



REPORT TO

CORPORATE SERVICES, STRATEGIC PLANNING AND PROPERTY COMMITTEE

ST MARGARET ACCOMMODATION OPTIONS TRUSTEE WARD 5

*In their hearts humans plan their course, but the Lord establishes their steps.
Proverbs 16:9 / NIV*

Created, Draft	First Tabling	Review
October 24, 2017	November 9, 2017	Click here to enter a date.

J. Volek, Acting Comptroller, Planning and Development Services

P. Aguiar, Superintendent of Schools – Area 4

M. Caccamo, Superintendent of Schools – Area 3

RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Vision:

At Toronto Catholic we transform the world through witness, faith, innovation and action.

Mission:

The Toronto Catholic District School Board is an inclusive learning community uniting home, parish and school and rooted in the love of Christ.

We educate students to grow in grace and knowledge to lead lives of faith, hope and charity.



Rory McGuckin
Director of Education

D. Koenig
Associate Director
of Academic Affairs

A. Sangiorgio
Associate Director
of Planning and Facilities

T.B.D.
Executive Superintendent
of Business Services and
Chief Financial Officer

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Board is EDC eligible to acquire two elementary school sites in Planning review area CE08; one of 6.96 acres and a second of 5.05 acres. This review area encompasses the Toronto District School Board's Baycrest Public School site. The Board is intent on leveraging its ability to acquire both the Baycrest site and/or another site in the review area to address significant enrolment pressures and accommodate future elementary student growth stemming from current and future development in the Lawrence-Allen area. Two (2) schools are impacted by this growth and are the subject of this report: St. Margaret and Our Lady of the Assumption.

After careful consideration of all accommodation options, and taking into consideration input received from both parent communities, staff recommend retaining St. Margaret's existing 85 Carmichael Avenue location to accommodate over 300 students who reside east of Bathurst Street and north of highway #401, and to construct a new 500 pupil place facility at the former Baycrest PS site to accommodate nearly 500 St. Margaret and Our Lady of the Assumption students who reside on the west side of Bathurst Street and North of Lawrence Avenue. In order to balance the student population, a formal boundary review will be required.

Furthermore, staff will seek Ministry of Education approval and funding to implement the recommended accommodation solution.

The cumulative staff time dedicated to developing this report was 31 hours.

B. PURPOSE

This report explores options to accommodate significant over-enrolment associated with students who attend St. Margaret and Our Lady of the Assumption.

C. BACKGROUND

1. The Board had declared an interest in acquiring Bannockburn Public School from the TDSB, and submitted multiple offers to purchase the entire site. Bannockburn Public School is located on the east side of Avenue Road on Bannockburn Road. Unfortunately, the TCDSB was informed that Bannockburn is no longer surplus to the needs of the TDSB and therefore cannot be purchased.

2. St. Margaret, main campus located at 85 Carmichael Avenue, has a current enrolment of approximately 658 students and a Ministry rated capacity of 355 pupil places. This would normally represent a facility utilization rate of 185% if all students were located at this site, however 288 grade 5 to 8 students are being temporarily accommodated at Sir Sandford Fleming, a facility leased from the TDSB. By 2019, St. Margaret is projected to have 719 total students, further exacerbating the oversubscription problem.

There are currently two (2) portables in use at the 2.05 acre Carmichael Avenue campus.

3. As indicated in the Board's recently approved Long-Term Accommodation Plan (LTAP), the Board seeks a permanent long-term solution for St. Margaret and Our Lady of the Assumption, and have explored all options.
4. The Ministry of Education has already approved the use of Proceeds of Disposition Reserves (POD) for the construction of a 642 pupil place replacement St. Margaret facility.
5. At the April 19th, 2017, Regular meeting of the Toronto District School Board, Baycrest Public School was recommended to be declared surplus to the needs of the TDSB:

"That the Baycrest Public School property located at 145 Baycrest Avenue be declared surplus to the needs of the Toronto District School Board and referred to the Toronto Lands Corporation for sale effective 30 June 2018."

