AND ACCOUNTABILITY

1. The preliminary Capital project budget for the consolidation of St. Raymond and St. Bruno Catholic Schools is detailed in Table 1 below:

Table 1 - St. Raymond/St. Bruno Consolidation- Project Budget				All costs include net HST		5-Apr-17
OTG	350	Potential Funding Breakdown				Total Estimated Costs
Benchmark Area per pupil (sq.m.)	11.02	In Benchmark		Not in Benchmark		
Approved GFA of School(sq.m.)	3,848	Capital Priorities/ FDK	Child Care (B11)	Site Prep/ Demolition	Toronto Green Standard/	
GFA of Child Care (sq. m.)	446					
Total GFA including Childcare	4,294					
A. Consulting Fees and Expenses	\$/m2	Note: Renovations to St. Bruno \$11,546 incl net HST from SRG not included				
Total Architectural Services Contract		\$565,619	\$58,256	\$112,497	\$0	\$736,372
Committee of Adjustment					\$5,000	\$5,000
Property/Topo Survey		\$10,000				\$10,000
A. Total Consulting Cost	\$175	\$575,619	\$58,256	\$112,497	\$5,000	\$751,372
B. Other Soft Costs		Note: Renovations to St. Bruno from SRG not included				
Total Estimated Municipal Permits and Fees		\$168,124	\$13,380	\$6,934	\$4,520	\$192,959
Total TCDSB Allowances		\$257,181	\$51,264	\$0	\$0	\$308,444
B. Total Other Soft Costs	\$117	\$425,305	\$64,644	\$6,934	\$4,520	\$501,403
C. Construction Costs	\$/sq.m.	Note: Renovations to St. Bruno from SRG not included				
Subtotal Site Preparation	\$123	\$0	\$0	\$526,240		\$526,240
Basic Expert Panel Building	\$1,861	\$5,786,337	\$1,374,095			\$7,160,432
Estimated 3 Storey Premium:					\$200,000	\$200,000
Estimated TGS Premium:					\$235,000	\$235,000
Subtotal Building	\$1,769	\$5,786,337	\$1,374,095	\$0	\$435,000	\$7,595,432
Subtotal Site Development	\$186	\$790,000	\$0	\$0	\$10,000	\$800,000
C. Total Construction Budget	\$2,124	\$6,576,337	\$1,374,095	\$526,240	\$645,000	\$9,121,672
Contingency Allowance		\$360,000	\$60,000	\$24,000	\$26,000	\$470,000
TOTAL PROJECT COST	\$2,525	\$7,937,261	\$1,556,995	\$669,671	\$680,520	\$10,844,447
APPROVED FUNDING	\$2,211	\$7,937,261	\$1,556,995	TBD	TBD	\$9,494,256
Estimated Funding Deficit (Request for Unique Site Cost Funding)				\$669,671	\$680,520	\$10,844,447

2. The Ministry of Education will provide additional funding for the demolition of the existing school following submission of a detailed estimate of the cost. The Ministry is also expected to provide additional funding for extraordinary site costs such as Toronto Green Standard requirements, City of Toronto storm water management requirements, required municipal services and infrastructure upgrades and excessive grade changes, upon submission of a detailed cost estimate for the project. Based on recent previous projects, additional funded costs are expected to be approximately \$350,000 for demolition and \$800,000 to \$1,000,000 for unique site costs.
3. Following tendering, the project budget will be revised to reflect the actual tender price and a report submitted for Board approval of the tender award and, if required, a revised project budget.
4. The project budget will be monitored through the Board's financial systems and audit processes and financial status will be reported to the Ministry of Education annually through the Capital Asset Project Template (CAPT) system.
5. Renovations to St. Bruno Catholic School to accommodate the temporary relocation of St. Raymond students have been approved in the 2016-2018 School Renewal Plan and are not included in the Capital project budget. The fee for this work included in the architect's contract is \$11,302.00, plus net HST of \$244.12 for a total of \$11,546.12, funded from the School Renewal Grant.

G. IMPLEMENTATION, STRATEGIC COMMUNICATIONS AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN

1. Solid experience within the consultant team in energy efficient design and net zero energy strategies was an important factor in the selection of the recommended team. The Request for Proposal also included an optional fee for additional work toward net zero energy in the event that additional funding is received for this purpose.
2. Staff are in the process of retaining energy-efficient-design research specialist to provide the customized, wide-ranging, independent research required by the TCDSB to assess its current assets and complete a study to provide a report by fall 2017 to define achievable energy conservation and production and greenhouse gas reduction targets and outline recommendations for, and cost implications of, implementation of strategies

to move the Board toward Net Zero Energy. The results of the study will be available to the consultants for the new school on the St. Raymond site in the early stages of design.

3. Following approval of the consultant appointment, a Local Design Committee will be convened to meet with the architect and Board staff to provide input into the design for the new school.
4. Monthly letters are sent to the school principal for distribution to the school community and posted on the Board’s Website during the school year to provide continuous updates on the status of the project.

H. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

1. That the appointment of Kohn Shnier Architects to provide consulting services for the new elementary school at the site of St. Raymond Catholic School be approved in the amount of \$732,105.00, plus net HST of \$15,813.47 for a total cost of \$747,918.47 funded as follows:

	Current EDUApproved Funding	Potential Funding Breakdown Subject to EDU Approval
SCC and FDK Grants	\$659,789.65	\$565,618.97
Child Care Capital Grant	\$76,582.69	\$58,256.31
School Renewal Grant	\$11,546.12	\$11,546.12
Capital Land/Demo Funding		\$112,497.06
Total Consulting Contract	\$747,918.46	\$747,918.46

2. That a preliminary project budget of \$10,844,447.00, including net HST, be approved for new elementary school at the site of St. Raymond Catholic School, as outlined in Table 1 in this report, including demolition of the existing St. Raymond school and excluding renovations to St. Bruno Catholic School to accommodate the temporary relocation of St. Raymond students, approved in the 2016-2018 Renewal Plan.