



REPORT TO

CORPORATE SERVICES, STRATEGIC PLANNING AND PROPERTY COMMITTEE

APPLICATION OF GYM MATRIX CRITERIA (ALL WARDS)

*"I can do all this through Him who gives me strength."
Philippians 4:13 (NIV)*

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
October 31, 2017	November 9, 2017	

F. Cifelli, D. Yack, J. Shanahan, J. Wujek, K. Malcolm, M. Caccamo, P. Aguiar, S. Campbell
Superintendents of Learning, Student Achievement and Well-Being
J. Volek, (Acting) Comptroller of Planning
M. Puccetti, Superintendent of Facilities Services

RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community uniting home, parish and school and rooted in the love of Christ.

We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.



Rory McGuckin
Director of Education

D. Koenig
Associate Director
of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio
Associate Director
of Planning and Facilities

T.B.D.
Executive Superintendent
of Business Services and
Chief Financial Officer

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On June 8, 2017, the Board approved a criteria matrix to prioritize schools system-wide for possible gymnasium additions. In total, ten criteria were to be considered. As noted in previous reports, the majority of Toronto Catholic District School Board gymnasiums are below the Ministry of Education space standard.

The ranking of schools differs from the original ten criteria in two ways; by focusing on schools with smallest combined areas (stage plus gymnasiums or gymnasiums plus exercise room) and by separating elementary and secondary school rankings.

Appendix A-1 provides system-wide ranking of the top twenty (20) elementary schools, where the combined area of the stage plus gymnasium is 3,000 square feet (sq. ft.) or less, with high scores in the other approved criteria including – facility condition index (FCI), Long Term Accommodation Plan (LTAP), exterior play area, current and future utilization rates, availability of alternative physical activity space, building footprint to site size, as well as barrier-free access.

The top ten (10) ranked secondary schools, with the smallest combined area of gymnasiums and exercise room, are listed in Appendix A-2.

Appendix B provides a list of the top three (3) elementary schools as well as the top secondary school per Trustee Ward. At this time, none of the schools received points for external funding towards a gymnasium expansion.

The cumulative staff time dedicated to developing this report was 45 hours.

B. PURPOSE

Following approval of the Criteria Matrix and the evaluation points per criteria, staff were directed to provide a follow up report ranking the top schools system-wide and the top three schools per Trustee Ward. In addition, Staff were directed to seek clarification from the Ministry of Education, regarding availability of funding for program upgrades, including gymnasium expansions/additions.

C. BACKGROUND

1. On June 8, 2017, the Board approved a criteria matrix to prioritize schools system-wide for possible gymnasium additions. The approved evaluation matrix is as follows:

	Criteria	Points
	Combined stage & gymnasium s.f. area as compared to EDU Space Benchmark based on OTG	Yes/No
1	External funding opportunities to fully or partially fund gymnasium addition (minimum 50%)	30
2	Combined stage & gymnasium s.f. area/by OTG	10
3	Facility Condition Index of School (FCI)	10
4	LTAP recommends a major addition or replacement school	10
5	Space deficiency of exterior play space based on 175 s.f./pupil	5
6	Current school utilization rate	4
7	School utilization rate by 2026	4
8	Access to other play or physical activity space in building	3
9	Barrier-free access to existing gymnasium, from within the building and from the site/exterior.	3
10	Site Size	2

2. Current Ministry of Education space standard for new elementary school gymnasium and stage area combined is 0.929 m²/pupil (10 s.f./pupil). The current EDU space standard for a gymnasium and exercise room is 1.12 m²/pupil (12 s.f./pupil). The Ministry of Education's minimum size for an elementary school gymnasium and stage is 3,000 sq. ft. For secondary schools, the minimum gymnasium and exercise room area is 7,000 sq. ft.
3. The criteria matrix was applied to all schools – however, elementary schools with combined area for stage + gymnasium that is equal or below 3,000 sq. ft. received the highest score under Criteria # 2. Similarly, secondary schools with combined gymnasiums and exercise room area, 7,000 sq. ft. or less also receive the highest score under Criteria # 2.

4. Previous reports have provided information to the Board that 171 schools, approximately 86% of the Board's existing schools, do not meet current Ministry of Education (EDU) space standards for gymnasiums based on OTG.
5. The development of a criteria matrix is necessary to evaluate and prioritize schools for possible future gymnasium expansions.
6. The estimated cost to build a new gymnasium addition for an elementary school is \$2.0 M to \$3.0 M and \$3.0 M to \$4.5 M for a secondary school, depending on various factors such as site size and site conditions.
7. Since 2010, the Board's Capital Program has resulted in six (6) new elementary schools with gymnasiums in the range of 4,000 square ft., including the stage area. Currently there are eight (8) new elementary and three (3) new secondary schools either in construction or in design development. These new schools will have larger gymnasiums as permitted under the current EDU space plan template. In addition, there are two (2) elementary school additions completed and two (2) others that are in construction, which include new, larger gymnasiums. By 2020, upon completion of the current Capital program, notwithstanding any additional capital projects approved in 2018, there will be a total of twenty-one (21) new schools with larger gymnasiums.
8. Currently, boards must request approval from the Ministry of Education for any capital projects, and for the use of Proceeds of Disposition (POD) funds to expand an existing school or to add a new gymnasium. Boards may submit a business case to the EDU, requesting an exemption to O. Reg.193/10 in order to use POD funds in support of a Capital initiative.
9. Other program space and equipment-related deficiencies may also impact program delivery in particular at the secondary school level such as science rooms, technology spaces such as automotive or construction shops, and hospitality programs. A more detailed survey of existing facilities and program needs is underway as part of the Board's Long Term Program Plan.