6. On August 25th, 2017, staff received a formal circulation (*Appendix 'A'*) from the Toronto Lands Corporation (TLC) identifying Baycrest Public School as not required for the purposes of the TDSB:

"RE: Baycrest Public School, 145 Baycrest Avenue
Toronto District School Board ("TDSB"), at its meeting on April 19, 2017 adopted a resolution pursuant to Section 194 (3) (a) of the Education Act declaring that the above-noted property is not required for the purposes of the TDSB. This surplus property has been referred to Toronto Lands Corporation ("TLC") for sale."

7. Regulation 444/98 provides an opportunity for priority ranked bodies to acquire school properties at fair market value. The initial expiry date for submission of interest of Baycrest Public School is November 23rd, 2017. The TCDSB submitted

an Expression of Interest on September 15th, 2017, and will be submitting an Offer to Purchase this property.

It should be noted that the French Public Board (CSV) is the first priority ranked agency under the Regulation. On October 16th, 2017 confirmation was received from CSV that they would not declare an interest in the Baycrest site.

8. Baycrest Public School is located near the southeast corner of Allen Road and Highway 401, sits on 5.39 acres of land, and could serve as an ideal location for a future school accommodating a sizeable portion of St. Margaret and Our Lady of the Assumption students. Refer to the map of student distribution patterns in *Appendix 'B'*.
9. A recent assessment of the existing Baycrest facility has revealed that the facility is in a very poor state of repair. A new facility would therefore be required on the Baycrest site.

D. EVIDENCE/RESEARCH/ANALYSIS

1. The Board is EDC eligible to acquire two elementary school sites in Planning review area CE08; one of 6.96 acres and a second of 5.05 acres. This review area encompasses the Baycrest site. The Board is intent on leveraging its ability to acquire both the Baycrest site and/or another site in the review area to address significant enrolment pressures and accommodate future elementary student growth stemming from development in the Lawrence-Allen area—in newly constructed, right-sized facilities on appropriately sized lands.
2. The following table provides Board-approved 3-year projected enrolment for St. Margaret.

School Name	OTG Capacity	Sept. 17, 2017 Enrolment	2017-20 Projections			
			2017	2018	2019	2020
St. Margaret	355	658	689	717	719	726
% Utilization			194%	202%	203%	205%

3. The construction of a 642 pupil place facility at the Baycrest site could serve to accommodate the majority of current St. Margaret students. However, an analysis of distribution patterns for students of St. Margaret reveal that approximately 315 St. Margaret students reside in closer geographic proximity to the Baycrest site,

while approximately 343 St. Margaret students reside in closer geographic proximity to the existing 85 Carmichael Avenue campus. Furthermore, approximately 164 Our Lady of the Assumption students reside in closer geographic proximity to the Baycrest site—in an area bounded by **Lawrence Avenue, Allen Road, Highway 401 and Bathurst Street** (refer to map in *Appendix ‘B’*)

4. Further to this point, Our Lady of the Assumption is currently over-enrolled with an enrolment of 385 students (as of September 17th, 2017) and a facility capacity of only 225 pupil places. By 2020, enrolment is forecasted to grow to 434 students, which represents a utilization rate of 193%. The option to accommodate some of the Our Lady of the Assumption student population at a future elementary school at a Baycrest location could relieve over-enrolment at the Our Lady of the Assumption facility and gradually reduce the number of portables.

Number of St. Margaret and Our Lady of the Assumption Students Closer to the Baycrest Site	Number of St. Margaret Students Closer to their 85 Carmichael Avenue Campus
315 + 164 = 479	343
812	

5. In order to implement a scenario involving the redirection of St. Margaret’s student population, as well as accommodating a sizeable portion of the Our Lady of the Assumption student community to relieve over-enrolment, a formal boundary review would be required in accordance with the Board’s approved boundary review policy (SA.03).
6. Taking into consideration the distribution and location of St. Margaret students relative to the Baycrest site and Our Lady of the Assumption enrolment in the bounding area described above (in bold), a 500 pupil place replacement facility at Baycrest would be required—designed to be expanded in the future if growth exceeds forecasts. The remaining 343 St. Margaret students, as noted in the table above, can be accommodated at the 85 Carmichael Avenue campus with upgrades to accommodate FDK and a childcare.
7. Significant forecasted growth in the greater Lawrence-Allen community necessitates the need for the Board to retain an elementary site (west side of Allen Road, north of Lawrence Ave) as designated in the City’s Lawrence-Allen secondary plan. The designated elementary site is part of “Phase 3” of the revitalization initiative with a projected build-out date of 15-20 years.

Furthermore, Our Lady of the Assumption is situated in this strategic growth area and will also serve an important role in accommodating their future enrolment.

8. In summary, the 5.39 acre Baycrest Public School site provides an optimum location to rebuild a facility to serve current and future St. Margaret students and a significant number of Our Lady of the Assumption students currently accommodated in portables. The 85 Carmichael Avenue site/school, with a Ministry rated capacity of 355 students, could continue to serve approximately 343 St. Margaret students living closer to this school. Ministry funding for childcare at both locations have been requested by the Board and an additional retrofit of existing space is required.

9. **Optimum School Size**

An elementary school in the range of 400 to 600 pupil places provides the ‘critical mass’ associated with a number of program-related and material resource related benefits. A 500 pupil place replacement facility at the Baycrest Public School site falls within that optimum size range.

10. **Building Limitations and FCI**

The St. Margaret facility was built in 1952 with a small addition in 1966. The Our Lady of the Assumption facility was built in 1956. Given the advanced age of both facilities, they lack the specialty support spaces and modern amenities found in newer TCDSB elementary schools. Furthermore, the projected 2020 Facility Condition Index (FCI) for St. Margaret is 60%, while the projected 2020 FCI for Our Lady of the Assumption is 51%. St. Margaret, in particular, is approaching the prohibitive to repair (“PTR”) threshold of 65%. Some of these deficiencies can be addressed with existing Renewal Grants available to the Board, including upgrades for FDK program purposes. If the Ministry provides additional funding to address the undersized gym, accessibility needs can be addressed at the same time.

11. **St. Margaret Community Survey and Results**

On Monday, June 26th, 2017 an online survey, along with a paper survey, was distributed to the St. Margaret parent community. The results were collected on July 6th, 2017. A total of 93 responses were received—88 paper survey responses and 5 online survey responses.

The parents were asked to respond with their preference on the future accommodation of St. Margaret students. Three (3) options were provided to

choose from. The Options, as provided to the parents via the survey, are listed verbatim below:

Option 1

“Build a new school for 642 students at 146 Baycrest Avenue (the present location of Baycrest Public School) on 5.4 acres of land and close the existing St. Margaret building on Carmichael. (New school completion by September 2020 or 2021).”

Option 2

“Build a new school and child care centre at the Baycrest Public School for 450 students on 5.4 acres. New school completion by September 2020 or 2021.

Keep the existing school open at Carmichael with some basic renovations during summer, including upgrades for full day kindergarten classes on two acres.

Please note this option requires boundary changes and places existing and future students at two schools.

Renovation completion: September 2018 or 2019.”

Option 3

“Build a new school and child care centre for 450 students at Baycrest Public School on 5.4 acres of land. New school completion by September 2020 or 2021.

Keep the existing St. Margaret Catholic School open, with new addition and renovation to serve Full Day Kindergarten, child care facilities and a new gymnasium with a stage.

*Renovation of gym and kindergarten completion in September 2019.
Day Care completion in June 2020.*

Please note this option requires boundary changes and places existing students on two sites.

This option will require additional funding from the Ministry of Education.”

12. Results of the St. Margaret Accommodation Survey

Option Category	# of Responses	% of Responses	
Option 1	44	47%	53%
Option 2	24	26%	
Option 3	25	27%	
Total:	93	100%	

The survey results indicate that approximately half of the parent community polled (47%) favour a one (1) facility option, whereby all students would be relocated to a 642 pupil place school built at 146 Baycrest Avenue (“Option 1”).