D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS

1. Given the extent of schools that have under-sized gymnasiums, this report recommends focusing on the smallest gymnasiums, under 3,000 sq. ft. in the elementary panel (combined stage and gymnasium) and under 7,000 sq. ft. in the secondary panel (combined area of exercise room and gymnasium).

2. There are a total of 107 elementary schools with combined stage + gymnasiums area under 3,000 sq. ft. There are 17 secondary schools with combined gymnasium and exercise room area under 7,000 sq. ft.
3. **Appendix A-1** lists the top twenty (20) ranked schools, with combined space under 3,000 sq. ft. **Appendix A-2** lists the top ten (10) ranking secondary schools, with combined space under 7,000 sq. ft. The average square footage per pupil in relation to the OTG capacity of the school for the top 20 elementary schools is 5.1 ft²/pupil place. These are all far below the Ministry standard of 10 ft²/pupil place of available gym space.
4. A gymnasium of 4,000 sq. ft. can be divided and used by two classes at the same time. The impact of a small gymnasium on a 400+ pupil place school is significant, limiting the amount of physical education (P.E.) classes available to students. In the case of one elementary school, which has 670 students with a 2,000 sq. ft. gymnasium, most students only have access to the gymnasium once a week for P.E. classes. Kindergartens, who are to have P.E. four times/week, sometimes do not have access to the gym at all during the week (there are 5 kindergarten classes in this school). In order to compensate, whenever possible kindergarten P.E. classes have been taking place during the staggered lunch hour for approximately 15 minutes only in the gym. The remainder of the school's P.E. activities are conducted outdoors or in the hallway if the weather is not favourable.
5. St. Joseph Morrow Park and Dante Alighieri Secondary School are approved for replacement buildings and therefore not considered at this time within the evaluation matrix for secondary schools.
6. **Appendix B** provides the top three (3) ranking elementary schools and top secondary school per Trustee Ward.
7. None of the schools have received points for external funding of a new gymnasium. In the event of a school receiving external funding, this would give the school the highest score/ranking.
8. Minister of Education staff have provided clarification that Boards may request Ministry of Education approval to use Proceeds of Disposition (POD) funding, on a case-by-case basis, to undertake gymnasium expansions, and other program-related facility improvements at schools. The Ministry would consider the Board's deferred maintenance backlog needs as POD is intended for school renewal.

E. METRICS AND ACCOUNTABILITY

1. The Ministry of Education reviews and approves the number and area of spaces/rooms for every new capital project, (new school and major addition), including the gymnasium, to ensure the size/area meets the minimal requirements as set out in the Space Plan Template.
2. The gymnasium square foot area for a new school or addition may be increased by approximately 10% to 15% subject to Ministry of Education approval, provided that the overall building area remains within the EDU approved area benchmark. This information is provided to the local design committee, during the design development stage of the new building/addition.
3. The estimated project budgets for all new capital projects are submitted to the Board for approval. In addition, as per the Purchasing Policy, the Board also approves the award of the contracts associated with any capital projects.

F. IMPLEMENTATION, STRATEGIC COMMUNICATIONS AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN

1. Requests for capital priorities funding will continue to highlight the challenges of program-related space deficiencies with older, smaller schools, in particular, the need for larger gymnasiums for any new school or major addition project. Boards may apply to the Ministry for Capital Priorities funding once a year to build new or replacement schools, as well as apply for funding for a major addition.
2. An information letter will be provided to the principals, in the schools that have been identified as having under-sized combined gymnasium spaces, for purposes of sharing with their school community. The letter will include a link to the various gymnasium reports presented to Board since 2016 as well as a Board staff contact email address in the event there are any questions regarding the letter. The local Trustee and Area Superintendent will be copied in any email responses.
3. A subsequent report to Board will be provided regarding the Ministry of Education's response regarding funding for future gymnasium and other program-related upgrades. At that time, subject to funding, the Board would be in a position to proceed with a capital program to build gymnasium additions at the top ranked schools.

G. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

1. That the top-ranked schools as detailed in Appendix A-1 and A-2, be approved and prioritized for future phased gymnasium expansion program, subject to available funding.
2. That the Chair of the Board send a letter to the Minister of Education seeking funding for a multi-year phased program of gymnasium additions, and other program-related facilities improvements.