The other half of the parent community polled (53%) favour a two (2) facility option, east and west of Bathurst Street, whereby students would be disbursed between a smaller 500 pupil place school built at 146 Baycrest Avenue and the existing St. Margaret school located 85 Carmichael Avenue (“Options 2” and “Option 3”). This approach would require a boundary review to define the logical boundaries that would serve the community.

Note: The main differences between Options 2 and 3 are that Option 3 calls for a small addition, in addition to a renovation to serve Full Day Kindergarten, and a new gymnasium—pending Ministry of Education funding. Staff therefore consider these as two (2) variants of the same two (2) facility option.

All options assume child care facilities are provided for each of the options.

13. Our Lady of the Assumption Community Meeting

On Thursday, September 28th, 2017 staff met with representatives and parents of the Our Lady of the Assumption community to share possible options to relieve significant overcrowding at the school and reduce the number of portables. The overriding sentiment at that meeting was the communities’ desire for all students to remain at Our Lady of the Assumption and for staff to look at other Capital solutions to expand the existing Our Lady of the Assumption facility—to accommodate current and projected enrolment. Furthermore, the community wants to ensure that all existing Our Lady of the Assumption students, and their siblings, have the option of graduating from their school if a decision is made to split the population between the existing school and a future Baycrest school.

14. **Cost/Benefit Capital Analysis—St. Margaret Accommodation Options**

Option Category	Description	Total
Option 1	642pp facility at Baycrest	\$16,007,685
Option 2	2 Schools: 500pp facility at Baycrest Retrofit of St. Margaret	\$17,221,915
Option 3	2 schools: 500pp facility at Baycrest Retrofit of St. Margaret + gym + child care	\$20,393,286

Detailed construction costs are included as *Appendix 'C'*

15. **Operations and Utilities Costs Associated with the Three (3) Options:**

Option Category	Operations Costs	Utilities Costs	Total
St. Margaret Status Quo (including Sir Sanford Fleming)	\$172,216	\$226,755	\$398,971
Our Lady of the Assumption Status Quo	\$145,341	\$49,262	\$194,603
Option 1	\$281,086	\$124,473	\$405,559
Option 2	\$423,844	\$154,220	\$578,064
Option 3	\$425,259	\$196,078	\$621,337

16. **Incremental Staff Costs Associated with the Two Main Options 1 vs. Options 2/3**

Option 1	Staff Category	Change in FTE	Estimated Cost
	Teacher	1.1	\$110,036.48
	Principal/VP	0	0
	School Support Staff	0	0
	Total	1.1	\$110,036.48

Options 2/3	Staff Category	Change in FTE	Estimated Cost
	Teacher	1.2	\$120,039.79
	Principal/VP	+1/-1	* \$13,752
	School Support Staff	0	0
	Total	1.2	\$133,791.79

*Represents the difference between a Principal and a Vice Principal average salary.

17. In summary, all options identified in this report exceed the original Ministry approved amount (from 2011) to be funded from Proceeds of Distribution reserves for the St. Margaret project. This is consistent with the Board's experience with other Capital projects which exceed Ministry cost benchmarks—Board staff have been able to secure additional Ministry funding support for other Capital projects that recognize the incremental costs of building in the City of Toronto.
18. Renewal work at St. Margaret will proceed as planned while staff pursue Ministry funding for a child care retrofit and new gymnasium at St. Margaret.
19. It has been past practice of the Board to grandfather existing students and their siblings. The decision of grandfathering will be based on parent input as part of the boundary review process.

D. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

1. That, subject to Ministry of Education approval, the Board construct a new 500 pupil place school on the Baycrest site.
2. That the Ministry of Education be requested to approve and fund "Option 3".
3. In the event that the Ministry of Education does not approve funding for a new gymnasium at the 85 Carmichael location that the Board proceed with "Option 2".
4. That, subject to the implementation of a two (2) school option, east and west of Bathurst Street, a boundary review involving St. Margaret and Our Lady of the Assumption be initiated.